

TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES Tuesday, January 22, 2019, 4:30 P.M. City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street 10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Commissioner Schoell called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:33 P.M.

Members Present

David Schoell, Chair Joy Jones Ted Reeds Chris Bumgarner Holly Becker* Susan McKee* Katelyn Parker Mary Lee Townsend

Members Absent

Peter Grant, Vice-Chair Robert Shears Jim Turner

*Late Arrival

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Audrey Blank, Amber Wagoner

 Approval of Minutes – Regular Meeting, December 13, 2018 Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, December 13, 2018

| <u>In Favor</u> | Opposed | <u>Abstaining</u> | Not Present |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|-------------|
| 1. Schoell | | | Grant |
| 2. Jones | | | Shears |
| 3. Reeds | | | Turner |
| 4. Bumgarner | | | Becker |
| 5. Parker | | | |
| 6. Townsend | | | |

- 3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.
- B. Actionable Items
 - 1. HP-0015-2018 / 740 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights) Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 15, 2019 Applicant: Charney Properties Proposal: 1. Replacement of windows

Staff presented its report and presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the application was well received and that additional documentation of measurements was requested from the applicant. Commissioner Schoell requested confirmation that the windows would be historically accurate to the neighborhood. The applicant confirmed that the windows, which are being produced by Wood Window Rescue, were based off existing historic windows. Commissioner Parker requested clarification on which windows were being replaced. The applicant commented that all windows were to be replaced. Staff clarified that the replacement of three (3) windows, as stated in the staff report, was due to an error in transcribing the application. Commissioner Schoell requested confirmation of which windows would be fixed. The applicant stated that the only fixed window was a large window located on the front porch and that all other windows would be double huna.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Parker made a motion to approve the application based on section A.4.5 of the Unified Design Guidelines, with the condition that the number of windows being replaced be changed to all windows instead of three (3). The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Vote: 740 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)

| In Favor | <u>Opposed</u> | Abstaining | Not Present |
|---|-----------------|------------------|----------------------|
| 1. Schoell | | | Grant |
| 2. Jones | | | Shears |
| 3. Reeds | | | Turner |
| 4. Bumgarner | | | Becker |
| 5. Parker | | | |
| 6. Townsend | | | |
| 7. McKee | | | |
| | | | |
| HP-0057-2019 / 1131 E. 20 th St. (North Maple Ridge) Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: January 15, | | | |
| HISTORIC Preserva | ation Permit Si | ubcommittee Revi | ew Date: January 15, |

2. Applicant: David Z. Carman

Proposal:

1. Construction of pool in street yard

Staff presented its report and presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that there was hardly any discussion except for the materials. Commissioner Schoell requested clarification of the

2019

concrete finish on the deck surrounding the pool. The applicant stated that the material was salted concrete and is the same material which was previously approved (HP-17-065). Commissioner Bumgarner requested clarification on how far the pool encroaches into the street yard. Staff commented that the pool encroaches only slightly and that the majority of what is in the street yard is the deck.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Bumgarner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Vote: 1131 E. 20th St. (North Maple Ridge)

| <u>In Favor</u> | Opposed | <u>Abstaining</u> | Not Present |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|-------------|
| 1. Schoell | | | Grant |
| 2. Jones | | | Shears |
| 3. Reeds | | | Turner |
| 4. Bumgarner | | | Becker |
| 5. Parker | | | |
| 6. Townsend | | | |
| 7. McKee | | | |
| | | | |

3. HP-0059-2019 / 2120 E. 19th St. (Yorktown)

Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Date: November 1, 2018 Applicant: Karen K. Freudenrich Proposal:

1. Installation of rail on porch

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant's request to remove non-historic materials was approved by staff. Staff presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the subcommittee focused on the design of the railing and requested additional dimensions. Staff clarified that there were different dimensions between the documentation provided by the applicant and reference documentation provided to the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee by Commissioner Schoell. The applicant commented that they want to take out nonhistoric glass panels and add wood railing and tapered columns, which are consistent with historic properties in the neighborhood. The applicant reported that their exploration of the columns found that there was just a steel pole underneath existing material. Commissioner Parker requested clarification that columns would be rebuilt, which the applicant confirmed. Commissioner Parker requested the height of the brick pier. The applicant stated five (5) feet. Commissioner Reeds commented that the brick portion of columns looked shorter in the picture provided. Commissioner Parker requested clarification that the height of the post depicted in the applicant's dimensions was thirty-six (36) inches to the rail or to the top of the post. The applicant stated that it was 36" to the top of the post. Commissioner McKee inquired if support blocks would be included, and the applicant confirmed they would be. Commissioner Parker requested confirmation of the spacing between rails and was informed that the rails would be spaced four (4) inches apart. Commissioner Bumgarner noted that no base detail was shown in documentation provided the applicant. Commissioner Parker requested confirmation from staff that approval

could come with the condition of enclosing post bases with trim which staff confirmed. Commissioner Parker stated concern that the railing was too high and that historic railings are usually twenty-eight (28) inches. The applicant stated their preference would be a shorter railing. However, they understood that in order to adhere to Tulsa Zoning Code guidelines, the railing would have to be at least thirtysic (36) inches to account for a steep drop on one side of the porch. Commissioner Townsend stated that previous applicants have resolved the disparities in height requirements by adding soil in order to decrease distance from the ground to the porch. The applicant stated that their preference would be to add soil in order to have the railing reach a height of 28".

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the applications on the basis of Section A.6.8.4 of the Unified Design Guidelines, with the condition that the top of the post would be six (6) inches above the rail as depicted in documentation provided by the applicant and that the height of the rail would be twenty-eight (28) inches with the understanding that the applicant would add soil to decrease the drop from porch to ground. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously. Commissioner Becker stated she abstained from the vote due to arriving late.

Vote: 2120 E. 19th St. (Yorktown)

In Favor 1. Schoell

<u>Opposed</u>

Abstaining Becker Not Present Grant Shears Turner

- 2. Jones
- 3. Reeds
- 4. Bumgarner
- 5. Parker
- 6. Townsend
- 7. McKee

4. HP-0060-2019 / 1602 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Shaun Schaefer Proposal:

1. Replacement of doors

Staff presented its report; applicant was not present. Commissioner Schoell commented that the front (blue) door located at 1540 looked to be original. Commissioner Parker expressed concern that the doors may be original but was unsure by documentation provided. Commissioner McKee inquired if the property was a duplex, and staff stated no information about current occupancy was available. Commissioner Bumgarner inquired if the property was originally a garage. Staff confirmed that the property was originally a garage and that the property still has the original garage doors. Commissioner Townsend requested more information from the applicant on the historic significance of the doors.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Bumgarner made a motion to continue the application with additional documentation provided by the applicant, including close ups of all three (3) doors and more information on hardware. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Vote: 2120 E. 19th St. (Yorktown)

| <u>In Fav</u> | <u>/or</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | Not Present |
|---------------|------------|----------------|-------------------|-------------|
| 1. Sc | choell | | _ | Grant |
| 2. Jo | nes | | | Shears |
| 3. Re | eds | | | Turner |
| 4. Βι | ımgarner | | | |
| 5. Pa | arker | | | |
| 6. To | wnsend | | | |
| 7. Mo | cKee | | | |
| 8. Be | ecker | | | |

5. Nomination and Election of Secretary – Tulsa Preservation Commission

Commissioner Reeds made a motion to nominate Commissioner Jones as secretary. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion, which was approved unanimously.

Vote: Election of Commissioner Jones as Secretary

| <u>In Favor</u> | <u>Opposed</u> | <u>Abstaining</u> | Not Present |
|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|-------------|
| 1. Schoell | | | Grant |
| 2. Jones | | | Shears |
| 3. Reeds | | | Turner |
| 4. Bumgarner | | | |
| 5. Parker | | | |
| 6. Townsend | | | |
| 7. McKee | | | |
| 8. Becker | | | |
| | | | |

- C. Reports
 - 1. Chair Report None
 - 2. Staff Report None
- D. New Business

Subcommittee membership was discussed. Commissioner Townsend volunteered to continue chairing the Rules & Regulations Committee. Commissioner Parker volunteered to chair the Historic Preservation Committee, and Commissioner McKee volunteered to serve as a member. Commissioner Reeds volunteered to continue his membership on the Outreach Committee and stated he would discuss membership with

Commissioner Turner. Commissioner Jones volunteered to join the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee.

- E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items None
- F. Public Comment None
- G. Adjournment Commissioner Schoell adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:31 P.M.