



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, February 27, 2018, 4:30 P.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

- A. Opening Matters
1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Reeds called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:37 P.M.

Members Present

Ted Reeds, Chair
David Schoell, Vice-Chair
Peter Grant, Secretary
Chris Bumgarner*
Susan McKee
Robert Shears
Mary Lee Townsend

Members Absent

Mike Craddock
David Pounds
Jim Turner

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Addison Spradlin, Bob Edmiston

Others Present

Andy Cheatham, Kurt Barron, Brock and Maria Swatek, Tom Neal, Lillian McConnell, Candace Melton

*Late

2. Approval of Minutes from February 8, 2018
Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, February 8, 2018

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Bumgarner
2. Schoell			Craddock
3. Grant			Pounds
4. McKee			Turner
5. Shears			
6. Townsend			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-18-013 / 1623 S. Madison Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)
Applicant: Tom Neal
Proposal:
 1. Construction of porch

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Schoell presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that a request for an indication of the match of existing materials had been addressed and that the proposal had been forwarded with a recommendation for approval. The applicant commented that the columns would be repaired for use in this project and added that composition shingles would be applied to the sloped section of the roof and a membrane would be applied to the flat section of the roof. Commissioner Reeds inquired whether a gutter would be attached and was informed that no gutter would be installed.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

Vote: HP-18-013 / 1623 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Craddock
2. Schoell			Pounds
3. Grant			Turner
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			

2. **HP-18-014 / 1704 S. Madison Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: David W. Schoell

Proposal:

1. Replacement in kind of windows

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant had provided extensive documentation for the proposal. The applicant commented that the objective was the replacement in kind of the upper and lower sashes, that accoya wood had been selected as a material as it was dimensionally stable and durable, and that Type C Old Style Window Glass had been selected to match the appearance of the historic glass. The Contractor has experience with the restoration of historic windows throughout Oklahoma and has provided a mock-up for the applicant.

As there was no further discussion, the applicant recused himself, and Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Shears and approved unanimously.

Vote: HP-18-014 / 1704 S. Madison Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Craddock
2. Grant			Pounds
3. Bumgarner			Turner
4. McKee			Schoell
5. Shears			
6. Townsend			

3. **HP-18-015 / 311 E. 18th St.** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicants: Brock and Maria Swatek

Proposal:

1. Removal of walkways

Staff presented its report, noting that the objective was an increase in the area for flowers and ornamental vegetation. The applicants commented that the walkways were not original features, as they had been added to serve an apartment on the second story.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and approved unanimously.

Vote: HP-18-015 / 311 E. 18th St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Craddock
2. Schoell			Pounds
3. Grant			Turner
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			

4. HP-18-016 / 1425 E. 20th St. (Swan Lake)

Applicant: CV Services

Proposals:

1. Removal of chimney
2. Replacement of door

Staff presented its report, noting that the chimney, which no longer served its original purpose, was located on the rear of the roof. The applicant commented that the owner had requested replacement of the door, which itself had been previously replaced. Commissioner Schoell encouraged retention of a glazed panel in the door with attention to the profile of the muntins. Commissioner Reeds commented that the treatment should be as impressive as that of the adjacent window. Mr. Neal noted that leaded glass would have been installed historically. Commissioner Townsend inquired whether a slot for mail would be included and was informed that the door would have that feature. Commissioner Schoell recommended that the panel have leaded glass to match the appearance of the adjacent window. Commissioner Bumgarner objected to the restriction imposed by a requirement for leaded glass. The applicant proposed either leaded glass or wooden muntins in an appropriate configuration.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Shears made a motion to approve the proposal for removal of the chimney. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and approved by majority.

Vote: HP-18-016 / 1425 E. 20th St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds	McKee		Craddock
2. Schoell			Pounds
3. Grant			Turner
4. Bumgarner			
5. Shears			
6. Townsend			

Commissioner Schoell then made a motion to continue the review of the proposal for replacement of the door with a request for an appropriate design. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved by majority.

Vote: HP-18-016 / 1425 E. 20th St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell	Reeds		Craddock
2. Grant			Pounds
3. Bumgarner			Turner
4. McKee			
5. Shears			
6. Townsend			

5. HP-18-017 / 2128 E. 19th St. (Yorktown)

Applicant: Candace Z. Melton, ASLA

Proposals:

1. Extension of walkway from sidewalk to East 19th Street
2. Adjustment of width between panels of walkway between sidewalk and entry to residence and insertion of four-inch, random-cut Pennsylvania Bluestone ribbons between panels
3. Adjustment of location of courtyard wall
4. Construction of patio
5. Installation of landscape lighting
6. Installation of water feature
7. Installation of gate for driveway
8. Installation of gate at northeast corner of residence

Application to amend previous approval of an application by Tulsa Preservation Commission on June 27, 2017

Staff presented its report, indicating the alterations and additions on the Site Plan. The applicant noted that the patio was not originally proposed but had been added as an amenity and that the design of the gates imitated that of the gate previously approved. Commissioner Reeds inquired about the relocation of the wall, and the applicant responded that the located had been adjusted previously as directed and that the presently proposed located allowed for vegetation at the edges of the patio. Commissioner Reeds then inquired about the height of the wall and was informed that the height remained twenty-six inches and that the surface would still be covered in stucco. Commissioner Grant commented that, during the previous review, no precedent for the location of the wall near the sidewalk was found. but subsequently placement of a wall in that location had been discovered. Commissioner Reeds indicated his familiarity with that example and expressed his satisfaction with the present proposal.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Shears and approved unanimously.

Vote: HP-18-017 / 2128 E. 19th St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Craddock
2. Schoell			Pounds
3. Grant			Turner
4. Bumgarner			
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			

6. **HP-18-018 / 1568 S. Yorktown Pl. (Gillette)**

Applicant: Kurt Barron

Proposals:

1. Increase in width of doorway
2. Replacement of door

Staff presented its report, noting that the width of the doorway would be increased only by two inches (0'-2"). The applicant commented that, as the owner was concerned about security, a door with a solid panel had been proposed as a replacement. Commissioner Schoell noted that security could be addressed with a door with a glazed panel and recommended that the applicant submit another proposal. The applicant stressed the urgency of the request and mentioned that another door with a glozed panel had been considered. (This door was not included in the Staff Report, as the applicant had indicated a preference for the door submitted as a proposal for replacement and had provided Product Data only for that door.) Commissioners McKee and Townsend expressed concern about the assurance of security and indicated that a door with a solid panel would be appropriate.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Bumgarner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved by majority.

Vote: HP-18-018 / 1568 S. Yorktown Pl. (Gillette)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds	Schoell		Craddock
2. Grant			Pounds
3. Bumgarner			Turner
4. McKee			
5. Shears			
6. Townsend			

C. Reports

1. Chair Report

None

2. Staff Report

Staff presented a proposal for a card with information about the Tulsa Preservation Commission's activities and the value of preservation, which could be easily distributed by commissioners. Commissioners complimented Ms. Spradlin for her efforts, and several proposals for revisions were offered. Staff then indicated that Big Wheel Digital Media had contacted the office about presentation of a project in an Overlay District for its program, *Heartland Renovations*. Staff was directed to pursue further contact with its representative.

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Public Comment

Ms. McConnell commented that the session was informative. No other comments from the public were offered.

G. Adjournment

Chairman Reeds adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:49 P.M.