



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, April 8, 2010, 11:00 a.m.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 E. 2nd Street
10th Floor North Conference Room

THE AGENDA FOR THIS MEETING WAS POSTED AT THE OFFICE OF THE TULSA CITY CLERK, 175 EAST SECOND ST., TULSA OKLAHOMA, IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE OPEN MEETING ACT ON APRIL 7, 2010 AT 10:43 AM.

1. **Roll Call** – Chairman Sober called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:01 a.m.

Members Present

Bob Sober, Chair
Matt King, Vice-Chair
Kristen Bergman, Secretary
Pamela Curtis
Charles Gilmore
Susan McKee
Anne Pollard
Robert Shears
Barbara Smallwood
Jim Turner*
Bob Winchester
Elizabeth Wright*

Members Absent

Jack Hodgson
Mary Lee Townsend
Paula Wood

Staff Present

Patrick Boulden, Amanda DeCort, Ed Sharrer
* Arrived late

2. **Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes of March 11, 2010**

Commissioner Smallwood made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes for March 11, 2010. Commissioner Winchester seconded. Chairman Sober called for a vote on the motion. The motion was approved by majority.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	1. King	1. Turner
2. Curtis			2. Wright
3. Gilmore			
4. McKee			
5. Pollard			
6. Shears			
7. Smallwood			
8. Sober			
9. Winchester			

Approval of Special Meeting Minutes of March 25, 2010

Commissioner Bergman made a motion to approve, with grammatical corrections, the Special Meeting Minutes for March 25, 2010. Commissioner King seconded. Chairman Sober called for a vote on the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	1. Turner
2. Curtis			2. Wright
3. Gilmore			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Winchester			

3. Committee Reports

A. Historic Preservation Committee

i. Announcement of Conflict of Interest

No one responded to having a conflict of interest with any of the proposals on the agenda.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

- 1617 S. St. Louis Avenue** (Swan Lake)
Withdrawn by applicant.

- 1702 S. Rockford Avenue** (Swan Lake)
Applicants: Sylvia & Tom Brown
Request: Remove all existing storm windows from second story room on west elevation and enclose with 4" Hardieboard lap siding and ten

3/1 jailhouse-pattern, clad wood windows with raised exterior muntins. PVC window casing to match existing casing on house in dimensions and details.

Application Date: April 6, 2010

APPROVED

Mr. Sharrer presented the Browns' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district.

Ms. Brown was present. She answered the Commissioners' questions regarding the proposed work.

Commissioner King gave the COA Subcommittee report on the application. The COA Subcommittee considered the Browns' application to be complete and recommended approval. Commissioner King made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Curtis seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1702 S Rockford Avenue | Sylvia & Tom Brown

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	1. Wright
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Turner			
11. Winchester			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Swan Lake Guidelines cited: B1.0.1, B1.0.2, B1.0.3, B1.2.1, B1.2.2, B1.4.1

3. **1114 E. 17th Place** (North Maple Ridge)
Applicant: Brendan McKnight
Request: Construct 190 square foot (20' x 9.5') second-story addition on east elevation according to plans submitted.

Application Date: April 6, 2010

APPROVED

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. McKnight's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Mr. McKnight was in attendance. He presented additional photographs of similar additions in the North Maple Ridge district to the Commission.

Commissioner King gave the COA Subcommittee report on the application. The COA Subcommittee considered Mr. McKnight's application to be complete and recommended approval **with the condition** that a second window be added to the east elevation of the addition.

After consultation with Legal staff regarding the appropriateness of the condition, Commissioner King **withdrew** the motion. Commissioner Winchester made a motion to approve the application as presented with no conditions. Commissioner King seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1114 E 17th Place | Brendan McKnight

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Gilmore
4. King
5. Pollard
6. Shears
7. Smallwood
8. Sober
9. Winchester

Opposed

1. McKee
2. Turner
3. Wright

Abstaining

None

Not Present

None

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.

North Maple Ridge Guidelines cited: Additions, 1.0.1 - 1.0.3, 1.2.1, 1.2.2, 1.3.2

4. 1510 E. 17th Place (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Steve Caruthers

Request: Replace existing 5/1 jailhouse-pattern wood windows with new 5/1 jailhouse pattern, clad wood windows with raised exterior muntins.

Application Date: April 6, 2010

APPROVED

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Caruthers' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district.

Mr. Caruthers was not present.

Commissioner King gave the COA Subcommittee report on the application. The COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Caruthers' application to be complete and recommended approval. Commissioner King made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Wright seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1510 E. 17th Place | Steve Caruthers

In Favor

1. Bergman
2. Curtis
3. Gilmore
4. King
5. McKee
6. Pollard
7. Shears
8. Smallwood
9. Sober
10. Turner
11. Winchester
12. Wright

Opposed

None

Abstaining

None

Not Present

None

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Swan Lake Guidelines cited: A1.2.1, A1.2.3, A1.2.4

5. 2219 E. 18th Street (Yorktown)

Applicant: Sean Rohrbacker

Request: Replace existing deteriorated concrete front porch with new concrete front porch, including 12" grid pattern and stucco-covered stem walls to match existing. Propose to change rounded corners to square corners. Add wood railing according to plans submitted.

Application Date: April 6, 2010

APPROVED

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Rohrbacker's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district.

Mr. Rohrbacker was present to answer questions.

Commissioner King gave the COA Subcommittee report on the application. The COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Rohrbacker's application to be complete and recommended approval. Commissioner King made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Wright seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 2219 E. 18th Street | Sean Rohrbacker

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Turner			
11. Winchester			
12. Wright			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Yorktown Guidelines cited: A1.0.1, A1.4.1, A1.4.2

6. **1628 S. Quincy Avenue** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Peter Grant

Request: Replace existing aluminum picture window on front of house (not original to house) with new clad wood, single-pane picture window with 6-lite transom with raised exterior muntins.

Application Date: April 6, 2010

APPROVED

Mr. Sharrer presented Mr. Grant's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district.

Ms. Lori Grant was present to answer questions.

Commissioner King gave the COA Subcommittee report on the application. The COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Grant's application to be complete and recommended approval. Commissioner King made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Wright seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1628 S. Quincy Avenue | Peter Grant

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Turner			
11. Winchester			
12. Wright			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Swan Lake Guidelines cited: A1.0.1, A1.2.1, A1.2.3, A1.2.4

7. **1610-1612 S. Lewis Avenue** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Joan Crager

Request: Install storm windows and clear-view storm doors.

Application Date: April 6, 2010

APPROVED

Mr. Sharrer presented Ms. Crager's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district. Ms. Crager was not present.

Commissioner King gave the COA Subcommittee report on the application. The COA Subcommittee considered Ms. Crager's application to be complete and recommended approval. Commissioner King made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Shears seconded the motion. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1610-1612 S. Lewis Avenue | Joan Crager

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Turner			
11. Winchester			
12. Wright			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

Yorktown Guidelines cited: A1.2.7, A1.2.8

B. Rules and Regulations Committee

Commissioner Gilmore made a motion to request a legal memorandum from Patrick Boulden outlining the procedures for amending and revising the current set of neighborhood design guidelines. Commissioner Pollard seconded. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Turner			
11. Winchester			
12. Wright			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

In addition, Commissioner Gilmore reported that the Rules and Regulations Committee will begin to define the conditions that guide decisions on COA applications. For example, what is considered masonry? By documenting this institutional knowledge, future Commission members would be able to make consistent decisions. Commissioner Gilmore requested that the other members forward to him any ideas they have for the document. Commissioner Turner suggested defining the Commission's scope of review regarding mailboxes.

C. Outreach Committee

Commissioner Bergman announced that the next Outreach Committee meeting would be held Thursday, April 15th at 11:30am at Eloté. The Committee will discuss conducting a trolley tour for local realtors, plans for this year's Open House, and updating the Outreach Plan.

D. Implementation Committee

Commissioner Smallwood asked Amanda DeCort to present the revised 2010 meeting schedule to the Commission. Ms. Decort reported that she has worked with building management to reserve rooms for all meetings listed on the revised schedule. Due to Veteran's Day, the Regular Meeting that would normally be conducted Thursday, November 11th has been moved to Tuesday, November 9th. The revised schedule will be emailed to the Commissioners.

E. Enforcement Committee

Commissioner King reported that the Enforcement Committee met on Monday, March 29th. Only he and Mr. Boulden were in attendance. They discussed the procedures for criminal enforcement of Historic Preservation Zoning violations as well as several ideas for providing notice to citizens who live in HP-zoned neighborhoods of the design review requirements.

4. Chair Report

A. Oklahoma Statewide Preservation Conference, June 9-11, Okmulgee

Chairman Sober asked Glen Roberson from the Oklahoma State Historic Preservation Office to say a few words about the upcoming conference. Mr. Roberson first complimented the Commission on the pace of the meeting and the manner in which it conducted business. He said that being a Preservation Commission is often a thankless and difficult job, and the Commission is doing its job well.

Mr. Roberson invited all the Commissioners to the Statewide Preservation Conference, specifically noting that Track B has been designed specifically for Preservation Commissioners on the many facets of the job. Chairman Sober encouraged all the members to add the conference to their schedules.

B. PLANiTULSA/HP Zoning/proposed Utica Medical Corridor

Chairman Sober recommended that a committee be formed to review and keep tabs on the issue of the proposed Utica Medical Corridor by development interests in Tulsa. The proposed corridor would be 300' deep on either side of Utica Avenue between 11th and 21st Streets, for a total width of 600 feet. If enacted, the corridor would encroach 150' deep into the Swan Lake and Yorktown Historic Districts.

Martha Schultz from the City of Tulsa Planning Department provided a brief history of the PLANiTULSA process to date – over 6,000 citizen participants provided input. The Tulsa Metropolitan Area Planning Commission is in the middle of its review of the Final Draft of the Plan and still seeking input from interested parties.

Chairman Sober suggested that the TPC write a letter to the Planning Commission explaining the negative impacts of commercial encroachment into these historic neighborhoods and requesting that all residential property within a National Register-listed district be considered an Area of Stability on the PLANiTULSA planning maps. Commissioner Turner made a motion to that effect. Commissioner Curtis seconded. Chairman Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	1. Wright	None
2. Curtis			
3. Gilmore			
4. King			
5. McKee			
6. Pollard			
7. Shears			
8. Smallwood			
9. Sober			
10. Turner			
11. Winchester			

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.

5. Staff Report

Ms. DeCort reported that she needs to submit the Commission's Certified Local Government grant application to the State Historic Preservation Office in the next few weeks. Staff recommends that the 2010-11 CLG funds be used to fund a National Register Nomination for the Blue Dome district identified in the Downtown Survey. Commissioner Smallwood made a motion to accept staff's recommendation for the expenditure of 2010-11 CLG funds. Commissioner Pollard seconded. Chairman

Sober asked for a vote on the motion.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Bergman	None	None	1. Curtis
2. Gilmore			
3. King			
4. McKee			
5. Pollard			
6. Shears			
7. Smallwood			
8. Sober			
9. Turner			
10. Winchester			
11. Wright			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

6. Absence Report

No report.

7. Other Business

No other business.

8. New Business

Chairman Sober reported that the Officers and Staff responded to an email inquiry from a North Maple Ridge resident concerning a flat roof on an addition to a house on 18th Street. The response noted the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically that additions be distinguishable from the original structure. The Commission's judgment was that the flat roof provided that distinction with the additional benefit of leaving the original clay tile roof undisturbed.

9. Adjournment

Chairman Sober adjourned the meeting at 1:30 p.m.

The proceedings of the Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting of April 8, 2010 were recorded. The meeting minutes were transcribed by Ed Sharrer. Minutes approved by the TPC on May 13, 2010.