



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, November 12, 2009, 11:00 a.m.

City Hall @ One Technology Center

175 E. 2nd Street, 10th Floor North Conference Room

THE AGENDA FOR THIS MEETING WAS POSTED AT THE OFFICE OF THE TULSA CITY CLERK, 175 EAST SECOND STREET, TULSA OKLAHOMA, IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE OPEN MEETING ACT ON NOVEMBER 10, 2009 AT 11:01AM.

1. **Roll Call** – Chair Smallwood called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:06 a.m.

Members Present

Chair, Barbara Smallwood
Vice-Chairman, Bob Sober
Secretary, Paula Wood
Charles Gilmore
Jim Turner
Mary Lee Townsend
Kristen Bergman
Robert Shears
Pamela Curtis
Susan McKee
Elizabeth A. Wright

Members Absent

Jack Hodgson
Bob Winchester
Matt King
Anne Pollard

Others Present

Patrick Boulden, Fannie Warrior, Amanda DeCort, Ed Sharrer, Julie James, Barbara Heck, Cassandra Peters, Jeremy Grodhaus, David Stover and E. Baumgarten.

2. **Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes of October 8, 2009**

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes for October 8, 2009 as presented. Commissioner Wood seconded. Chair Smallwood called for a vote on the motion.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
(1) Smallwood	None	(1) Townsend	None
(2) Sober			
(3) Wood			
(4) Gilmore			
(5) Turner			
(6) Bergman			
(7) Wright			
(8) Shears			
(9) Curtis			
(10) McKee			

The motion was **Approved by Majority** of members present and voting.

3. Committee Reports

A. Historic Preservation Committee

i. Announcement of Conflict of Interest

No one responded to having a conflict of interest with any of the proposals on the agenda.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

1. 1860 E. 17th Street (Yorktown)

Applicant: Double B Properties, LLC

Request: Install storm door at front entry of house.

Application Date: November 10, 2009

APPROVED WITHOUT CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Double B Properties' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission and read the applicable guidelines for this district.

Ms. Baumgarten was present on behalf of Double B Properties, LLC. She had no comments to add to the presentation.

Commissioner Sober gave the COA Subcommittee report on the application. The COA Subcommittee considered Double B Properties' application to be complete and recommended approval. Commissioner Sober made a motion to approve the application with no conditions. Commissioner Curtis seconded the motion. Chair Smallwood asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1860 E. 17th Street, Double B Properties, LLC

In Favor	Opposed	Abstaining	Not Present
(1) Smallwood	None	None	None
(2) Sober			
(3) Wood			
(4) Gilmore			
(5) Townsend			
(6) Turner			
(7) Bergman			
(8) Wright			
(9) Shears			
(10) Curtis			
(11) McKee			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Yorktown Guidelines cited: A.1.2.8

2. 1621 S. St. Louis Avenue (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Julie James

Request: Demolition of house on lot.

Application Date: November 10, 2009

DENIED

Mr. Sharrer presented Julie James' application to the Commission and read the guidelines for the district. Mr. Sharrer stated that Ms. James plans to demolish the house based on the amount of investment needed to repair the house.

Ms. James was present at the meeting and answered the Commissioners' questions. Ms. James stated her reasoning for wanting to demolish the home. The commission explained to her that it is commission policy to not allow demolition of homes if it is at all possible to preserve and restore them. It was also explained to Ms. James that the necessary repairs she described were normal repairs for an older home.

Commissioner Sober gave the COA Subcommittee report on the application. The COA Subcommittee considered Ms. James' application to be complete and recommended denial based on a lack of evidence to warrant demolition. Commissioner Sober made a motion to deny the application. Commissioner Bergman seconded the motion. Chair Smallwood asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 1621 S. St. Louis Avenue, Julie James

In Favor	Opposed	Abstaining	Not Present
(1) Smallwood	(1) Turner	None	None
(2) Sober	(2) Wright		
(3) Wood			
(4) Gilmore			
(5) Townsend			
(6) Bergman			
(7) Shears			
(8) Curtis			
(9) McKee			

The motion to **Deny** was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.
Swan Lake Guidelines cited: F1.0.1

3. 1231 E. 18th Street (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Dub Stover

Request, Part 1: Replace 6/6 wood windows with new 6/6 windows with exterior muntin grids

Application Date: November 10, 2009

APPROVED WITHOUT CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 1 of Mr. Stover's application to the Commission and read the appropriate guidelines for the district. Photographs of the house in the past and present day home were available for review. Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Stover has already replaced the existing 6/6 wood windows with new 6/6 windows with exterior muntin grids.

David Stover was present at the meeting. He answered questions regarding the replacement of the windows.

Commissioner Sober gave the COA Subcommittee report. The COA Subcommittee considered Part 1 of Mr. Stover's application to be complete and recommended a vote to deny the proposal based on a lack of evidence that the original windows were beyond repair as specified in the design guidelines.

Commissioner Sober made a motion to deny the application. Commissioner Curtis seconded. The motion failed. Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application. The motion to approve was seconded by Commissioner Townsend. Chair Smallwood asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote on Part 1: 1231 E. 18th Street, Dub Stover

In Favor	Opposed	Abstaining	Not Present
(1) Smallwood	None	None	None
(2) Sober			
(3) Wood			
(4) Gilmore			
(5) Townsend			
(6) Turner			
(7) Bergman			
(8) Wright			
(9) Shears			
(10) Curtis			
(11) McKee			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
North Maple Ridge Guidelines cited: 1.2.1, 1.2.3, 1.2.4

3. 1231 E. 18th Street (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Dub Stover

Request, Part 2: Replace front door and sidelights with new Tudor-style wood door and side panels.

Application Date: November 10, 2009

DENIED

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 2 of Mr. Stover's application to the Commission and read the appropriate guidelines for the district. Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Stover has already replaced the front door with the Tudor-style door being presented.

Commissioner Sober gave the COA Subcommittee report. The COA Subcommittee deemed Part 2 of the application complete and recommended a vote to deny the proposal based on the fact that there is no evidence that the original door was beyond repair and it was not replaced with a similar looking door with sidelights. Commissioner Sober made a motion to deny the application. The motion to approve was seconded by Commissioner Townsend.

The Commission explained to Mr. Stover that the door should have had a similar look to the one it was replacing to preserve the historic appearance of the home. The Commission also explained that if this application was denied Mr. Stover can come back with a different proposal to replace the existing door.

Chair Smallwood asked for a vote on the motion to deny.

Vote on Part 2: 1231 E. 18th Street, Dub Stover

In Favor	Opposed	Abstaining	Not Present
(1) Smallwood	None	None	None
(2) Sober			
(3) Wood			
(4) Gilmore			
(5) Townsend			
(6) Turner			
(7) Bergman			
(8) Wright			
(9) Shears			
(10) Curtis			
(11) McKee			

The motion to **Deny** was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
North Maple Ridge Guidelines cited: 1.0.1, 1.2.1, 1.2.3

3. 1231 E. 18th Street (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Dub Stover

Request, Part 3: Replace deteriorated brick portion of retaining wall facing 18th Street with new brick retaining wall.

Application Date: November 10, 2009

DENIED

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 3 of Mr. Stover's application to the Commission for a final review, including drawings of the proposed brick retaining wall and a photograph from the 2000 survey showing the historic wall configuration.

Commissioner Sober gave the COA Subcommittee report. The COA Subcommittee considered Part 3 of the application to be complete and recommended a vote to deny the proposed work based on the appropriate design guidelines. Commissioner Sober made a motion to deny Part 3 of the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Wright.

Ms. Barbara Henk, 1220 E. 18th St, spoke on behalf of Mr. Stover and commended the discussion regarding his work on the house.

The Commission also discussed the procedures for addressing violations of the design guidelines.

Chair Smallwood asked for a vote on the motion to deny.

Vote on Part 3: 1231 E. 18th Street, Dub Stover

In Favor	Opposed	Abstaining	Not Present
(1) Smallwood	None	None	None
(2) Sober			
(3) Wood			
(4) Gilmore			
(5) Townsend			
(6) Turner			
(7) Bergman			
(8) Wright			
(9) Shears			
(10) Curtis			
(11) McKee			

The motion to **Deny** was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
North Maple Ridge Guidelines cited: 1.1.5

4. 210 W. Golden Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Cassandra Peters & Jeremy Grodhaus

Request:

- I. Construct two 4' wide buttress walls of 8" concrete block on south end of the stem wall on east side of house.
- II. Remove basement window on east stem wall and construct concrete basement access stairs.

Application Date: November 10, 2009

APPROVED BOTH PARTS WITHOUT CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented both parts of Cassandra Peters & Jeremy Grodhaus' application to the Commission and read the appropriate guidelines for the district.

Jeremy Grodhaus attended the meeting and answered questions from the Commission.

Commissioner Sober gave the COA Subcommittee report. The COA Subcommittee considered both parts of the application to be complete and recommended a vote to approve the application. Commissioner Sober made a motion to approve both parts of the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Curtis.

Chair Smallwood asked for a vote on the motion.

Vote: 210 W. Golden Avenue, Cassandra Peters & Jeremy Grodhaus

In Favor	Opposed	Abstaining	Not Present
(1) Smallwood	None	None	None
(2) Sober			
(3) Wood			
(4) Gilmore			
(5) Townsend			
(6) Turner			
(7) Bergman			
(8) Wright			
(9) Shears			
(10) Curtis			
(11) McKee			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.
Brady Heights Guidelines cited: Additions to Existing Structures

iii. COA Appointment of Yorktown Neighborhood Representative Michael Park

Chair Smallwood read a letter from the Yorktown Neighborhood Association appointing Michael Park as their COA Subcommittee representative to replace John Hill. Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve this appointment. Commissioner Bergman seconded the motion. Chair Smallwood asked for a vote on the motion.

In Favor	Opposed	Abstaining	Not Present
(1) Smallwood	None	None	None
(2) Sober			
(3) Wood			
(4) Gilmore			
(5) Townsend			
(6) Turner			
(7) Bergman			
(8) Wright			
(9) Shears			
(10) Curtis			
(11) McKee			

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

iv. Strategic Plan for Preservation – First Reading

Chair Smallwood called on Amanda DeCort for the reading. Ms. DeCort stated that the only difference from previous versions of the plan was that the top 10 objectives of the Preservation Commission were listed right in the front. Ms. DeCort read the top 10 objectives. The commission applauded the staff for a great job on the Strategic Plan.

B. Rules and Regulations Committee

Committee Chairman Charles Gilmore reported that the vote for the proposed changes to Rules & Regulations would have to be put off until the December meeting. Everything has been signed off on but the Mayor has not signed it. These changes were to get the professional quorum eliminated in the meetings.

C. Outreach Committee

Committee Chairperson Kristen Bergman reported that the committee will meet next Thursday, November 19, 2009 at 11:30 a.m. at Elote. She stated that they had submitted the plan for realtor education to the head of the GTAR at the state level. They are hoping to conduct a January or February class. She also spoke of the December 2nd Downtown Survey Open House at City Hall from 10:00am to 2:00pm. She encouraged everyone to attend.

4. Chair Report

A. Nominating Committee

Chair Smallwood stated that she has appointed a nominating committee and the meeting would be immediately following this meeting. She announced there would be a slate of officers to vote on at the December meeting.

B. Implementation Committee

Chair Smallwood announced that the committee now has a plan and that they had some action items they needed to do. She has volunteered herself to chair this committee in 2010. Also Kristen Bergman, Pam Curtis, Bob Winchester and Bob Sober will be working on this committee.

Chair Smallwood announced that the TPC Christmas party would be December 10 after the regular TPC meeting. Kristen Bergman has offered to have the party in her loft to celebrate Downtown Tulsa. It will be potluck.

Chair Smallwood announced that the annual TPC Retreat would be held on Saturday, January 9, 2010.

5. Staff Report

The November Staff Report was handed out prior to the meeting.

Ms. DeCort gave a brief overview of the Downtown Survey. She reported that she will email the results to everyone on the Downtown Survey. She also discussed the tax credit project.

6. Absence Report

Ms. Warrior announced that Mr. Hodgson asked to be excused today because he is attending a National Realtor Conference. Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the excusal of absence for Jack Hodgson. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend. Chair Smallwood asked for a vote on the motion.

In Favor	Opposed	Abstaining	Not Present
(1) Smallwood	(1) Bergman	None	None
(2) Sober			
(3) Wood			
(4) Gilmore			
(5) Townsend			
(6) Turner			
(7) Wright			
(8) Shears			
(9) Curtis			
(10) McKee			

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.

7. New Business

Chair Smallwood announced that she and Bob Sober will be trying to get on the new Mayor's agenda after he takes office. She also announced that Mrs. Warrior will no longer be staffing the Commission.

Commissioner Bergman applauded Mr. Sober on his exhibit of oil paintings that were on display at the Circle Cinema in October.

8. Other Business

No other business.

9. Adjournment

Chair Smallwood adjourned the meeting at 1:06 p.m.

The proceedings of the Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting of November 12, 2009 were recorded. The meeting minutes were transcribed by Tynesha White. Minutes approved by the TPC on December 10, 2009.