



# TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

**Thursday, October 13, 2016, 11:00 A.M.**

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street  
10th Floor - North Conference Room

### A. Opening Matters

#### 1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Shears called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:00 A.M.

#### **Members Present**

Robert Shears, Chairman  
Mike Craddock, Vice-Chairman  
David Schoell, Secretary  
David Pounds  
Jim Turner\*  
Susan McKee  
Tom Neal  
John Snyder  
Ted Reeds  
Michael Birkes

#### **Members Absent**

Peter Grant

\*Late

#### **Staff Present**

Jed Porter, Kristin Pack, Bob Edmiston

#### **Others Present**

Pat Fox, Patrick Fox, DeWayne Corvin, Bruce Horgen, Aaron Sprik, Cherie Cook, Jeremy Grodhaus, Keith Kelly

#### 2. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

Commissioner Reeds stated he will recuse himself from review of the application for HP-16-072 since he is employed by The McIntosh Group.

## B. Actionable Items

### 1. **HP-16-061 / 1715 S. Peoria Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Patrick Fox for Dr. Randy McCormick

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Dates: September 1/September 20, 2016*

Request:

1. Construct new medical office according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant's representative, Patrick Fox, was present. Commissioner Shears stated he was not present at the previous meeting and requested a summary, and Commissioner Craddock summarized the previous meeting to the Commission.

Commissioner Neal stated he was disappointed with the depiction of the streetscape provided and added that the application failed to meet the Unified Design Guidelines; in addition, the applicants have not done due diligence and have recreated a non-HP Overlay property. Mr. Pat Fox, the architect, stated he believes the application meets the Unified Design Guidelines about the setback and orientation, adding that the parking location was chosen to be consistent with other properties along South Peoria Avenue and to allow only one curb cut. Commissioner Neal noted the adjacent properties with parking lots are not historical parking lots.

Commissioner Reeds stated the 6 ft. fence appears close to the right-of-way. Mr. Pat Fox stated the Preservation Commission requested that the fence be brought forward at the previous meeting. Commissioner Reeds recommended the fence be set back ten (10) feet. Commissioner Shears agreed. Mr. Pat Fox stated City of Tulsa traffic engineering will evaluate the fence, and the applicant will be required to meet their criteria.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the application with the conditions to move the proposed fence as required to screen the view from adjacent property and in accordance with the traffic engineer's findings. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved by majority. Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.3.1, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3, G.2.4.1, G.2.4.2, G.2.4.3, G.3.1.

**Vote: 1715 S. Peoria Ave. (Swan Lake)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears	Neal		Grant
2. Craddock			
3. Schoell			
4. Pounds			
5. Turner			
6. McKee			
7. Snyder			
8. Reeds			
9. Birkes			

**2. HP-16-072 / 1401-1403 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Swan Lake)**

Applicant: The McIntosh Group for Timothy A. Inman and Lisa Blevins-Inman

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Request:

1. Demolish contributing structure

Commissioner Reeds recused himself from review of the application. Staff presented the application, and the applicant's representative, Bruce Horgen, was present. Mr. Horgen stated that rehabilitation of the building was economically unfeasible and it has differential settlement. The owners attempted to repair the first floor, but the instability of the building is located at the core. For the second and third floors, the only means of access is the exterior, spiral staircase, and it does not meet the Building Code.

Commissioner Neal asked Mr. Horgen if the building was demolished, what would be constructed in its place. Mr. Horgen replied it would be replaced with a 5-unit apartment complex, and the current 600 square foot units do not meet the market price per square foot. Commissioner Craddock asked Mr. Horgen if he had ordered an engineering assessment for the building. Mr. Horgen replied no. Commissioner Neal recommended the applicant conduct further research to see if demolition is the only option and if other solutions would be able to return an investment.

With the applicant's agreement, Commissioner Neal made a motion to continue review of the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: F.1.1.1, F.1.1.2, F.1.1.3.

**Vote: 1401-1403 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Swan Lake)**

<b><u>In Favor</u></b>	<b><u>Opposed</u></b>	<b><u>Abstaining</u></b>	<b><u>Not Present</u></b>
1. Shears			Grant
2. Craddock			Reeds
3. Schoell			
4. Pounds			
5. Turner			
6. McKee			
7. Neal			
8. Snyder			
9. Birkes			

**3. HP-16-070 / 1815 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Yorktown)**

Applicant: Biltmore Homes for Mary Ellen Slape

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: October 6, 2016*

Request:

1. Construct new single-family residence according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant, Aaron Sprik, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the HP Permit Subcommittee Report. Commissioner Neal recommended using smooth-lap siding instead of rough siding. Commissioner Schoell asked Mr. Sprik where the mechanical units will be located. Mr. Sprik replied there will be one unit located in the rear of the property directly off the master bedroom to hide it.

Commissioner Birkes made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: C.1.1, C.1.2, C.1.3, C.1.4, C.1.5, C.2.1, C.2.2, C.2.3, C.2.4, C.2.5, C.2.6, C.3.1, C.4.1, C.4.2, C.4.3, C.5.1, C.5.2, C.5.3.

**Vote: 1815 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Yorktown)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Grant
2. Craddock			
3. Schoell			
4. Pounds			
5. Turner			
6. McKee			
7. Neal			
8. Snyder			
9. Reeds			
10. Birkes			

**4. HP-16-073 / 1615 S. Norfolk Ave. (N. Maple Ridge)**

Applicant: Keith Kelly

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: October 6, 2016*

Request:

1. Construct two-tier retaining wall according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant, Keith Kelly, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the HP Permit Subcommittee Report. Commissioner Shears asked Mr. Kelly if the retaining wall will have a cap, and Mr. Kelly replied he was not sure. Commissioner Turner asked Mr. Kelly whether he considered a dry-stack construction, and he replied he looked at both options and preferred mortar. Commissioner Turner stated if stone is the preferred material, it should appear natural; and, if mortar is preferred, the material should be masonry. Commissioner Neal noted fewer joints will have less water penetration.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application with the condition that a matching stone cap is applied to cover the Concrete Masonry Unit. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Birkes and was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, G.1.3, G.1.5, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3.

**Vote: 1615 S. Norfolk Ave. (N. Maple Ridge)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Grant
2. Craddock			
3. Schoell			
4. Pounds			
5. Turner			
6. McKee			
7. Neal			
8. Snyder			
9. Reeds			
10. Birkes			

**5. HP-16-075 / 210 W. Golden St. (Brady Heights)**

Applicant: Cassandra Peters

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Request:

1. Construct new concrete walkway according to Site Plan submitted

Staff presented the application, and the applicant's husband, Jeremy Grodhaus, was present. Mr. Grodhaus stated when he looked at other side streets in the Brady Heights Historic District; the walkway only reached the sidewalk instead of the curb. Commissioner Turner asked Mr. Grodhaus why the width was seventy-two (72) inches when the width of the steps is seventy (70) inches. Mr. Grodhaus replied the reason for the width was allowance of more room for the walkway. Commissioner Shears asked Mr. Grodhaus if there will be a footing, and Mr. Grodhaus replied the footing will be anchored to the first step.

Commissioner Reeds made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the width of the walkway matches the riser width of seventy (70) inches at the foot of the steps. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3.

**Vote: 210 W. Golden St. (Brady Heights)**

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears			Grant
2. Craddock			
3. Schoell			
4. Pounds			
5. Turner			
6. McKee			
7. Neal			
8. Snyder			
9. Reeds			
10. Birkes			

**6. HP-16-074 / 1535 S. Gillette Ave. (Gillette)**

Applicant: DeWayne Corvin

*HP Permit Subcommittee Review Date: None*

Requests:

1. Replace ten (10) double-hung, wood windows with double-hung, aluminum-clad windows with wood interior
2. Replace existing siding on sunroom addition with HardiePlank Smooth-Lap Siding
3. Replace eight (8) storm windows on sunroom addition with three (3) double-hung, aluminum-clad windows with wood interior

*Work Completed without a Historic Preservation Permit*

Staff presented the application, and the applicant, DeWayne Corvin, was present. Mr. Corvin apologized to the Preservation Commission for failure to follow the appropriate process, but the siding was deteriorated and the awnings hid the light and character of the house. Mr. Corvin stated he attempted to find proper replacements for the windows and siding, but when the notice of the violation arrived, the work was immediately stopped. Commissioner Schoell expressed dissatisfaction with removal of original windows and asked Mr. Corvin what happened to the windows. Mr. Corvin stated they were thrown away.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds. The motion was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: A.2.1, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.2.4, A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.4, A.4.5, A.4.6, A.4.7.

**Vote:** 1535 S. Gillette Ave. (**Gillette**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Shears	Schoell		Grant
2. Craddock	McKee		
3. Pounds			
4. Turner			
5. Neal			
6. Snyder			
7. Reeds			
8. Birkes			

C. Reports

1. Chair Report - None
2. Staff Report
  - a. Staff Approvals – Staff stated they have not issued any staff approvals since the previous Regular Meeting.
  - b. Violations – Staff presented current violations.
  - c. Appeal – Board of Adjustment  
Staff reported that the Board of Adjustment had granted the appeal of the denial of the application for Historic Preservation Permit Number HP-16-056.
  - d. Reappointment – Staff announced and congratulated Commissioner Neal on his reappointment for another term as Architectural Historian.
  - e. Holiday Party – Staff requested that any Commissioner interested in planning the Holiday Party this year to contact Staff.
  - f. Meeting Schedule – Staff stated that at the forthcoming Regular Meeting they will discuss the meeting schedule and look at different options for next year.

D. New Business

None.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

Staff proposed that, in response to requests from several Commissioners, the topic of decorum be included on the agenda for the next Regular Meeting.

F. Adjournment

Chairman Shears adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:50 P.M.