



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, December 8, 2016, 11:00 A.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Shears called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:15 A.M.

Members Present

Robert Shears, Chairman
Mike Craddock, Vice-Chairman
David Schoell, Secretary
David Pounds
Jim Turner
Susan McKee
Tom Neal
John Snyder
Peter Grant

Members Absent

Ted Reeds
Michael Birkes

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Bob Edmiston

Others Present

Becky Johnston, Dani Widell, Aaron Sprik, Jody Collins, Mollie Collins

2. Approval of Minutes from November 10, 2016
Commissioner Pounds made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved by majority with an abstention.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, November 10, 2016

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears		McKee	Birkes
2. Craddock			Reeds
3. Schoell			
4. Pounds			
5. Turner			
6. Neal			
7. Snyder			
8. Grant			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-16-086 / 2323 E. 17th Pl.** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Biltmore Homes

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Requests:

1. Adjust positions of Dining Room windows on east façade
2. Cover chimney below gable with stone
3. Construct open-truss gable roof above patio
4. Change roof pitch over bedroom
5. Install double French Doors at entries to patio
6. Extend stone border to west wall of patio

Application to amend previous approval of an application by Tulsa Preservation Commission on October 25, 2016

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present and noted that his client wished to expand the Scope of Work. Commissioner Neal observed that the rationale for the request seemed self-evident.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.2, C.4.3, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3.

Vote: 2323 E. 17th Pl. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Birkes
2. Craddock			Reeds
3. Schoell			
4. Pounds			
5. Turner			
6. McKee			
7. Neal			
8. Snyder			
9. Grant			

2. **HP-16-085 / 1158 N. Cheyenne Ave.** (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Dani Widell

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Reconstruct trim for window and door

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present and added that the request addressed only the front windows and door. No discussion followed.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.3.1, A.3.6, A.4.1, A.4.6.

Vote: 1158 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Birkes
2. Craddock			Reeds
3. Schoell			
4. Pounds			
5. Turner			
6. McKee			
7. Neal			
8. Snyder			
9. Grant			

3. **HP-16-089 / 1232 E. 18th St.** (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicants: Jody and Mollie Collins

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Requests:

1. Remove damaged siding on dormers and rear porch and replace with HardiePlank Lap Siding
2. Replace windows on rear porch with vinyl, single-hung windows
3. Install Plantation Shutters on north façade of residence

Work started without a Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented the application, and the applicants were present. Commissioner Neal expressed concern about the applicants' absence during the previous review of their application, which was denied. The applicants responded that they were unaware that their attendance was required.

Discussion focused on the selection of materials. Commissioner Shears inquired about the dimensions of the original wood siding. Mr. Collins noted that it would have been more narrow than the HardiePlank Lap Siding but could not confirm the dimensions. Commissioner Neal inquired about the appearance of the windows on the porch. The applicants responded that the windows had only internal muntins, and Commissioner Neal recommended application of external muntins and added that the number of panes in the windows in the south dormer had changed.

Discussion then focused on the applicants' completion of repairs without a Historic Preservation Permit. Commissioner Schoell inquired about their familiarity with the requirement for a permit. Mr. Collins indicated that apparently they had been misinformed by their neighbors, and Ms. Collins added that they were now aware that, because their residence occupied a corner, the review of projects on every side would be required and that they wished to comply with the requirement for a permit. Commissioner Craddock expressed frustration with the review of projects after their completion. Commissioner Turner inquired about the exposure of the siding on the dormers, and Commissioner Grant observed that the exposure shown in the applicants' photograph seemed more narrow. Commissioner Snyder inquired about the installation of the shutters and was informed that the shutters had been produced but had not been installed.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with these conditions—(1) application of exterior muntins on the windows on the porch and (2) replacement of the dormer windows on the south façade. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Snyder and was approved by majority. Installation of the shutters was not approved, and the applicants were directed to submit another application with dimensions of the shutters and the windows. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.3, A.2.4, A.4.2, A.4.5, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4.

Vote: 1232 E. 18th St. (N. Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears	McKee		Birkes
2. Craddock			Reeds
3. Schoell			
4. Pounds			
5. Turner			
6. Neal			
7. Snyder			
8. Grant			

4. HP-16-087 / 2123 E. 18th St. (Yorktown)

Applicant: Rebecca Johnston

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Replace non-original windows with vinyl, single-hung windows

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present and offered an apology for her lack of familiarity with the requirement for a Historic Preservation Permit. Commissioner Schoell inquired about measures to inform owners about the requirement, and the applicant responded that she had not received any information and that her neighbors were likewise uninformed.

Discussion focused on the replacement of the windows. The applicant noted that the windows on the first story were vinyl windows and that the windows on the second story had aluminum frames with single panes of glass. Commissioner Schoell commented that vinyl windows will eventually need to be replaced. The applicant responded that wood windows were too expensive and added that the second-story windows, which had been ordered, would not be installed since they did not properly fit. Commissioner Neal proposed the approval of the installation of the first-story windows but recommended that approval of the replacement of the second-story windows be withheld until the applicant was satisfied. Commissioner Schoell advised the applicant to review the Shop Drawings before the purchase of the windows.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application with the condition that only installation of the first-story windows would be approved. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Snyder and approved by majority. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.4.1, A.4.4, A.4.5, A.4.6.

Vote: 2123 E. 18th St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears	McKee		Birkes
2. Craddock			Reeds
3. Schoell			
4. Pounds			
5. Turner			
6. Neal			
7. Snyder			
8. Grant			

5. Report of Nominating Committee and Election of Officers

Chairman Shears presented the report of the Nominating Committee and its nominations of Commissioner Reeds as Vice-Chair and Commissioner Schoell as Secretary and invited nominations from the floor. As there were no additional nominations, Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve the report with the condition that the Vice-Chair automatically becomes Chair in accordance with the Rules and Regulations. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Craddock and approved unanimously.

Vote: Report of Nominating Committee and Election of Officers

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Birkes
2. Craddock			Reeds
3. Schoell			
4. Pounds			
5. Turner			
6. McKee			
7. Neal			
8. Snyder			
9. Grant			

6. Review and Approval of 2017 Meeting Schedules for Tulsa Preservation Commission and Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee

After a brief review of several proposals for schedules prepared by the staff, the commissioners agreed to retain the current schedule. Commissioner Neal made a motion to retain the current schedule. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Schoell and approved unanimously.

Vote: Review and Approval of 2017 Meeting Schedules for Tulsa Preservation Commission and Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Birkes
2. Craddock			Reeds
3. Schoell			
4. Pounds			
5. Turner			
6. McKee			
7. Neal			
8. Snyder			
9. Grant			

C. Reports

1. Chair Report
None

2. Staff Report
 - a. Violations

Staff was directed to conduct inquiries and, if necessary, to file a caveat with regard to the unresolved violation of the Zoning Code at the residence located at 204 East Nineteenth Street.

D. New Business

Commissioner Neal recommended a Certificate of Appreciation be prepared for Commissioner McKee in recognition of her service to the Tulsa Preservation Commission, and the staff agreed to prepare the certificate for presentation at a forthcoming Regular Meeting.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Adjournment

Chairman Shears adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:57 P.M.