



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, October 14, 2010, 11:00 a.m.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 E. 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

THE AGENDA FOR THIS MEETING WAS POSTED AT THE OFFICE OF THE TULSA CITY CLERK, 175 EAST SECOND ST., TULSA OKLAHOMA, IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE OPEN MEETING ACT ON OCTOBER 12, 2010 AT 4:47 PM.

A. Opening Matters

1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Sober called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:10 a.m.

Members Present

Bob Sober, Chairman*
Matt King, Vice-Chairman
Kristen Bergman, Secretary
Charles Gilmore*
Jack Hodgson
Susan McKee*
Jim Turner
Elizabeth Wright

Members Absent

Pamela Curtis
Anne Pollard
Robert Shears
Barbara Smallwood
Mary Lee Townsend
Bob Winchester

Staff Present

Patrick Boulden, Amanda DeCort, Ed Sharrer

* Arrived late

2. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes of September 28, 2010

Commissioner King made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes for September 28, 2010. Commissioner Turner seconded. Chairman Sober called for a vote on the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

In Favor

- 1. Gilmore
- 2. Hodgson
- 3. King
- 4. Sober
- 5. Turner

Opposed

None

Abstaining

- 1. Bergman
- 2. Wright

Not Present

- 1. McKee

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest

No one reported a conflict of interest with the proposals on the agenda.

B. Actionable Items

1. COA-10-029 / 1708 S. Newport Avenue (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Brendan McKnight

Application Date: October 14, 2010

Request: Restore front patio to original historic appearance by constructing decorative stucco walls and piers according to photographic evidence.

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. McKnight's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. McKnight was present to answer questions.

Commissioner Wright made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner King seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1708 S. Newport Avenue

In Favor

- 1. Bergman
- 2. Gilmore
- 3. Hodgson
- 4. King
- 5. Sober
- 6. Turner
- 7. Wright

Opposed

None

Abstaining

None

Not Present

- 1. McKee

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
North Maple Ridge Guidelines cited: A1.0.2

2. **COA-10-030 / 1507-1509 S. Gillette Avenue** (Gillette)

Applicant: Howard Carpenter

Application Date: October 14, 2010

Work started prior to COA application

Request: Replace existing deteriorated 6/1 wood windows with new 6/1 vinyl windows.

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Carpenter’s Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. Carpenter was not present.

Commissioner King made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Gilmore seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1507-1509 S. Gillette Avenue

In Favor

- 1. Bergman
- 2. Gilmore
- 3. Hodgson
- 4. King
- 5. McKee
- 6. Sober
- 7. Turner
- 8. Wright

Opposed

None

Abstaining

None

Not Present

None

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Gillette Guidelines cited: A1.2.1, A1.2.3, A1.2.4

3. **COA-10-031 / 1763 S. Xanthus Avenue** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Martin R. Steinmetz

Application Date: October 14, 2010

Request: Remove existing deteriorated railroad tie retaining wall and construct new stucco retaining wall according to plans submitted.

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Steinmetz’s Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. Steinmetz was not present.

After the presentation, several Commissioners expressed concerns over the selection of stucco as the finish material for the proposed wall since the historic retaining walls on that block of South Xanthus Avenue are all stone. Further analysis of the broader Yorktown district found over 20 native stone retaining walls and only one stucco retaining wall.

Commissioner Gilmore made a motion to deny the application and requested staff pass along to Mr. Steinmetz the Commission's concerns over the stucco material. Commissioner King seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1763 S. Xanthus Avenue

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Gilmore			
3. Hodgson			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Sober			
7. Turner			
8. Wright			

The motion to deny was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting. Yorktown Guidelines cited: B1.1.3

4. COA-10-032 / 1628 S. Victor Avenue (Yorktown)

Applicant: Travis Smith

Application Date: October 14, 2010

Request: Install vintage light fixture at front entry.

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Smith's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. Smith was not present.

Commissioner Wright made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner King seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1708 S. Newport Avenue

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Gilmore	1. Bergman	None	None
2. Hodgson			
3. King			
4. McKee			
5. Sober			
6. Turner			
7. Wright			

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting. Yorktown Guidelines cited: A1.0.1

C. Presentations and Reports

1. Discussion on Requirements for HP Zoning District Applications

Speaker: Clayton Vaughn

Mr. Vaughn thanked the Commission for hearing his concerns regarding the process that neighborhoods must follow when requesting HP Zoning from the City of Tulsa. Mr. Vaughn, a resident of the Sunset Park addition of the Maple Ridge Historic District, noted that in order for the TPC to recommend to the Tulsa Metropolitan Area Planning Commission that an HP Zoning Overlay be granted to an area, at least 60% of the property owners must return a ballot in favor of the zoning change. In the hypothetical case of 150 properties considering HP Zoning, 90 “yes” ballots must be submitted to meet the requirements.

Mr. Vaughn expressed his objection to this requirement – that non-responses have the same effect as a “no” vote, which he believes is “undemocratic”. He noted that in all other elections, only the votes cast are counted. Mr. Vaughn believes that non-responses should not be counted when gauging neighborhood interest in HP Zoning. Additionally, he believes that an option to “abstain” should not be provided on the ballots mailed to homeowners.

Commissioner Townsend suggested that some minimum percentage of the affected property owners should return a ballot in order to effectively gauge neighborhood interest in the proposed zoning change.

Chairman Sober asked Rules and Regulations Committee Chairman Charlie Gilmore to hold a meeting to discuss the requirements in question and come back to the full Commission with recommendations.

2. Staff Report

Ms. DeCort reported that the Brady Historic District has officially been listed in the National Register of Historic Places, the first such district in downtown Tulsa. She also noted the Casa Loma Hotel was listed in the National Register. Ms. DeCort circulated the 2011 Meeting Schedule and a planning calendar of CLG requirement deadlines. She also recapped various outreach efforts, including the HP Zoning notification postcard that was mailed last month.

3. Chair Report

Chairman Sober reported that a Memorandum of Consensus was forwarded from the City Council to the Mayor’s Office requesting a small area plan for the Utica Avenue corridor. He also noted the need to follow up on the progress of the request for a study of the Zoning Code relating to the boundaries of HP Zoning districts.

4. Committee Reports

Rules and Regulations Committee Chairman Gilmore noted the politically sensitive nature of neighborhoods requesting HP Zoning. Therefore, he believes that TPC Staff should notify the appropriate City Councilor of any HP Zoning efforts by neighborhoods in their district.

Outreach Committee Chairman Bergman reported that her committee would not meet next week as regularly scheduled.

D. New Business

None.

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None.

F. Adjournment

Chairman Sober adjourned the meeting at 12:28 p.m.

The proceedings of the Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting of October 14, 2010 were recorded. The meeting minutes were transcribed by Ed Sharrer. Minutes approved by the TPC on October 26, 2010.