



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, November 23, 2010, 4:30 p.m.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 E. 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

THE AGENDA FOR THIS MEETING WAS POSTED AT THE OFFICE OF THE TULSA CITY CLERK, 175 EAST SECOND ST., TULSA OKLAHOMA, IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE OPEN MEETING ACT ON NOVEMBER 19, 2010 AT 11:41 AM.

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Sober called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:30 p.m.

Members Present

Bob Sober, Chairman
Matt King, Vice-Chairman*
Kristen Bergman, Secretary
Pamela Curtis
Charles Gilmore
Jack Hodgson
Susan McKee
Anne Pollard
Barbara Smallwood
Mary Lee Townsend
Jim Turner

Members Absent

Robert Shears
Bob Winchester
Elizabeth Wright

Staff Present

Patrick Boulden, Amanda DeCort, Ed Sharrer
* Arrived late

2. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes of November 9, 2010

Commissioner Smallwood made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes for November 9, 2010 with corrections to Item 2.B per Commissioner McKee's request. Commissioner Curtis seconded. Chairman Sober called for a vote on the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Gilmore
4. Hodgson
5. King
6. McKee
7. Pollard
8. Smallwood
9. Sober
10. Townsend

Opposed

None

Abstaining

1. Turner

Not Present

None

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

No one reported a conflict of interest with the proposals on the agenda.

B. Actionable Items

1. COA-10-036 / 2223 E. 19th Street (Yorktown)

Applicant: Janet Kellogg

Application Date: November 23, 2010

Request: Remove existing concrete front steps with new brick steps to correct uneven risers. Brick will match existing porch stem wall. Replace existing 4' concrete walk and steps leading to driveway with new 5' brick walk and steps.

Mr. Sharrer presented Ms. Kelloggs' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Ms. Kellogg was present to answer questions.

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Smallwood seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 2223 E. 19th Street, Kellogg

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Townsend			
11. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Yorktown Guidelines cited: A.1.4.1, A.1.4.2

2. **COA-10-037 / 210 W. Golden Street** (Brady Heights)
Applicants: Cassandra Peters & Jeremy Grodhaus
Application Date: November 23, 2010

Request, Part 1: Install single-lite wood awning window in north dormer.

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 1 of the Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. Grodhaus was present for questions. Commissioner King made a motion to approve part 1 of the application with no conditions. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 210 W. Golden Street, Part 1

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Townsend			
11. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Brady Heights Guidelines cited: General Requirements

Request, Part 2: Replace existing, non-original front door with new 1-lite wood Craftsman door. Existing sidelights to remain.

Mr. Sharrer presented part 2 of the Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Commissioner Smallwood made a motion to approve part 2 of the application with no conditions. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 210 W. Golden Street, Part 2

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Townsend			
11. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting. Brady Heights Guidelines cited: General Guidelines

Request, Part 3: Install new front porch light fixture, 14" x 10.5".

Mr. Sharrer presented part 3 of the Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve part 3 of the application with no conditions. Commissioner Pollard seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 210 W. Golden Street, Part 3

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Townsend			
11. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Brady Heights Guidelines cited: General Guidelines

Request, Part 4: Repair/replace elements of front porch, including new tongue and groove flooring, beaded-board ceiling, and new Craftsman-style balustrade, according to plans submitted.

Mr. Sharrer presented part 4 of the Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Commissioner Gilmore made a motion to approve part 4 of the application with no conditions. Commissioner McKee seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 210 W. Golden Street, Part 4

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Townsend			
11. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Brady Heights Guidelines cited: Porches, Preferred Option, 1-2, Second Preference, 1

3. **COA-10-038 / 315 E. 20th Street** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicants: Kristi & Stan Prough

Application Date: November 16, 2010

Request: Construct a 310 square foot (20'7 x 15'2) one-story addition on northeast corner of house according to plans submitted.

Mr. Sharrer presented the Proughs' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Ms. Prough and her builder, Bill Powers, were present to answer questions.

Commissioner King made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 315 E. 20th Street

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Townsend			
11. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

North Maple Ridge Guidelines cited: B1.0.1 - B1.0.3, B1.2.1, B1.2.2, B1.3.2

4. **COA-10-039 / 1616 S. Troost Avenue** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Matt Gomez

Application Date: November 23, 2010

Work completed prior to COA application

Request: Replace deteriorated front porch with new front deck, 10' x 20', with 30" railing and 2" x 2" balusters.

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Gomez's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. Gomez was present to answer questions.

After the presentation, the discussion centered around whether the deck that had been constructed was appropriate for the district. The deck protruded

more than 2 feet past the dimensions of the previously existing porch on two sides of the construction.

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deny the application due to the construction being incompatible with the design guidelines for the neighborhood. Commissioner Curtis seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1616 S Troost Avenue

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	1. Turner	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Townsend			

The motion to deny was **Approved by Majority** of members present and voting.
Swan Lake Guidelines cited: A1.4.1, A1.4.2

5. COA-10-040 / 1520 S. Newport Avenue (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Debra Grimm

Application Date: November 23, 2010

Request: Replace existing deteriorated concrete slab driveway with new concrete ribbon driveway of 27" wide paving strips.

Mr. Sharrer presented Ms. Grimm's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Ms. Grimm was not present. Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Pollard seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1520 S. Newport Avenue

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Townsend			
11. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
North Maple Ridge Guidelines cited: B1.1.2

6. COA-10-041 / 1014 N. Cheyenne Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: David R. Smith

Application Date: November 23, 2010

Request: Install wooden hand rail at steps to city sidewalk according to plans submitted.

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Smith's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. Smith was not present. Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deny the application. Commissioner Pollard seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1014 N. Cheyenne Avenue

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Townsend			
11. Turner			

The motion to deny was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Brady Heights Guidelines cited: Additions, Building Site, 3

7. Proposed Amendment to Historic Preservation Ordinance Update regarding Historic Property Owners and HP Zoning Districts (Implementation Committee)

Commissioner Smallwood proposed an amendment to the TPC's requested changes to the Historic Preservation Ordinance. In the section describing the membership requirements for Historic Property Owners, she suggested adding language that would require one of the four owners live in an HP-zoned neighborhood in order to ensure the Commission always has representation from the HP-zoned districts.

After discussion, Commissioner Smallwood made a motion to add the proposed amendment to the TPC's requested ordinance changes. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: Proposed Amendment to Historic Preservation Ordinance Update

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Townsend			
11. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

8. Amendment to Rules of Procedure (Rules & Regulations Committee)

Commissioner Gilmore proposed an amendment of the Commission's Rules and Regulations. The proposal would strike the words "votes cast" and replace them with the word "Owners" in the last sentence of paragraph three, Article VII, Section 5. This amendment would make the language consistent within that section of the Rules and Regulations.

After discussion, Commissioner Gilmore made a motion in favor of the proposed amendment to the Rules and Regulations. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: Amendment to Rules of Procedure

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Townsend			
11. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

9. Report to Planning Commission about Proposed Amendment to Planned Unit Development Section of Zoning Code (Legal)

Mr. Boulden provided an update on the Tulsa Metropolitan Area Planning Commission's (TMAPC) proposal to amend the Planned Unit Development (PUD) section of the Zoning Code. First, Mr. Boulden explained how a PUD works and how it allows uses (residential, commercial, parking) to be reallocated between lots within the boundaries of a PUD.

The TMAPC proposal would amend the Zoning Code to not allow uses to be reallocated via the PUD process to lots that have Historic Preservation Overlay Zoning. For example, reallocating parking to a residentially-zoned lot in an HP zoned neighborhood would no longer be permitted via the PUD process.

Mr. Boulden reported that the TMAPC will hold a public hearing on the proposed amendment on Tuesday, December 7. Once that hearing has taken place, the TMAPC is required to report its findings to the City Council within 30 days. The TMAPC has the option to continue the hearing as well.

Ms. DeCort reported that TMAPC Chair Michelle Cantrell has asked the TPC to review and submit its collective opinion on the proposed amendment to the TMAPC via letter or report.

Commissioner Gilmore suggested that the TPC's report be worded to state that the proposed amendment "may be one solution to address the issues in protecting the boundaries of HP Zoned neighborhoods, and that there may be other solutions to consider."

After further discussion, Commissioner Gilmore made a motion to submit a report to the TMAPC using his proposed language. Commissioner King seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: Report to Planning Commission about Proposed Amendment to Planned Unit Development Section of Zoning Code

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. Hodgson			
5. King			
6. McKee			
7. Pollard			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Townsend			
11. Turner			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

C. Reports

1. Staff/Legal Report

Ms. DeCort reported that she met with a group of Greenwood Avenue merchants to discuss a possible National Register Nomination for the Greenwood district.

Mr. Boulden reported on the proposed Historic Preservation Ordinance changes that will appear in front of City Council at their committee meetings on November 30. He has written the ordinance amendment to be effective as of February 1, 2011. Regarding the membership configuration, Mr. Boulden crafted a phased-in approach to reducing the number of Commissioners. As of the effective date of February 1, the number of Professional members would be reduced by two and the ex-officio members would become non-voting. The Commission would be 11 voting members plus two non-voting members as of February 1.

The ordinance calls for all Commissioner terms to expire on October 1, 2011 so that the terms can be staggered. Mr. Boulden wrote the amendment so that the Commission would be reduced to the desired 9 voting members at that time. The ordinance changes call for the number of Historic Property Owners to be reduced from 6 to 4, which would be easiest achieved during the

wholesale reappointment process. The Commission agreed that was the fairest approach to restructuring the membership configuration and complimented Mr. Boulden's work.

2. Chair Report

Chairman Sober reported that he and the nominating committee, composed of Commissioners King, Smallwood, Turner and Townsend, met to nominate officers for 2011. He is happy to report that the committee has nominated Kristen Bergman for Vice Chair and Robert Shears for Secretary. Election of officers will take place at the December 9th meeting.

3. Committee Reports

No reports.

D. New Business

None.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

Commissioner Hodgson announced that Commissioner Pollard is the President Elect for the MLS, to be effective in the New Year. Commissioner Pollard announced that Ms. DeCort completed her first marathon the previous weekend.

F. Adjournment

Chairman Sober adjourned the meeting at 6:36 p.m.

The proceedings of the Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting of November 23, 2010 were recorded. The meeting minutes were transcribed by Ed Sharrer. Minutes approved by the TPC on December 9, 2010.