



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, December 10, 2015, 11:00 AM

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor *South* Conference Room

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Pounds called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:09 AM.

Members Present

David Pounds, Chair
Robert Shears, Vice-Chair
David Schoell, Secretary
Charles Sottong
Susan McKee
Tom Neal
Jim Turner
Mike Craddock
EX-OF Ted Reeds

Members Absent

John Snyder
EX-OF Pam Deatherage

Staff Present

Kristin Pack, Roy Malcolm Porter, Jr., Travis Hulse, Bob Edmiston

Others Present

Randall Shelley, Kristin Daffern, Jeff Hoos, Robert Cleaver, Stacey Bayles,
Chad Osgood, Martha Phillips, Joshua Schultz, Bill Powers, Al Triggs, David
Parsons

2. Approval of Minutes from November 24, 2015.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

Vote: Meeting Minutes November 24, 2015.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds		Shears	Snyder
2. Schoell		Neal	
3. Craddock		Turner	
4. McKee			
5. Sottong			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
Commissioner Neal stated he knows the COA-15-61 applicant, David Parsons, and was asked to consult on the project; however, he referred the applicant to the Preservation staff.

B. Actionable Items

1. **COA-15-55 / 1603 S. Newport Ave.** (N. Maple Ridge)
Applicant: Randall Shelley for Orpha Harnish
COA Subcommittee Review Date: November 17, 2015
Request:
 1. Construct sunroom according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant's representative, Randall Shelley, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the COA Subcommittee report. Mr. Shelley provided the Commission an alternative drawing and stated the applicant will need a variance and that the drawing proposes an offset of the original design. Commissioner Reeds asked Mr. Shelley if he plans to extend the existing roof ridge and if the house has asbestos shingles. Mr. Shelley replied yes and added he plans to match the siding original to the house.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application with the conditions the sunroom addition is to be constructed full width as submitted or, based on variance requirements, constructed partial width as submitted. Commissioner Craddock seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3, B.4.1, B.4.2, E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4.

Vote: 1603 S. Newport Ave. (N. Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds 2. Shears 3. Schoell 4. Craddock 5. McKee 6. Neal 7. Sottong 8. Turner			Snyder

2. 1414 S. Galveston Ave. – McBirney Mansion Easement

Applicant: Chad Osgood for Wendy and Gentner Drummond

COA Subcommittee Review Date: December 3, 2015

Requests:

1. Combine two existing ponds and basin into a single new pond according to site plan submitted
2. Construct new retaining wall using native stone according to site plan submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant's representative, Chad Osgood, was present. Staff stated the Oklahoma Historical Society (OHS) has reviewed the three proposals including the flag pole, porte-cochère addition, and ponds. The Oklahoma Historical Society has approved the flag pole and porte-cochère addition, but OHS asked for more documentation for the proposal of the ponds and will rely on the Preservation Commission for its decision. The Oklahoma Historical Society has decided to disengage from future reviews, rely on the Preservation Commission for review of McBirney Mansion proposals, and confer with the Oklahoma State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) for technical assistance. In the future, determination of compliance with the easement and feasibility of projects will become the Preservation Commission's responsibility.

Mr. Osgood described the proposals for the ponds to the Preservation Commission. Commissioner Pounds asked Mr. Osgood if he had looked at the sightline from Riverside Drive. Mr. Osgood replied the retaining wall will be visible, but from Riverside Drive, one could not see the lower pond since there is a 4-5 feet elevation change between the road and pond. Commissioner Neal presented the COA Subcommittee report. Commissioners Neal and Shears asked for Mr. Osgood to provide more information including an elevation of the retaining wall. Commissioner Turner asked Mr. Osgood if the stone will match the existing stone. Mr. Osgood replied there is enough available native stone for the project, and the native stone will taper and hide the retaining wall. Commissioner Pounds asked the Commission if they are comfortable approving the concept

and voting on the final drawings when Mr. Osgood submits them. Commissioner Turner stated the applicant needs to provide either a rendering or a photograph, and Commissioner Shears stated a detail showing the distance between the larger and smaller pond would be needed.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the conceptual design with conditions for the applicant to submit a final design for approval, including an architectural rendering and elevations, to the Preservation Commission. Commissioner Turner seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Reference cited: *Deed of Scenic, Open Space, and Architectural Façade Easement*

Vote: McBirney Mansion Easement

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds 2. Shears 3. Schoell 4. Craddock 5. McKee 6. Neal 7. Sottong 8. Turner			Snyder

3. COA-15-56 / 1743 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

Applicant: Katelyn Parker for Martha Phillips

COA Subcommittee Review Date: December 3, 2015

Request:

1. Construct rear porch addition according to drawings submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Martha Phillips, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the COA Subcommittee report.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3, B.4.2.1.

Vote: 1743 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds			Snyder
2. Shears			
3. Schoell			
4. Craddock			
5. McKee			
6. Neal			
7. Sottong			
8. Turner			

4. **COA-15-57 / 1921 E. 17th Pl.** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Kristin Daffern for Richard Dowdell and Noreen McSherry

COA Subcommittee Review Date: December 3, 2015

Request:

1. Construct new west basement wall with smooth-face, CMU block
Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant's representative, Kristin Daffern, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the COA Subcommittee report.

Commissioner Shears asked Ms. Daffern what steps were taken to mitigate the water problem. Ms. Daffern replied, in addition to the new wall, a French drain and pump were installed. Commissioner Turner asked Ms. Daffern whether the new concrete block is waterproof. Ms. Daffern replied yes. Commissioner Neal asked Ms. Daffern how a permit was not pulled for the project. Ms. Daffern replied she now knows the project would require a repair permit, and the engineer stated it was not needed. When the footing was installed, Ms. Daffern asked the engineer about the inspection, and the engineer stated a permit was not required.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application with the condition the wall feature exterior elastomeric coating. Commissioner Turner seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: E.1.1, E.1.2, E.1.3, E.1.4, A.2.1, A.2.3, A.2.4.

Vote: 1921 E. 17th Pl. (Yorktown)

In Favor

1. Pounds
2. Shears
3. Schoell
4. Craddock
5. McKee
6. Neal
7. Sottong
8. Turner

Opposed

Abstaining

Not Present

Snyder

5. COA-15-58 / 1745 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Bill Powers for Price and Debbie Cleaver

COA Subcommittee Review Date: December 3, 2015 (Item 1 only)

Request:

1. Remove three non-original, screen windows on north elevation and replace with two paired vinyl windows with simulated divided light muntins to match existing windows
2. Replace original, wood windows with vinyl and casement vinyl windows with matching muntin patterns and trim

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Robert Cleaver, and the applicant's representative, Bill Powers, were present. Mr. Powers stated the owner decided to rescind the window replacement and put in wood windows with matching muntins. The owners would like to replace Window 6 on the Window Survey with wood windows with matching muntins, which are the same proposed windows for the utility room. Mr. Powers stated they would like to request the reconfiguration of the kitchen and breakfast room windows to accommodate the interior layout for the kitchen. Commissioner Neal presented the COA Subcommittee report. Commissioner Neal asked if the proposed windows will be similar in scale to those of the utility room. Mr. Powers replied yes. Mr. Powers requested to remove the non-original center picture window and replace with matching wood windows.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the following items:

- Remove three non-original, screen windows on north elevation and replace with two paired wood windows with simulated divided light muntins to match existing windows
- Remove and relocate two original breakfast room windows and one kitchen window and install wood windows with simulated divided light muntins to match existing windows
- Replace existing, non-original picture windows with wood windows on west elevation

- Replace three, non-original wood windows on southeast corner with wood windows with simulated divided light muntins to match existing windows

Commissioner Shears seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.4, A.4.5, A.4.6, A.4.7.

Vote: 1745 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds			Snyder
2. Shears			
3. Schoell			
4. Craddock			
5. McKee			
6. Neal			
7. Sottong			
8. Turner			

6. COA-15-60 / 1316 E. 19th St. (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Alicia Schultz

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Replace 12 original six-over-one wood window sashes on east elevation with 12 six-over-one vinyl window sashes with matching muntins

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Joshua Schultz, was present. Mr. Schultz stated the proposed windows can only be seen from an oblique angle from the public right of way and he wishes to repair the remaining original windows. Commissioner Neal stated the windows appear minimally damaged. Commissioner Turner asked if the proposed window will match the existing windows with the same muntin pattern. Mr. Schultz replied yes.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Sottong seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: A.4.1, A.4.2, A.4.4, A.4.5, A.4.6, A.4.7.

Vote: 1316 E. 19th St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds	Schoell		Snyder
2. Shears	McKee		
3. Craddock	Neal		
4. Sottong			
5. Turner			

7. COA-15-52 / 1740 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

Applicant: Jeff Selco for Jennifer Lorch

COA Subcommittee Review Dates: November 17/December 3, 2015

Request:

1. Construct gable dormers with six-over-one vinyl windows, clapboard siding, and asphalt shingles according to plans submitted
Completed Without a Certificate of Appropriateness

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant's contractor, Jeff Hoos, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the COA Subcommittee report. Commissioner Shears asked Commissioner Neal if there was a discussion about the dormer at the COA Subcommittee meeting. Commissioner Neal replied the dormer was already built and added there is an existing high pitch gable on the front elevation and lower pitch gable on the rear elevation.

Commissioner McKee made a motion to deny the application. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.3.3, B.4.1, B.4.2.1.

Vote: 1740 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds	Craddock	Neal	Snyder
2. Shears			Turner
3. Schoell			
4. McKee			
5. Sottong			

8. COA-15-61 / 1728 S. Madison Ave. (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: David Parsons

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Install new roof, including application of stucco to parapet-like elements

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicants, David Parsons and Al Triggs, were present. Mr. Parsons stated he would like to create consistency in the appearance of the house.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: B.3.1, B.3.2, B.3.3, A.5.1, A.5.2, A.5.3, A.5.4, A.5.5, A.5.6, A.5.7.

Vote: 1728 S. Madison Ave. (N. Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds			Snyder
2. Shears			Turner
3. Schoell			
4. Craddock			
5. McKee			
6. Neal			
7. Sottong			

C. Reports

A. Chair Report

Nomination Committee met prior to the regular meeting and nominated Commissioner Schoell for Secretary and Commissioner Craddock for Vice-Chair. According to Preservation Commission Rules and Regulations the former Vice-Chairman, Commissioner Shears, will be Chairman. Chairman Pounds opened the floor for additional nominations, and none were made.

Commissioner Pounds made a motion for the election of Commissioner Schoell as Secretary and Commissioner Craddock as Vice-Chairman for 2016. Commissioner Shears seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

Vote: Election of Commissioner Schoell as Secretary and Commissioner Craddock as Vice Chairman for 2016

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds			Snyder
2. Shears			Turner
3. Schoell			
4. Craddock			
5. McKee			
6. Neal			
7. Sottong			

Rules and Regulations revisions due to Zoning Code changes effective January 1, 2016, was continued until the next regular meeting.

Committee Reports
None.

B. Staff Report

Staff presented the staff approvals and announced Commissioner Shears was reappointed as Commissioner. Staff reminded the Commissioners no discussion of applications or items during the holiday party.

D. New Business

Chairman Pounds stated his final words as Chairman are, "Go Army, Beat Navy".

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

Violations of the Zoning Code and Strategies for mitigations

Staff proposal of an ad hoc committee to review Barnard Trace applications to ensure consistency

F. Adjournment

Chairman Pounds adjourned the Regular Meeting at 1:25 PM.