



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Tuesday, October 25, 2016, 4:30 P.M.**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - North Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Acting as Chairman, Vice-Chairman Craddock called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:32 P.M.

#### **Members Present**

Mike Craddock, Vice-Chairman  
David Pounds\*\*  
Jim Turner\*\*  
Ted Reeds\*  
Susan McKee  
Tom Neal  
John Snyder

\*Late

\*\*Left Early

#### **Members Absent**

Shears  
Schoell  
Grant  
Birkes

#### **Staff Present**

Jed Porter, Kristin Pack, Bob Edmiston

#### **Others Present**

Charlie Bastyr, Cheryl Thompson, Keith Sprik, Charles Bell, John Muselmann

2. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest  
Commissioner Neal stated he previously worked with the applicant for HP-16-079 but has no involvement with the current application.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-16-055 / 1401 E. 17<sup>th</sup> St.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: John Muselmann

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Request:

1. Remove two non-original basement windows and replace with glass block

*Work completed without a Historic Preservation Permit*

*Application would amend the previous approval by the Tulsa Preservation Commission on August 23, 2016 to replace siding on east and south facades of addition with HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding to match exposure on primary structure with condition the owner may match the existing raked window trim*

Staff presented the application, and the applicant, John Muselmann, was present. Commissioner Turner asked the applicant to clarify where the siding is proposed to be replaced. Mr. Muselmann stated only the siding on the rear addition, but he has another application pending review by the Historic Preservation (HP) Permit Subcommittee for restoring the porch and replacing siding. Mr. Muselmann noted the original house on the lot now resides one lot north, and he believes this building was moved from the country during the 1940s or 1950s.

Commissioner Neal asked the applicant if he was aware of the HP Permit process, and Mr. Muselmann replied yes. Commissioner Neal asked the applicant why he chose to proceed with installing the siding over the basement foundation wall and replacing the two windows. Mr. Muselmann stated there was extra siding, and the worker on site said he could attach it. Commissioner Neal stated glass block would not be appropriate on a 1920s Craftsman Bungalow, and the applicant could have used translucent glass for privacy. Commissioner Pounds asked the Commission if the house was moved in the 1940s or 1950s and, if the addition is from that period, whether the glass block would be appropriate. Commissioner Turner asked the applicant if he would be willing to remove the lowest two courses of siding.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with the condition to remove the bottom two courses of siding on the south and east facades of the addition. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Snyder

and was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.2.1, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.2.4, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.4, A.4.5, A.4.6, A.4.7.

**Vote: 1401 E. 17<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Shears
2. Pounds			Schoell
3. Turner			Grant
4. McKee			Birkes
5. Neal			
6. Snyder			
7. Reeds			

**2. HP-16-077 / 2323 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Yorktown)**

Applicant: Biltmore Homes

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: October 18, 2016*

Request:

1. Construct new single-family residence according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant's representative, Keith Sprik, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the report from the HP Permit Subcommittee and complimented the applicant on the revisions of the design.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.2, C.4.3, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3.

**Vote: 2323 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Yorktown)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Shears
2. Turner			Schoell
3. McKee			Grant
4. Neal			Pounds
5. Snyder			Birkes
6. Reeds			

3. **HP-16-079 / 1701 S. Madison Ave.** (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Charlie Bastyr for George Davenport

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: October 18, 2016*

Requests:

1. Remove vinyl siding on porch on east side of residence and replace with HardiePlank Smooth Lap Siding with exposure to match that on residence
2. Replace doors on porch on east side of residence with Hinged French Patio Doors
3. Replace windows on porch on east side of residence with Pinnacle double-hung windows which match existing windows on residence

Staff presented the application, and the applicant’s representative, Charlie Bastyr, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the report from the HP Permit Subcommittee and complimented the applicant’s representative on the revisions of the design.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.2.4, A.3.1, A.3.2, A.3.3, A.3.5, A.3.6, A.3.7, A.3.8, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.3, A.4.7.

**Vote:** 1701 S. Madison Ave. (N. Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Shears
2. Turner			Schoell
3. McKee			Pounds
4. Neal			Grant
5. Snyder			Birkes
6. Reeds			

4. **HP-16-081 / 1533 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Charles Bell

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Request:

1. Construct new retaining wall and bulkheads according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant, Charles Bell, was present. Mr. Bell stated he would like to keep the existing retaining wall, but the property is located on a corner lot, and it was not the first time a car drove over the wall into the yard. Mr. Bell stated that, in order to reinforce the

existing wall, it would be necessary to remove it and reconstruct it, since the current wall is constructed with mortar and a stone veneer.

Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Neal and was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.1.1, A.1.2, A.1.3, A.1.4, G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3, G.1.5, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3.

**Vote:** 1533 E. 20<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Shears
2. Turner			Pounds
3. McKee			Grant
4. Neal			Birkes
5. Snyder			Schoell
6. Reeds			

C. Follow-Up of Appeal: Discussion and Action on Form of Authorization for Installation of Windows – 1824 E. 16<sup>th</sup> Pl.

Staff summarized the e-mail sent by the owners of 1824 East 16<sup>th</sup> Place regarding approval for the installation of the windows. Staff stated they defer to the Preservation Commission for the form of authorization since the Permit Center will require an approval before the owners can receive a repair permit. Commissioners Turner and McKee asked Staff who determines whether the muntins match. Staff stated it is reasonable to see the windows to verify the muntins match as directed by the ruling of the Board of Adjustment. Staff can present a short letter to the Assistant Director of Development Services to authorize approval as directed by the Board of Adjustment (BOA) with a copy of the Minutes from the BOA Regular Meeting. Commissioner Neal recommended Staff verify the muntins and write a letter to the Assistant Director in consultation with Chairman Shears.

Commissioner Neal made a motion that, after Staff reviews the placement of the muntins as authorized by the Board of Adjustment and if the placement is satisfactory in Staff's opinion, Staff may write and sign a letter informing the Assistant Director that the installation of the windows is authorized pursuant to the Minutes attached from the Board of Adjustment. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and was approved unanimously.

**Vote: Staff review of windows and submittal of letter to the Development Services**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Craddock			Shears
2. Turner			Pounds
3. McKee			Grant
4. Neal			Birkes
5. Snyder			Schoell
6. Reeds			

D. Information Session

**1. Review and Discussion of Decorum and Meeting Procedure**

Staff read a letter from a previous applicant and stated several Commissioners requested a review of Decorum. Commissioner Craddock stated Commissioners are public servants and should be courteous to applicants and non-hostile, and he expressed a desire that the Neighborhood Representatives attend, since they participate during the reviews by the HP Permit Subcommittee.

Commissioner Neal stated the public also includes residents who live within the HP Overlay Districts and the Unified Design Guidelines need to be evenly applied, and he observed people have different comfort levels and patience during public meetings. Commissioner Craddock stated the Preservation Commission has done due diligence and acted courteously towards applicants, but, as public servants, the Preservation Commission is held to a higher standard. Commissioner Turner agreed with Commissioner Craddock and added the Preservation Commission should not use inflammatory language, because applicants are proud of their homes and believe they are doing what is best for their houses. Commissioner Reeds added checking your tone of voice can help make a meeting smoother and calmer.

**2. Review and Discussion of Tulsa Preservation Commission and Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee Meeting Schedules**

Staff asked the Preservation Commission to review different options for the 2017 Meeting Schedule, since the schedule must be submitted to the City Clerk thirty (30) days prior to the end of the year.

E. Reports

1. Chair Report – None
2. Staff Report – None

F. New Business

None

G. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

H. Adjournment

Acting as Chairman, Vice-Chairman Craddock adjourned the Regular Meeting at 5:57 P.M.