



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Thursday, September 14, 2017, 11:00 A.M.**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - North Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Acting as Chairman, Commissioner Reeds called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:00 A.M.

#### **Members Present**

Ted Reeds, Vice-Chair  
David Schoell, Secretary  
Chris Bumgarner\*  
Peter Grant  
Susan McKee  
Robert Shears  
Mary Lee Townsend  
Jim Turner\*\*

#### **Members Absent**

Mike Craddock  
Michael Birkes  
David Pounds

\* Departed Early

\*\*Arrived Late

#### **Staff Present**

Jed Porter, Addison Spradlin, Bob Edmiston

#### **Others Present**

Dan Little, Lisa Ziegler, Jeff Flowers, Marina Haver, Shaun Schaefer, Nic Daniels, Bridgette Staub, Steven Jones

#### 2. Approval of Minutes from August 22, 2017

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and approved by majority.

**Vote: Meeting Minutes, August 22, 2017**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds		McKee	Craddock
2. Schoell		Shears	Birkes
3. Bumgarner			Pounds
4. Grant			Turner
5. Townsend			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest  
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-17-092 / 1710 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)**

Applicant: Bridgette J. Staub

Request:

1. Replacement of six windows

Staff presented its report. The applicant was present and commented that the objective was replacement with windows whose configuration and muntins matched those of the original windows. Commissioner Townsend inquired whether the windows would have true divided lights, and the applicant replied that those windows were too expensive. Commissioner Townsend noted that simulated divided lights would be acceptable and inquired about the material. The applicant responded that the windows would be vinyl. Commissioner Grant inquired whether the windows were vinyl or vinyl clad and was informed that the windows were vinyl. Commissioner Reeds noted that aluminum-clad wood windows were acceptable. Commissioner Schoell commented that the objective with replacement was a match of the original window as closely as possible and added that other types of windows were more historically appropriate. In response to the applicant's request for assistance, Commissioner Grant and Commissioner Townsend recommended additional information about the windows, including specifications and a sample. Commissioner Schoell stressed that the role of the Tulsa Preservation Commission was protection of historic resources and recommended consideration of aluminum-clad wood windows with simulated divided lights and muntins which matched those on the windows to be replaced. Commissioner Townsend noted that there was a difference between existing and original windows.

As there was no further discussion, the applicant requested a continuation of the review of the application. Commissioner Townsend made a motion to continue the review. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

**Vote: 1710 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Craddock
2. Schoell			Birkes
3. Bumgarner			Pounds
4. Grant			
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

**2. HP-17-093 / 901 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)**

Applicant: Lisa J. Ziegler

Request:

1. Construction of fence in street yards

Staff presented its report, and the applicant was present but declined to comment. Commissioner Turner inquired about the method of construction and was informed that the fence would be constructed with panels. Commissioner Turner observed that the yards were not flat and that panels would not be suited for this site as they could not accommodate its slope. The applicant inquired whether frames could be constructed to accommodate the slope, and Commissioner Reeds responded that an easier solution would be construction of stringers for the insertion of the pickets. Commissioner Turner recommended consideration of treated pine as a material and its preparation prior to application of paint. Commissioner McKee inquired about the height of the fence and was informed that the height would be three feet and six inches (3'-6").

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application with the conditions that the fence be constructed with a stick frame with vertical Gothic Style wood pickets arranged to adhere to the slope of the site and that the space between the pickets match the width of a picket. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and approved unanimously.

**Vote: 901 N. Denver Ave. (Brady Heights)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Craddock
2. Schoell			Birkes
3. Bumgarner			Pounds
4. Grant			
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

3. **HP-17-094 / 1707 S. Troost Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Katherine Teel

Request:

1. Removal of window on south facade

*Work started without an Historic Preservation Permit*

Staff presented its report. The applicant could not attend and was represented by the contractor, Mr. Daniels, who commented that the window was not an original window and noted that the objectives were removal of the window and retention of the transom. Commissioner Reeds inquired whether the trim on the transom would be retained and was informed that the trim would remain. Commissioner Grant inquired whether a drip edge would be installed on the transom and was informed that the profile of the sills elsewhere on the residence would be duplicated. Commissioner Turner inquired whether the siding would extend continuously to cover the former location of the window and was informed that the siding would be extended and that a drip edge on the bottom sill would be installed if necessary. Commissioner McKee proposed substitution of two windows for the transom. Commissioner Reeds expressed his satisfaction with the present arrangement, and the contractor noted that the transom reflected the character of the addition at the rear of the residence. Commissioner Grant resumed consideration of the treatment of the sill, and the contractor indicated his readiness to comply with any recommendation.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the transom feature a picture-frame trim. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

**Vote:** 1707 S. Troost Ave. (Swan Lake)

**In Favor**

1. Reeds
2. Schoell
3. Bumgarner
4. Grant
5. McKee
6. Shears
7. Townsend
8. Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

**Not Present**

Craddock  
Birkes  
Pounds

4. **HP-17-095 / 1602 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)**

Applicant: Shaun Schaefer

Requests:

1. Replacement of fifteen windows
2. Installation of two skylights on north side of roof
3. Construction of fence in street yard

Staff presented its report, and the applicant was present and commented that Pella aluminum-clad wood windows had been selected. Commissioner Reeds confirmed that the windows were hung with a one-over-one configuration. Commissioner Townsend inquired about the gate, and the applicant indicated that the gate would match that presented in the illustration in the Staff Report. Staff requested clarification of the distance from the southern boundary of the site for the installation. Commissioner Grant commented that a dormer seemed more appropriate than a skylight as a source for illumination, and Commissioner Schoell agreed, adding that a skylight seemed out of character for the residence.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the application for construction of the fence with the condition that its installation provide access for vehicles in the neighbor's driveway and for the replacement of the windows. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Grant and approved unanimously.

**Vote: 1602 S. Trenton Ave. (Swan Lake)**

**In Favor**

1. Reeds
2. Schoell
3. Bumgarner
4. Grant
5. McKee
6. Shears
7. Townsend
8. Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

**Not Present**

- Craddock  
Birkes  
Pounds

After this approval, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deny the proposal for the installation of skylights. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Craddock
2. Schoell			Birkes
3. Bumgarner			Pounds
4. Grant			
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

5. **1010 E. 8<sup>th</sup> St.** (Fire Alarm Building Easement)

Applicant: Dan Little

Request:

1. Installation of flag pole

Staff presented its report. The applicant was present and commented that the proposal seemed straightforward, adding that the flag pole was important, as flags were important for firemen, and that no construction would occur in the vicinity of the pole. Commissioner Townsend requested that a plaque with information about the pole be installed, and the applicant responded that the request would have to be relayed to the Tulsa Fire Museum's Board of Directors.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the application with a request for placement of a plaque with information about the history of the flag pole. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Shears and approved unanimously.

**Vote: 1010 E. 8<sup>th</sup> St. (Fire Alarm Building Easement)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Craddock
2. Schoell			Birkes
3. Bumgarner			Pounds
4. Grant			
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

6. **HP-17-096 / 1316 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**

Applicant: Andrea Stafford

Requests:

1. Replacement of soffit with HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding
2. Replacement of siding with HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding

Staff presented its report. The applicant could not attend and was represented by her contractor, Mr. Jones. The contractor commented that the objective was the removal of damaged material and its replacement with HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding. Commissioner Townsend inquired about treatment of the sills, which could have been removed during installation of the vinyl siding, and the contractor replied that the sills would be replaced with treated pine, which would be painted after it had aged. Commissioner Schoell commented that, although damaged, the original siding's condition could be satisfactory enough to invite repair and inquired about any evidence of caps on the windows. No evidence has been detected, according to the contractor, and caps elsewhere in the neighborhood will serve as models for replication. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the locations for removal of the vinyl siding and was informed that the siding in the gable and on the rear of the residence had been removed for inspection of the original siding. Commissioner Grant speculated that the wall could have been constructed without sheathing and recommended the installation of insulation. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the treatment of the soffit, and the contractor indicated an error in the application, as material specifically produced for soffits would be installed. Commissioner Grant inquired whether any original soffit had been exposed, and the contractor responded that no original siding had been uncovered yet and indicated that any siding in satisfactory condition would be retained.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved unanimously.

**Vote:** 1316 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)

**In Favor**

1. Reeds
2. Schoell
3. Grant
4. McKee
5. Shears
6. Townsend
7. Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

**Not Present**

- Craddock  
Birkes  
Pounds

7. **HP-17-097 / 1913 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Yorktown)**

Applicant: Kevin J. Levesque

Request:

1. Replacement of columns on front porch

*Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit*

Staff presented its report, and, although invited, the applicant was not present. As there was no discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deny the proposal. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

**Vote:** 1913 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Craddock
2. Schoell			Birkes
3. Grant			Pounds
4. McKee			
5. Shears			
6. Townsend			
7. Turner			

8. Response to Proposal for Installation of Speed Humps and Signage on South Madison Avenue between 15<sup>th</sup> Street and 21<sup>st</sup> Street
  - a. Report of Ad Hoc Committee
  - b. Review of Correspondence from State Historic Preservation Office

Staff presented a summary of the comments from the State Historic Preservation Office. Commissioner Schoell described the activities intended to calm the flow of traffic in which residents of North Maple Ridge Historic Preservation Overlay District had participated. Apparently measurements have been conducted by the City of Tulsa, but Commissioner Schoell noted that no conclusions could be drawn yet and that the North Maple Ridge Neighborhood Association has engaged the City of Tulsa to pursue several measures to calm traffic.

As there was no discussion, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to direct the staff and the Ad Hoc Committee to draft a letter with an expression of concern about the impact of the installation of speed humps and signage to be directed to Mayor Bynum, Mr. Ball (Director of the Streets and Stormwater Department), Councilor Ewing, Ms. Taylor (Chief of Economic Development), Ms. Fothergill (Office of the Mayor), and the president of the North Maple Ridge Neighborhood Association and to enclose a copy of the correspondence from the State Historic Preservation Office. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.



**Vote:** Correspondence with Expression of Concern

**In Favor**

1. Reeds
2. Schoell
3. Grant
4. McKee
5. Shears
6. Townsend
7. Turner

**Opposed**

**Abstaining**

**Not Present**

- Craddock  
Birkes  
Pounds

C. Reports

1. Chair Report  
None
2. Staff Report  
None

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Adjournment

Acting as Chairman, Commissioner Reeds adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:35 P.M.