



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, November 10, 2016, 11:00 A.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Shears called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:04 A.M.

Members Present

Robert Shears, Chairman
David Schoell, Secretary
David Pounds
Jim Turner
Tom Neal
John Snyder
Ted Reeds
Peter Grant*

Members Absent

Mike Craddock
Susan McKee
Michael Birkes

*Left Early

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Bob Edmiston

Others Present

John Drury, Mike Daniel, Amanda Cooper, Molly Snively, Chas Higgins, Bruce Horgen, Mike Peters, Dan Alaback, Chad Osgood, John Muselmann

2. Approval of Minutes from September 29, October 13, and October 25, 2016
Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve these Minutes in a single motion, rather than three separate motions. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Pounds.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, September 29, October 13, and October 25, 2016

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Craddock
2. Pounds			McKee
3. Turner			Birkes
4. Neal			
5. Snyder			
6. Reeds			
7. Grant			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
Commissioner Reeds disclosed his employment with The McIntosh Group and indicated his recusal during the review of the application for Historic Preservation Permit Number HP-16-072.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-16-056 / 1824 E. 16th Pl. (Yorktown)**
Applicants: Amanda and Brandon Cooper
HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None
Requests:
 1. Replace original sidelights with aluminum-clad sidelights
 2. Replace non-original door with two-panel, six-light, Craftsman Style door

Staff presented the application, and an applicant, Amanda Cooper, was present but declined to comment immediately. The Coopers' attorney, Mr. Daniel, contended that the sidelights needed to be replaced and that the Coopers could not afford wooden sidelights. Commissioner Neal observed that, if the replacement were in-kind, more information about the sidelights would be required. Commissioner Turner noted the absence of the base on the new sidelights, Commissioner Reeds expressed regret at the loss of the panel, and Commissioner Neal concluded that the difference in appearance would be substantial. Mr. Daniel noted that some alteration of the sidelights, such as replacement of the muntins, had occurred. Commissioner Neal conceded that the panel could have been added but noted that the proportions were accurate. Mr. Daniel commented that any information, which had been requested, had been provided and assured the Commissioners that the owners sought to match the sidelights as closely as possible. Commissioner Schoell commented that the replacement of original materials required sensitivity, as an attraction of the district was the caliber of materials and the character which they created. Commissioner Reeds expressed

concern about the conduct of the vendor, adding that, rather than pursuit of an appeal, a better course of action would have been revision of the application and better documentation. Commissioner Turner inquired whether the vendor would repair the panels, and the applicant responded that any damaged wood would be replaced but the trim would remain and would be adjusted to be plumb. Commissioner Pounds commented on the condition of the sidelights and encouraged the repair of the adjacent surface. Commissioner Neal wished for a better match of the sidelights. Mr. Daniel expressed the Coopers' appreciation for the efforts of the commission and assured the Commissioners of their desire to comply with the guidelines. The applicant added that she and her husband desired to provide comfort and safety for their family and to maintain the character of their residence. Chairman Shears observed that, were the glass to extend to the base as proposed, there would be no match of the present sidelights.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.3.1, A.3.3, A.3.4, A.3.5, A.3.6, A.3.8, A.4.1, A.4.4, A.4.5, A.4.6.

Vote: 1824 E. 16th Pl. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds	Shears	Neal	Craddock
2. Turner	Schoell		McKee
3. Snyder			Birkes
4. Reeds			
5. Grant			

2. HP-16-072 / 1401-1403 E. 17th Pl. (Swan Lake)

Applicant: The McIntosh Group for Timothy A. Inman and Lisa Blevins-Inman

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Demolish contributing structure

Staff presented the application, and the applicant was present. The applicant noted several conditions which have posed challenges for rehabilitation of the apartments, including the placement of the stairs on the exterior and the loss of integrity in the structural system. Four scenarios have been considered by the owners—(1) the maintenance of the apartments in their current condition, (2) rehabilitation, including installation of new windows, (3) the construction of an addition, which would include a new system for circulation, and (4) demolition and construction of a new building. The latter scenario is the present objective.

Commissioner Neal inquired whether construction of a new building could be profitable, and the applicant responded that to the best of his knowledge the Historic Preservation Tax Incentives applied only to treatment of the exterior.

Commissioner Turner reminded the applicant that any proposal for new construction would be reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission and that an increase in density was not guaranteed. The applicant responded that less density had actually been considered. Commissioner Turner inquired whether any rehabilitation or rehabilitation with the construction of an addition had been considered. The applicant replied that new construction which featured fewer units with more bedrooms was actually a feasible solution. Commissioner Neal encouraged retention of the stairs and addition of stairs in the interior, but the applicant noted restrictions on circulation.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to deny the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Pounds and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: F.1.1.

Vote: 1401-1403 E. 17th Pl. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Craddock
2. Schoell			McKee
3. Pounds			Birkes
4. Turner			
5. Neal			
6. Snyder			
7. Grant			

3. HP-16-062 / 1164 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Charles Higgins

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: October 6, 2016/October 18, 2016/November 3, 2016

Request:

1. Construct new single-family residence according to drawings submitted

Staff presented the application, and Commissioner Neal presented the report of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting its recommendation for approval of the application. The applicant indicated several requested revisions, including the design of the column with a square base and tapered top and the selection of a composite material for the siding, rather than HardiePlank Lap Siding. Commissioner Turner requested clarification about the exposure of the siding, and the applicant responded that the exposure would be six inches (6"). Further clarification about the dimensions of the trim was requested, and the applicant responded that the trim at the corners would be 2x6 cedar boards. Commissioner Neal noted a lack of information about the windows, and the staff informed the commissioners that no additional information had been received. Commissioners Neal and Turner discussed the material for the windows, and afterwards Commissioner Neal proposed wood windows on all facades, except for the west façade and the less visible sections of the north façade.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application with these conditions—(1) smooth composite siding with a six-inch (6”) exposure on all façades and (2) wood windows with vinyl windows permitted on the west façade and on the north façade for the Play Room and Master Bedroom only. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.2, C.4.3, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3.

Vote: 1164 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Craddock
2. Schoell			McKee
3. Pounds			Birkes
4. Turner			
5. Neal			
6. Snyder			
7. Reeds			

4. HP-16-076 / 1401 E. 17th St. (Swan Lake)

Applicant: John Muselmann

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: November 3, 2016

Requests:

1. Replace siding on south façade below gable with HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding and match pattern and exposure of existing siding
2. Reconstruct porch on southwest corner of residence according to drawings submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant provided a summary of the proposal, noting the replacement of the siding on the west façade with Hardie-Plank Smooth Lap Siding and the removal of two windows from the north façade and their installation on the porch. Commissioner Neal inquired about the type of windows for their replacement, and the applicant responded that they would be double-hung windows. Commissioner Neal commented on the character of the residence, adding that the new door on the west façade will be installed in a former entry. As the discussion continued, the alignment of the steps with the new door was requested, as was additional documentation about the dimensions and connections of the new rail on the south side of the porch.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application with these conditions—(1) the new steps to be five feet (5’-0”) in width and centered on the new door and (2) documentation of the dimensions and connections of the rail on the south porch. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.1, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.2.4, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.3, A.4.4, A.4.5, A.4.6, A.6.1, A.6.2, A.6.3, A.6.4,

A.6.5, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4

Vote: 1401 E. 17th St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Craddock
2. Schoell			McKee
3. Pounds			Birkes
4. Turner			
5. Neal			
6. Snyder			
7. Reeds			

5. 1414 S. Galveston Ave. (McBirney Mansion Easement)

Applicant: Chad Osgood for Wendy and Gentner Drummond

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: November 3, 2016

Request:

1. Construct walkways and patios and create waterfall and pools according to drawings submitted

Staff presented the application, and Commissioner Neal presented the report of the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee, noting its recommendation for approval of the application. The applicant stressed that the objective was the retention of the character of the landscape, particularly in the vicinity of the rock garden. Mr. Peters added that the scheme relied on materials already on the site. Staff inquired whether any new trees would be planted and was informed that no trees would be added. Commissioner Reeds complimented the design, and the applicant noted that the owners had strived to preserve the site as these new features were added.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and was approved unanimously. Guideline cited: *Deed of Scenic, Open Space, and Architectural Façade Easement*

Vote: 1414 S. Galveston Ave. (McBirney Mansion Easement)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Craddock
2. Schoell			McKee
3. Pounds			Birkes
4. Turner			
5. Neal			
6. Snyder			
7. Reeds			

6. HP-16-080 / 1232 E. 18th St. (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicants: Jody and Mollie Collins

HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None

Requests:

1. Remove damaged siding on dormers and rear porch and replace with HardiePlank Lap Siding
2. Replace windows on rear porch with single-hung, vinyl windows
3. Install Plantation Shutters on north façade of residence

Work started without a Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented the application. Although the applicants had received a copy of the agenda and a request for confirmation of their attendance, they failed to appear. After a review of the application and a brief discussion about violations of the Zoning Code, Commissioner Neal made a motion to deny the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Pounds and was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.2.4, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.5, A.5.5.

Vote: 1232 E. 18th St. (N. Maple Ridge)

In Favor

1. Shears
2. Schoell
3. Pounds
4. Turner
5. Neal
6. Snyder
7. Reeds

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

Craddock
McKee
Birkes

7. Review and Approval of 2017 Meeting Schedules for Tulsa Preservation Commission and Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee

After a brief discussion about the arrangement of the schedule, Commissioner Neal made a motion to continue the review of the schedules at the Regular Meeting on December 8. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Pounds and was approved unanimously.

Vote: Review and Approval of 2017 Meeting Schedules for Tulsa Preservation Commission and Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee

In Favor

1. Shears
2. Schoell
3. Pounds
4. Turner
5. Neal
6. Snyder
7. Reeds

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

- Craddock
McKee
Birkes

C Reports

1. Chair Report – No Report
2. Staff Report – No Report
 - a. Staff Approvals
 - b. Violations
 - c. Holiday Party

D. New Business

UNDER THE OPEN MEETING ACT, THIS AGENDA ITEM IS AUTHORIZED ONLY FOR MATTERS NOT KNOWN ABOUT OR WHICH COULD NOT HAVE BEEN REASONABLY FORESEEN PRIOR TO THE TIME OF POSTING THE AGENDA OR ANY REVISED AGENDA.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

F. Adjournment

Chairman Shears adjourned the Regular Meeting at 1:12 P.M.