



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, April 26, 2011, 4:30 p.m.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 E. 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

THE AGENDA FOR THIS MEETING WAS POSTED AT THE OFFICE OF THE TULSA CITY CLERK, 175 EAST SECOND ST., TULSA OKLAHOMA, IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE OPEN MEETING ACT ON APRIL 25, 2011 AT 12:04 PM.

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman King called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:31 p.m.

Members Present

Matt King, Chairman
Kristen Bergman, Vice-Chair*
Robert Shears, Secretary
Charles Gilmore
Jack Hodgson
Susan McKee
Anne Pollard
Mary Lee Townsend
Jim Turner

Members Absent

Pamela Curtis
Barbara Smallwood

Staff Present

Patrick Boulden, Amanda DeCort, Ed Sharrer

* Arrived late

2. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes of April 14, 2011

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes for April 14, 2011 with no corrections. Commissioner Pollard seconded. Chairman King called for a vote on the motion. The motion was approved unanimously by members present.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Gilmore			
3. Hodgson			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			
9. Turner			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

No one reported a conflict of interest with the proposals on the agenda.

B. Actionable Items

1. COA-11-019 / 1606 S. Quincy Avenue (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Jeremy Perkins

Continued from April 14, 2011 Regular Meeting

Request: Modifications to front elevation according to plans submitted.

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Perkins' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. Perkins and his client, Mr. Benton, were present to answer questions.

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner McKee seconded the motion. Chairman King asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1606 S Quincy Avenue

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	1. Pollard	None
2. Gilmore			
3. Hodgson			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

The motion was **Approved by Majority** of members present and voting.
Swan Lake Guidelines cited: B1.0.1-B1.0.3, B1.2.1, B1.2.2, B1.3.2

2. **COA-11-020 / 1511 E. 21st Street** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: John Duvall

COA Subcommittee Review Date: April 19, 2011

Request: Construct 973 square foot addition to rear of house according to plans submitted.

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Duvall's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. Duvall was present to answer questions.

Commissioner Turner gave the COA Subcommittee report. The COA Subcommittee considered the application to be complete and recommended approval. Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Hodgson seconded the motion. Chairman King asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1511 E 21st Street

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Gilmore
3. Hodgson
4. King
5. McKee
6. Pollard
7. Shears
8. Townsend
9. Turner

Opposed

None

Abstaining

None

Not Present

None

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

Swan Lake Guidelines cited: B1.0.1-B1.0.3, B1.2.1, B1.2.2, B1.3.2

3. **COA-11-021 / 1763 S. Xanthus Avenue** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Martin R. Steinmetz

Request: Replace existing deteriorated railroad tie retaining wall with new cut-stone retaining wall according to plans submitted.

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Steinmetz' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. Steinmetz was not present.

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner McKee seconded the motion. Chairman King asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1763 S Xanthus Avenue

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Gilmore			
3. Hodgson			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			
9. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Yorktown Guidelines cited: B1.1.3

4. COA-11-022 / 1827 E. 17th Place (Yorktown)

Applicant: Kevin Pauli

Request, Part 1: Remove existing porch columns, not original to house, and replace with tapered columns.

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Pauli's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. Pauli was present to answer questions.

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve part 1 of the application with no conditions. Commissioner Pollard seconded the motion. Chairman King asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1827 E 17th Place, Part 1

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Gilmore			
3. Hodgson			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			
9. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Yorktown Guidelines cited: A1.0.1

Request, Part 2: Replace beadboard porch ceiling with paneled porch ceiling with recessed lighting and ceiling fan.

The Commission asked several questions pertaining to the design of the proposed ceiling modifications, specifically raising the ceiling by creating a tray. After discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deny part 2 of the application. Commissioner Gilmore seconded the motion. Chairman King asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1827 E 17th Place, Part 2

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Gilmore			
3. Hodgson			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			
9. Turner			

The motion to **Deny** the application was **Approved Unanimously**.
Yorktown Guidelines cited: A1.4.1, A1.4.2

Request, Part 3: Replace existing front door, not original to house, with 6-light Craftsman-style door.

Commissioner Bergman made a motion to approve part three of the application with no conditions. Commissioner McKee seconded the motion. Chairman King asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1827 E 17th Place, Part 3

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Gilmore			
3. Hodgson			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			
9. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Yorktown Guidelines cited: A1.0.1, A1.2.1, A1.2.3

Request, Part 4: Replace existing lap siding in gable end of front porch with shake shingles.

Commissioner Pollard made a motion to approve part four of the application with no conditions. Commissioner Gilmore seconded the motion. Chairman King asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1827 E 17th Place, Part 4

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Gilmore			
3. Hodgson			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			
9. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Yorktown Guidelines cited: A1.0.1

Request, Part 5: Apply stucco over existing brick piers, stem wall and bulkheads of front porch.

Commissioner Gilmore made a motion to approve part five of the application with the condition that the stucco shall be the same type used in the historic period of the house and have the same texture and look as the example cited by Mr. Pauli. Commissioner Pollard seconded the motion. Chairman King asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1827 E 17th Place, Part 5

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Gilmore	1. Bergman	None	None
	2. Hodgson		
	3. King		
	4. McKee		
	5. Pollard		
	6. Shears		
	7. Townsend		
	8. Turner		

The motion **failed**.

After further discussion, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deny part 5 of the application. Commissioner Gilmore seconded the motion. Chairman King asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1827 E 17th Place, Part 5

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Gilmore			
3. Hodgson			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			
9. Turner			

The motion to Deny the application was **Approved Unanimously**.
Yorktown Guidelines cited: A1.0.1

5. **COA-11-023 / 1128 E. 16th Street** (North Maple Ridge)
Applicant: Orpha Harnish
Work started prior to COA application
Request: Construct 4' wood fence in front yard.

Mr. Sharrer presented Ms. Harnish's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Ms. Harnish and her tenant, Mr. Rueb, were present to answer questions. The Commissioners felt as though the fence was in keeping with the ranch style of the home with the exception of the gate. Commissioner Gilmore made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the applicant return with an alternate design for the gate at the next TPC meeting. Commissioner McKee seconded the motion. Chairman King asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1128 E 16th Street

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	1. Turner	None
2. Gilmore			
3. Hodgson			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Townsend			

The motion was **Approved by Majority** of members present and voting.
North Maple Ridge Guidelines cited: B1.1.3

C. Reports

1. Staff Report

Ms. DeCort reported that Preservation Leadership Training/Advanced class is coming to Tulsa in August. She asked that any Commissioners interested in attending to please contact her.

Ms. DeCort reported that the bids for the Greenwood Historic District National Register Nomination came in much higher than anticipated. Should the City not be able to award the bid, the Commission will need to expend the approximately \$10,000 allocated for the project before September 30 to comply with its grant requirements. Ms. DeCort offered some projects for consideration and promised to report back on the status of the bids.

Mr. Sharrer reported that, based on the City Council Committee meeting he watched on TGOV that morning, the City Council plans to vote on an amendment to the Planned Unit Development (PUD) section of the Zoning Code at its Regular Meeting this Thursday, April 28. This issue was last before the TPC in December 2010 prior to the Tulsa Metropolitan Area Planning Commission public hearing, at which time that board voted not to recommend changes to the Zoning Code. TPC staff reported that the Tulsa Preservation Commission and its staff were not notified of the pending action by Council, nor asked to participate or comment.

2. Chair Report

Chairman King reported that Commissioner Curtis has resigned her position.

3. Committee Reports

a. Rules & Regulations

Commissioner Gilmore reported that the committee has approved a draft of the revised Rules & Regulations and will present it for Commission review in May.

b. Outreach

Commissioner Bergman reported that the committee is coordinating two separate trolley tours for realtors, one in May and one in June.

c. Design Guidelines

Commissioner Bergman reported that the Design Guidelines committee is continuing its work and should have a draft of the updated guidelines to share with the Commission in May.

D. New Business

None.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None.

F. Adjournment

Chairman King adjourned the meeting at 6:26 p.m.

The proceedings of the Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting of April 26, 2011 were recorded. The meeting minutes were transcribed by Ed Sharrer. Minutes approved by the TPC on May 12, 2011.