

# TUL/A PRE/ERVATION COMMISSION

# REGULAR MEETING MINUTES Thursday, September 10, 2015

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2<sup>nd</sup> Street 10th Floor North Conference Room

#### A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Pounds called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:01 am.

#### **Members Present**

David Pounds, Chair
David Schoell, Secretary
Charles Sottong
Susan McKee\*
Tom Neal
Jim Turner
Mike Craddock
John Synder\*
\*Late

#### **Members Absent**

Robert Shears, Vice-Chair EX-OF Ted Reeds EX-OF Pam Deatherage

#### **Staff Present**

Bob Edmiston, Kristin Pack, Travis Hulse, Roy Malcolm Porter, Jennifer Gates\*

#### **Others Present**

Beji Malek, Melissa Jackson, Paul Jackson, Steven Pittman, Craig Ziettlow, Lindsay Ziettlow, Bob Jackson, Mike Skaistis, Dani Widell, Miriam Young, Steven Kueny

2. Approval of Minutes from August 25, 2015.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

**Vote: Meeting Minutes August 25, 2015.** 

In FavorOpposedAbstainingNot Present1. PoundsTurnerShears2. Schoell

- Craddock
   Neal
- 5. Sottong
  - 4. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest Commissioner Craddock stated his company does multi-family sales, and he may have a connection with COA-15-46 and will recuse himself.

#### B. Actionable Items

1. **COA-15-22 / 2119 E. 17<sup>th</sup> PI.** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Mike Skaistis for Robert Jackson, Jr. COA Subcommittee Review Date: May 12, 2015

Request:

1. Replace non-original siding, and original redwood siding with TruWood, beveled edge, smooth lap siding

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Robert Jackson, Jr., was present. Commissioner Neal presented the COA Subcommittee report. The applicant provided samples of existing siding to the Commission and stated besides natural deterioration, the siding features splitting. The applicant stated he chose TruWood since he believes it the closest to the original siding and will not expand and contract.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Craddock seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.2.1, A.2.2, A.2.3, A.2.4.

Vote: 2119 E. 17<sup>th</sup> Pl. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u> <u>Opposed</u> <u>Abstaining</u> <u>Not Present</u>
1. Pounds Shears

- 2. Schoell
- 3. Craddock
- 4. McKee
- 5. Neal
- 6. Snyder
- 7. Sottona
- 8. Turner

## 2. COA-15-43 / 657 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Douglas Peck

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

 Install one (1) canvas awning over back door according to drawing submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant was not present. Commissioner Neal stated the awnings are appropriate whether the sides are closed or opened.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Snyder seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guideline cited: A.7.1.

Vote: 657 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	Not Present
1. Pounds		<del></del>	Shears

- 2. Schoell
- 3. Craddock
- 4. McKee
- 5. Neal
- 6. Snyder
- 7. Sottong
- 8. Turner

## 3. COA-15-40 / 1744 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

Applicant: Beji Malek

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Replace door with wood plank door submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Beji Malek, was present. The applicant stated she believed the existing door is not original since it is the only door of its kind in the neighborhood. The applicant stated the majority of the doors in the neighborhood are French or wood plank doors.

Commissioner Schoell stated the proposed door is more appropriate for a Spanish Revival or Italian Renaissance style. Commissioner Neal stated the door is overwrought for the house style, and the Tudor houses on the same street have simple versions of a wood plank door. Commissioner Pounds asked the Commission if the decorative grate is appropriate. Commissioner Neal agreed the decorative grate is appropriate. The applicant provided a door catalog to the Commission, and the Commission discussed various door options. The

Commission recommended the application be reviewed at the COA Subcommittee meeting with approval from the applicant. The applicant agreed.

Commissioner McKee made a motion to continue the application to the COA Subcommittee with approval from the applicant. Commissioner Schoell seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.3.1, A.3.2, A.3.3, A.3.4, A.3.5, A.3.8.

Vote: 1744 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	Not Present
1 Pounds			Shears

- 2. Schoell
- 3. Craddock
- 4. McKee
- 5. Neal
- 6. Snyder
- 7. Sottong
- 8. Turner

#### 4. **COA-15-42 / 1151 N. Cheyenne Ave.** (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Dani Widell

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

1. Reconstruct one column on front porch with matching brackets and remove two non-original support posts

Staff presented the proposal in the application to the Commission and the applicant, Dani Widell, was present. The applicant stated she believed the wood frame was a remnant of a screen porch that no longer exists. The applicant stated the porch roof is sagging and needs support, and the proposed column will be wood with stucco instead of concrete blocks with stucco.

Commissioner Turner restated the application proposal for clarification. The Commission discussed the flower bed and the porch. Commissioner Neal stated the column may have existed originally and was removed for the screen porch.

Commissioner Neal made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Snyder seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: A.6.1, A.6.2, A.6.4, A.6.5.

# Vote: 1151 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	Not Present
1. Pounds			Shears
2. Schoell			

- 3. Craddock
- 4. McKee
- 5. Neal
- 6. Snyder
- 7. Sottong
- 8. Turner

#### 5. **COA-15-29 / 1618 S. Rockford Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Miriam Young

COA Subcommittee Review Date: June 16, 2015 / Sept. 3, 2015 Request:

1. Enclose front porch with fixed, tempered glass windows, aluminum storm windows and aluminum storm doors

Staff presented the application to the Commission, and the applicant, Miriam Young, was present. Commissioner Neal presented the COA Subcommittee report.

Commissioner Snyder made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Craddock seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: B.1.1, B.1.2, B.1.3, B.1.4, B.5.2.

Vote: 1618 S. Rockford Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	Not Present
1. Pounds	Turner		Shears

- 2. Schoell
- 3. Craddock
- 4. McKee
- 5. Neal
- 6. Snyder
- 7. Sottong

#### 6. **COA-15-45 / 1767 S. St. Louis Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Craig Ziettlow

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

- Construct brick retaining wall and steps using brick to match the house according to plans submitted
- Construct curved entry with brick steps and bulkheads according to plans submitted
- 3. Install 4 ft. decorative iron fence with brick piers according to plans submitted

Staff presented the application to the Commission and the applicant, Craig Ziettlow, was present.

Commissioner Neal asked the applicant if the proposed retaining wall has a concrete cap. The applicant stated the retaining will not have a cap, and the brick will be custom made to match the house. Commissioner Turner asked the applicant if the concrete walkway will connect with the steps. The applicant replied yes. The applicant's contractor, Steven Kueny, stated the fence will follow the curve in the retaining wall in sectional pieces. The applicant's wife, Lindsay Ziettlow, stated the fence will have a slight curve to follow the retaining wall. Commissioner Turner asked the applicant if the ground will be flat or slope to the retaining wall. The applicant replied the ground will be flat. Commissioner Turner asked the applicant if the front entrance will be the only entrance. Mrs. Ziettlow stated there are existing wood steps in the back yard, and the steps will be replaced with brick steps.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Neal seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously. Guidelines cited: G.1.1, G.1.2, G.1.3, G.1.4, G.1.5, G.2.1, G.2.2, G.2.3.

Vote: 1767 S. St. Louis Ave. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	Not Present
1. Pounds	<u> </u>		Shears

- 2. Schoell
- 3. Craddock
- 4. McKee
- 5. Neal
- 6. Snyder
- 7. Sottong
- 8. Turner

#### 7. **COA-15-46(1) / 1529 S. Rockford Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Melissa and Paul Jackson for Landmark Rockford Plaza LLC COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

#### Request:

 Replace original wood windows with wood interior, aluminum-clad exterior windows

Work started without a Certificate of Appropriateness

#### **COA-15-46(2) / 1531 S. Rockford Ave.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Melissa and Paul Jackson for Landmark Rockford Plaza LLC COA Subcommittee Review Date: None Request:  Replace original wood windows with wood interior, aluminum-clad exterior windows

Work started without a Certificate of Appropriateness

# **COA-15-46(3) / 1507 E. 16<sup>th</sup> St.** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Melissa and Paul Jackson for Landmark Rockford Plaza LLC COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

#### Request:

 Replace original wood windows with wood interior, aluminum-clad exterior windows

Work started without a Certificate of Appropriateness

Staff corrected the original proposal to replace original wood windows with vinyl replacement windows. Staff presented the application to the Commission and the applicants, Melissa and Paul Jackson, were present. The applicant, Melissa Jackson, stated she believes they have met all the requirements as stated in the Unified Design Guidelines, and she brought her window contractor, Steven Pittman, to answer any questions.

Commissioner Neal notified the Commission he has completed work for CDK Distribution in the past, but believed it will not influence his decision. Commissioner Neal asked the applicants how the work began without starting the process of applying for a Certificate of Appropriateness. Mr. Jackson stated he only saw residential structures on the website and thought it did not apply to the apartment buildings. Commissioner Schoell whether asked they or the past owner had attempted to repair the windows. Mrs. Jackson stated they attempted repair for four years, and the previous owners applied cement to the sill. Mrs. Jackson stated the egress requirement in the Building Code requires the windows to open and have a screen, and, since each building is three stories, replacement allows all work be completed from the interior without scaffolds.

Commissioner Turner stated improvements are always beneficial, and vinyl windows are best option feasibly, but wood windows have a longer lifespan than vinyl windows. Commissioner Turner stated the Preservation Commission will review the windows in the future since the vinyl windows will deteriorate and will have to be replaced again. Mr. Pittman stated the vinyl windows have a 20 year warranty on the glass and lifetime warranty on the frame, and the windows will be 3.25 inches in width. The Commission discussed the lifetime of vinyl windows and glass.

Commissioner Neal stated most applications received by the Preservation Commission feature repairable windows, and this application might be an exception, but he is not sure about the vinyl windows. Commissioner Neal asked the contractor if the windows are removable. Mr. Pittman replied only the bottom sash is removable, and the window sets in the window jamb.

Commissioner Craddock made a motion to approve the application for the three properties. Commissioner Neal seconded the motion. The motion was approved by majority. Guidelines cited: A.4.1, A.4.4, A.4.5.

Vote: 1529 S. Rockford Ave. (Swan Lake)

1531 S. Rockford Ave. (Swan Lake)

1507 E. 16<sup>th</sup> St. (Swan Lake)

<u>In Favor</u>	<b>Opposed</b>	<u>Abstaining</u>	Not Present
1. Pounds	Schoell		Shears
2. Neal	McKee		
3. Snyder			
4 Sottona			

#### C. Reports

A. Chair Report

None

5. Turner

#### Committee Reports

Outreach Committee is moving forward with preparation for the education series and contacting speakers and organizations.

#### B. Staff Report

No staff approvals since the last regular meeting.

The Sinclair Building will be going to Sheriff's Sale on Tuesday, September 15. 2015.

#### D. New Business

Commissioner Craddock stated he contacted the County Assessor and Treasurer about providing notice to property owners in Historic Preservation Overlay Districts on the website and tax bills. Commissioner Craddock stated as of November 1, 2015, a line will be added to the disclosure form asking if the property is located in a HP Overlay District, and the disclosure form is signed by the new homeowner.

#### E. Announcement and Further Agenda Items

#### F. Adjournment

Chairman Pounds adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:36 pm.