



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, July 27, 2010, 4:30 p.m.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 E. 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

THE AGENDA FOR THIS MEETING WAS POSTED AT THE OFFICE OF THE TULSA CITY CLERK, 175 EAST SECOND ST., TULSA OKLAHOMA, IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE OPEN MEETING ACT ON JULY 22, 2010 AT 3:26 PM.

1. Roll Call – Chairman Sober called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:30 p.m.

Members Present

Bob Sober, Chair
Matt King, Vice-Chair
Kristen Bergman, Secretary
Pamela Curtis
Charles Gilmore*
Jack Hodgson
Susan McKee
Robert Shears
Mary Lee Townsend*
Jim Turner*
Bob Winchester
Elizabeth Wright*

Members Absent

Anne Pollard
Barbara Smallwood
Paula Wood

Staff Present

Patrick Boulden, Amanda DeCort
* Arrived late

2. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes of July 8, 2010

Commissioner Winchester made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes for July 8, 2010. Commissioner Curtis seconded. Chairman Sober called for a vote on the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Hodgson
4. King
5. McKee
6. Sober
7. Winchester

Opposed

None

Abstaining

1. Shears

Not Present

1. Gilmore
2. Townsend
3. Turner
4. Wright

3. Committee Reports

A. Historic Preservation Committee

i. Announcement of Conflict of Interest

Commissioner King reported to having a conflict of interest with the first application on the agenda and recused himself from the discussion and vote on the application.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

1. 1342 E. 18th Street (Swan Lake)

Applicants: Pierce & Kristi Tranum

Request, Part I: Remove vinyl siding from entire house & replace with Hardie siding product in pattern matching original siding (lap or shake). Restore window casing and trim details based on shadow lines of original casing & trim.

Ms. DeCort presented Part 1 of the Tranums' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. The Tranums' architect, Bill Caylor, was present to answer questions.

Commissioner Hodgson gave the COA Subcommittee report. The COA Subcommittee considered the application to be complete and recommended approval. Commissioner Hodgson made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1342 E 18th Street, Part I

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Gilmore
4. Hodgson
5. McKee
6. Shears
7. Sober
8. Townsend
9. Turner
10. Winchester
11. Wright

Opposed

None

Abstaining

None

Not Present

1. King

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Swan Lake Guidelines cited: A1.0.1, A1.0.2, A1.1.4

1342 E. 18th Street (Swan Lake)

Applicants: Pierce & Kristi Tranum

Request, Part II: Remove existing one-story shed-roof addition on east elevation. Construct two-story gambrel-roof addition (21' x 19') on east elevation according to plans submitted. Windows will be clad wood 1/1 double hung windows to match original windows. Siding will match new siding installed on main house and window trim will match restored trim details (part I).

Ms. DeCort presented Part 2 of the Tranums' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district.

Commissioner Hodgson gave the COA Subcommittee report. The COA Subcommittee considered the application to be complete and recommended approval. Commissioner Hodgson made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Wright seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1342 E 18th Street, Part II

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Gilmore
4. Hodgson
5. McKee
6. Shears
7. Sober
8. Townsend
9. Turner
10. Winchester
11. Wright

Opposed

None

Abstaining

None

Not Present

1. King

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

Swan Lake Guidelines cited: B1.0.1 – B1.0.3, B1.1.1, B1.1.2, B1.2.1, B1.2.2, B1.3.2

1342 E. 18th Street (Swan Lake)

Applicants: Pierce & Kristi Tranum

Request, Part III: Modify front entry roof overhang according to plans submitted.

Ms. DeCort presented Part 3 of the Tranums' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district.

Commissioner Hodgson gave the COA Subcommittee report. The COA Subcommittee considered the application to be complete and recommended approval. Commissioner Hodgson made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Curtis seconded the motion.

Commissioner Gilmore asked Mr. Caylor if the pitch or depth of the roof overhang would change to accommodate the new section. Mr. Caylor said that it would not. A photograph showing a different perspective was presented.

Commissioner Turner stated that he would not vote for approval because he was not convinced that the front entry to be removed was a later addition to the home. Commissioner Turner stated that he would like the applicants to find physical evidence of what was originally there.

Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1342 E 18th Street, Part III

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Curtis	1. Bergman	1. Turner	1. King
2. Shears	2. Gilmore		
3. Sober	3. Hodgson		
4. Townsend	4. McKee		
5. Winchester	5. Wright		

The motion failed.

2. 1522 S. Victor Avenue (Yorktown)

Applicant: Chris Bumgarner

Request: Demolition of house on lot.

Ms. DeCort presented Mr. Bumgarner's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for demolition for this district. Mr. Bumgarner was present.

Commissioner King made a motion to deem the application complete and approve the application under Swan Lake Guideline F.1.0.2, because the property is listed as non-contributing to the district in the National Register Nomination Report. Commissioner Winchester seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1522 S. Victor Avenue | Chris Bumgarner

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	1. Curtis	None	None
2. Gilmore	2. McKee		
3. Hodgson	3. Shears		
4. King	4. Sober		
5. Winchester	5. Townsend		
	6. Turner		
	7. Wright		

The motion failed.

Since the application had previously been deemed incomplete by the Commission at the July 8th TPC meeting, Attorney Boulden was asked if they could continue discussion of the application. Discussion about

requirements for a complete application ensued. Mr. Bumgarner stated that he has submitted the exact same application form and information to the TPC in the past and they have never been considered incomplete. Commissioner Winchester made a motion to deem the application complete. Commissioner King seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1522 S. Victor Avenue | Chris Bumgarner

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	1. Curtis	1. Townsend	None
2. Gilmore	2. McKee		
3. Hodgson	3. Shears		
4. King	4. Turner		
5. Sober	5. Wright		
6. Winchester			

The motion failed for lack of majority of members present and voting.

Discussion continued. Attorney Boulden advised the Commission to take action on the information as presented. Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deem the application complete and deny the application for demolition. Commissioner Gilmore seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1522 S. Victor Avenue | Chris Bumgarner

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Curtis	1. Bergman	1. Turner	1. Winchester
2. Shears	2. Gilmore		
3. Sober	3. Hodgson		
4. Townsend	4. King		
5. Wright	5. McKee		

The motion failed.

By procedure, the previously failed motion could not be voted upon again without an approved motion to reconsider. Commissioner Gilmore made a motion to reconsider the motion to deem the application complete and deny the application. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1522 S. Victor Avenue | Chris Bumgarner

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Gilmore
4. Hodgson
5. King
6. McKee
7. Shears
8. Sober
9. Townsend
10. Turner
11. Wright

Opposed

None

Abstaining

None

Not Present

1. Winchester

The motion to reconsider was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

Commissioner Gilmore then made a motion to deem the application complete and deny the application. Commissioner Townsend seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1522 S. Victor Avenue | Chris Bumgarner

In Favor

1. Curtis
2. Gilmore
3. McKee
4. Shears
5. Sober
6. Townsend
7. Wright

Opposed

1. Bergman
2. Hodgson
3. King

Abstaining

1. Turner

Not Present

1. Winchester

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.
Swan Lake Guidelines cited: F1.0.1, F1.0.2

3. 1721 E. 16th Street (Yorktown)

Applicant: Chris Bumgarner

Request: Demolition of house on lot.

Ms. DeCort presented Mr. Bumgarner's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for demolition for this district. Mr. Bumgarner was present. Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deem the application complete and deny

the application for demolition. Commissioner Wright seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1721 E. 16th Street | Chris Bumgarner

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Gilmore
4. Hodgson
5. King
6. McKee
7. Shears
8. Sober
9. Townsend
10. Wright

Opposed

None

Abstaining

1. Turner

Not Present

1. Winchester

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.
Swan Lake Guidelines cited: F1.0.1

4. Staff Report

The staff report was distributed to the Commission prior to the meeting.

5. New Business

None.

6. Adjournment

Chairman Sober adjourned the meeting at 5:45 p.m.

The proceedings of the Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting of July 27, 2010 were recorded. The meeting minutes were transcribed by Amanda DeCort and Ed Sharrer. Minutes approved by the TPC on August 12, 2010.