



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

THURSDAY, MARCH 8, 2012, 11:00 a.m.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 E. 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

THE AGENDA FOR THIS MEETING WAS POSTED AT THE OFFICE OF THE TULSA CITY CLERK, 175 EAST SECOND STREET, TULSA, OKLAHOMA, IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE OPEN MEETING ACT, ON MARCH 6, 2012 AT 3:15 P.M.

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Bergman called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:00 a.m.

Members Present

Kristen Bergman, Chairman
Robert Shears, Vice-Chair
Susan McKee, Secretary
David Blackburn
Jack Hodgson
Barbara Smallwood
Mary Lee Townsend
Jim Turner

Members Absent

Matt King

Staff Present

Amanda DeCort, Attorney Bob Edmiston, Ed Sharrer, Monty McElroy

Others Present

Lynda Ozan and Glen Robersen, OK/SHPO; Herb Fritz and Tom Hess, Fritz Baily; Cathy Ambler; Chip Atkins, Swan Lake; Joe Dennis; Michael Reed; Arnold Schmidt and Jim Thorton; Laura Frossad; Kavin Ross; Rebecca Loper; Fallon Laire Dickson; Peter Doerr.

2. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes of February 28, 2012

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes for February 28, 2012. Commissioner Smallwood seconded.

Chairman Bergman called for a vote on the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Blackburn
3. Hodgson
4. McKee
5. Shears
6. Smallwood
7. Townsend
8. Turner

Opposed

None

Abstaining

None

Not Present

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

No one reported a conflict of interest with the proposals on the agenda.

B. Actionable Items

1. COA-12-008 / 1730 S. Quincy Avenue (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Arnold Schmidt

COA Subcommittee Review Date; March 1, 2012

Request:

Construct 5-unit townhouse project according to plans submitted.

Ed Sharrer presented Mr. Schmidt's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. Schmidt was present to answer questions. Mr. Fritz was present on Mr. Schmidt's behalf to answer questions.

Commissioner Turner offered comments and observations from the COA Subcommittee Report. The Subcommittee found the application to be complete and recommended approval.

Commissioner Turner noted that the project was of particular concern to the neighborhood. The applicant has made several submissions responding to numerous requests/suggestions from the Subcommittee. He gave a summary review of the Subcommittee's activities.

The Subcommittee voted 4-1-1 to approve the submission for the COA.

The Commission then discussed the project.

Questions were asked about guideline requirements specifically addressing garage doors.

Paving calculations were reviewed.

Staff was asked about guidelines regarding garages. Staff responded that there are no specific guidelines in Swan Lake for garages. Staff was asked its opinion whether the projects' presentation of the garage doors complied with the applicable guidelines. Staff answered: It does not.

The presence of secondary structures in the neighborhood was addressed with the observation that the subject property has no secondary structures proposed in the project.

The applicant pointed out that the subject property was zoned RM. As such uses become “awfully complicated”.

The owner of several properties in the neighborhood, including duplexes immediately to the south of the proposed project, stated his opinion that the garage doors as described by the applicant made the property “grossly out of proportion with the rest of the neighborhood.”

Another speaker reviewed the project, drawing attention to the guidelines and the failures and successes of the project to meet them.

Public comment was closed, after which the project was discussed among the Commissioners.

Commissioner McKee commented that the application is not consistent with what has been approved in the past and does not match the character of the existing neighborhood.

Commissioner Townsend questioned staff about prior commission history in the consideration of multi-family dwellings. Staff comments described proposed development for the area, but none with garages integrated into the front of the units.

Commissioner Smallwood commented upon the beauty of the project but has difficulty with the garages in the front.

Commissioner Townsend acknowledged the property’s zoning but stated that the submittal does not look like Swan Lake.

Comments were made among the Commissioners regarding zoning issues and the ability to reject the proposal if it satisfied zoning elements.

Commissioner Bergman stated that the Commission should look at all the issues – rhythm, setbacks, scale, everything.

Mr. Fritz stated that the proposal cannot be denied just because the Commission does not like it. He stated that if it meets zoning, there is no basis for denial. He stated that it doesn’t meet completely what everybody wants, but there is no basis for denial.

There were additional comments about the garages on the proposal differing from the existing neighborhood.

Additional comments directed at the proposed ribbon driveways were made pointing out the absence of similar driveways in the neighborhood.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. Commissioner Blackburn seconded the motion. Chairman Bergman asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1730 S. Quincy Avenue

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Blackburn	1. Bergman	None	
2. Turner	2. Hodgson		
	3. McKee		
	4. Shears		
	5. Smallwood		
	6. Townsend		

The motion failed. Swan Lake Guidelines cited and discussed: C1.0.1; C1.0.2; C1.0.3; C1.1.1; C1.1.2; C1.1.4; C1.2.1.; Swan Lake Guidelines not cited, but discussed: C1.1.3.

Commissioner McKee made a motion to deny the application. Commissioner Shears seconded the motion. Chairman Bergman asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1730 S. Quincy Avenue

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	1. Blackburn	None	
2. Hodgson	2. Turner		
3. McKee			
4. Shears			
5. Smallwood			
6. Townsend			

The motion to Deny was **Approved**. Swan Lake Guidelines cited and discussed: C1.0.1; C1.0.2; C1.0.3; C1.1.1; C1.1.2; C1.1.4; C1.2.1.; Swan Lake Guidelines not cited, but discussed: C1.1.3.

2. COA-12-009 / 916 North Cheyenne Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Raynece Million

COA Subcommittee Review Date: None

Request:

Replace damaged eight lite, paneled wood front door with paneled fiberglass door with arched upper lite.

Monty McElroy presented Ms. Million's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Ms. Million was unable to attend the meeting.

Commissioner Smallwood made a motion to deny the application. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion. Chairman Bergman asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1141 North Cheyenne Avenue

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	
2. Blackburn			
3. Hodgson			
4. McKee			
5. Shears			
6. Smallwood			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

The motion to Deny was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting. Brady Heights Guidelines cited: Restoring Existing Structures, Windows and Doors, Preferred Option, 1., Second Preference, 1.

3. Whittier Square Historic District Nomination

Cathy Ambler made a slide presentation to the Commission of the history of Whittier Square and the National Register nomination process.

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the nomination. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion. Chairman Bergman asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: Whittier Square Historic District Nomination

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	
2. Blackburn			
3. Hodgson			
4. McKee			
5. Shears			
6. Smallwood			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

4. Update to Rules and Regulations

Commissioner Townsend discussed the updates mentioning Section 7 has been streamlined and property definitions clarified.

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve. Commissioner Smallwood seconded the motion. Chairman Bergman asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: Update to Rules and Regulations

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	
2. Blackburn			
3. Hodgson			
4. McKee			
5. Shears			
6. Smallwood			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

C. Reports

1. Update on the Greenwood National Register Nomination

Lynda Ozan, OK/SHPO, is revising and condensing two nominations, as submitted, into one nomination. She discussed the area covered and how it follows the route traveled during the race riot from where it started downtown to the reconstructed commercial area north of the expressway. It will also take in a few non contiguous areas including Sunset and Standpipe Hills and the Armory. She has the history and architectural descriptions done, is now working on the verbal boundary descriptions for street patterns. She hopes to have project wrapped up by late summer so it can make it to a fall review.

2. Staff Report

Amanda DeCort gave an update on Historic Tax Credits. The Downtown Coordinating Council approved a resolution in support and the Brady Owners Association and Brady Arts District approved a letter of support as well. She is putting together a list of contact information specifically to Senators as the bills are waiting to be scheduled onto the Senate floor. Proponents of the credit are still working on it and trying to get a lobbyist hired.

3. Chair Report

No report.

4. Committee Reports

a) Rules & Regulations

No Report other than given in Actionable Item 4 above.

b) Outreach

No Report

c) Design Guidelines

No Report

D. New Business

Amanda DeCort reported that she was asked by the PlaniTulsa Small Area Planning Team if the TPC would appoint Commission Chairman Bergman to the Citizen Advisory Committee for the Utica Corridor Plan. Bob Edmiston suggested that an action be added to the next TPC agenda calling for a vote from the Commissioners to appoint Commissioner Bergman to the Citizen Advisory Committee.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

Add to next meeting agenda for Commission to vote to appoint Commissioner Bergman to the Citizen Commission. Also discuss TPC members acting in citizen roles.

F. Adjournment

Chairman Bergman adjourned the meeting at 12:41 p.m.

The proceedings of the Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting of March 8, 2012 were recorded. The meeting minutes were transcribed by Monty McElroy. Minutes approved by the TPC on March 27, 2012.