



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Thursday, October 12, 2017, 11:00 A.M.**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - North Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Acting as Chairman, Commissioner Schoell called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:03 A.M.

#### **Members Present**

David Schoell, Secretary  
Peter Grant  
Susan McKee  
David Pounds  
Mary Lee Townsend  
Jim Turner

#### **Members Absent**

Mike Craddock, Chair  
Ted Reeds, Vice-Chair  
Michael Birkes  
Chris Bumgarner  
Robert Shears

#### **Staff Present**

Jed Porter, Addison Spradlin, Bob Edmiston

#### **Others Present**

Lyle Johnson, Ron Kitchen, Phil Marshall, Kathy Vancuren, Zach Carver, W.C. Jones, Kelli Jones, Howard Hull, Randy Branstotton

#### 2. Approval of Minutes from September 26, 2017

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and approved unanimously.

**Vote: Meeting Minutes, September 26, 2017**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Craddock
2. Grant			Reeds
3. McKee			Birkes
4. Pounds			Bumgarner
5. Townsend			Shears
6. Turner			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest  
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

**B. Actionable Items**

1. **HP-17-098 / 2330 E. 17<sup>th</sup> St.** (Yorktown)

*Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: September 7, 2017, October 5, 2017*

Applicant: Philip E. Marshall

Request:

1. Construction of single-family residence according to documents submitted

Staff presented its report, and Commissioner Turner presented the report on behalf of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting that the only critique was more attention to the simulation of a crawl space. The applicant was present and commented that the adjustment of the finished floor elevation did not arise as an issue during the preliminary review and that the subcommittee did not require the slab to be raised. According to the applicant, the site slopes downward nearly six feet (6'-0") from the northwest corner to the southeast corner and accommodation of the slope would increase the height of the slab. The applicant added that insertion of the rowlock course was an acceptable solution to simulation of a crawl space and requested no adjustment in the height of the slab. Commissioner Turner commented that the critique about the finished floor elevation was merely a suggestion, but Commissioner McKee noted that historic residences typically had higher finished floor elevations.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved by majority.

**Vote: 2330 E. 17<sup>th</sup> St. (Yorktown)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Grant	Schoell		Craddock
2. Pounds	McKee		Reeds
3. Townsend			Birkes
4. Turner			Bumgarner
			Shears

**2. HP-17-101 / 1823 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Yorktown)**

Applicant: Zach Carver

Request:

1. Replacement of front door

*Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit*

Staff presented its report. The applicant was present, commented that he was unaware of the requirement for an Historic Preservation Permit, and offered to replace the door if necessary. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the number of residences owned by St. John Building Corporation and was informed that approximately twenty-five pieces of property were owned. Commissioner Schoell expressed his preference for a more historically appropriate door, and Commissioners Townsend and McKee likewise expressed that preference.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner McKee made a motion to deny approval of the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

**Vote: 1823 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Yorktown)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Craddock
2. Grant			Reeds
3. McKee			Birkes
4. Pounds			Bumgarner
5. Townsend			Shears
6. Turner			

3. **HP-17-104 / 740 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)**

Applicants: Lyle and Jan Johnson

Requests:

1. Substitution of masonry for rammed earth
2. Substitution of vinyl windows for aluminum windows

*Application to amend previous approval of an application by Tulsa Preservation Commission on August 3, 2017*

Staff presented its report. The applicant was present and commented that the construction with rammed earth and aluminum windows would be too expensive and that a match of masonry on the historic residences in the district would be attempted with the selection of brick. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the strategy to achieve the match, noting that historic and contemporary techniques of construction differed. In response to several inquiries, the applicant indicated that the masonry would be laid in a running bond with raked joints and would not be painted. Commissioner Schoell then inquired about the selection of windows and was informed that the vinyl windows would match the previously approved windows as closely as possible. Commissioner Schoell observed that vinyl windows seemed to be available in a single color, and the applicant responded that the vinyl windows viewed in the district did not seem to “stand out” and offered enough appeal. Commissioner Turner commented on the lack of information about the windows and masonry and noted that the window on the north elevation was not aligned.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the masonry be modular brick laid in running bond with raked joints and that the vinyl windows have a three-over-one (3/1) configuration with five-eighths inch (5/8”) muntins. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and approved unanimously.

**Vote:** 740 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

**In Favor**

1. Schoell
2. Grant
3. McKee
4. Pounds
5. Townsend
6. Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

**Not Present**

Craddock  
Reeds  
Birkes  
Bumgarner  
Shears

**4. HP-17-105 / 1555 Swan Dr. (Swan Lake)**

Applicants: Therese and Howard Hull

Request:

1. Construction of walkway

Staff presented its report. Mr. Hull was present and commented that the objective was the expansion of the present walkway. Commissioner Turner inquired whether the walkway would be connected to the walkway on the west side of the site and was informed that no connection would be created. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the width of the present walkway and about the purpose of the expansion and was informed that the walkway was presently four feet (4'-0") wide and that the expansion would create an area for congregation as well as a wider path. Commissioner Grant commented on the challenge with the connection of adjacent areas of flagstone. Commissioner Townsend requested confirmation about the material and was informed that the walkway would be constructed with flagstone.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and approved unanimously.

**Vote: 1555 Swan Dr. (Swan Lake)**

**In Favor**

1. Schoell
2. Grant
3. McKee
4. Pounds
5. Townsend
6. Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

**Not Present**

Craddock  
Reeds  
Birkes  
Bumgarner  
Shears

**5. HP-17-106 / 305 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (N. Maple Ridge)**

Applicant: W.C. Jones

Request:

1. Demolition of residence

Staff presented its report. The applicant was present and commented that the expense of rehabilitation would exceed the expense of the purchase, that the residence was not a Contributing Resource to the district, and that it was not historic. Staff noted that the residence was old enough to be historic and that, were the nomination for the National Register of Historic Places to be prepared

today, the scope could well be expanded to identify other sites as Contributing Resources. Commissioner Turner commented on the condition of the soil on the site and added that a request for demolition addressed a finite set of conditions, noting that usually the stay of demolition of sixty (60) days was permitted to expire without a request for extension. Commissioner Schoell observed that, although the residence was not a Contributing Resource, it was part of the neighborhood and that the application failed to address the criteria. Commissioner Townsend commented that the guidelines provide only for consideration of a request for demolition.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to deny approval of the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

**Vote: 305 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (N. Maple Ridge)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Craddock
2. Grant			Reeds
3. McKee			Birkes
4. Pounds			Bumgarner
5. Townsend			Shears
6. Turner			

**6. HP-17-107 / 1347 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**

Applicant: Kathy Vancuren

Request:

1. Replacement of front door

Staff presented its report. The applicant was present and commented that the condition of the door had prompted this request for its replacement. Commissioner Townsend noted the absence of specifications for the awning, and the applicant indicated her readiness to return with that information.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

**Vote: 1347 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**

**In Favor**

1. Schoell
2. Grant
3. McKee
4. Pounds
5. Townsend
6. Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

**Not Present**

- Craddock  
Reeds  
Birkes  
Bumgarner  
Shears

**C. Reports**

1. Chair Report

None

2. Staff Report

Staff reported on the progress of several projects in the Swan Lake Historic Preservation Overlay District. A proposal for the 2018 Regular Meeting Schedule will be presented at the next Regular Meeting of the Tulsa Preservation Commission.

**D. New Business**

None

**E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items**

Several commissioners requested an entry for discussion of enforcement of compliance, especially after denials of approvals for projects started or completed without an Historic Preservation Permit. Staff will invite representatives of the Working in Neighborhoods Department to attend the next Regular Meeting. Commissioner Turner announced the Dwell in the IDL Tour on November 5, and Ms. Spradlin announced the Jane Jacobs Walk on October 21.

**F. Adjournment**

Acting as Chairman, Commissioner Schoell adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:23 P.M.