

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF THE

TUL/A PRE/ERVATION COMMI//ION

Thursday, May 14, 2009, 11:00 a.m. 175 E. 2nd Street, 10th Floor North Conference Room Tulsa, OK 74103

1. Roll Call – Chairperson Smallwood called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:14 a.m.

Members Present:

Chair, Barbara Smallwood;

Vice-Chairman Bob Sober, Arts Commissioner;

Charles Gilmore, Professional Developer;

Mary Lee Townsend, Professional Historian;

Matt King, Professional Architect;

Jim Turner, Community Group Resident;

Breniss O'Neal; Community Group Resident;

Robert Shears, Professional Landscape Architect;

Kristen Bergman, Building Owner, Non-Residential;

Anne Pollard, Community Group Resident; &

Pamela Curtis, Community Group Resident;

Members Absent:

Elizabeth A. Wright, Planning Commissioner; Secretary, Paula Wood, Professional Tulsa Public Schools Rep.; Jack Hodgson, Professional Real Estate Broker; & Bob Winchester, Professional Banker;

Others Present:

Patrick Boulden, Fannie Warrior, Ed Sharrer, Amanda DeCort, Tony Nelson, Jessica Brent, Sally Davies & Jeremy Gredhaus.

2. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting of Regular Meeting Minutes for April 9, 2009;

ACTION: VOTE NEEDED

Chair Smallwood asked if anyone would like to make a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes for April 9, 2009.

Commissioner Bergman made a motion to *Approve* the Regular Meeting Minutes for April 9, 2009 with minor corrections. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve the April 9, 2009 Regular Meeting Minutes:

- (1) Chair Smallwood;
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (3) Breniss O'Neal;
- (4) Charles Gilmore:
- (5) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (6) Matt King;
- (7) Kristen Bergman;
- (8) Pamela Curtis;
- (9) Anne Pollard:

All Opposed:

None.

All Abstaining:

(10) Jim Turner;

All not present during this vote:

(11) Robert Shears:

The motion was <u>Approved by Majority</u> by members present and voting.

3. FY 2009 Certified Local Government Funds Grant Application ACTION: VOTE NEEDED

Ms. DeCort stated that the Tulsa Preservation Commission has received \$13,000 from the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) for our federal fiscal year 2009. She stated that the funds may be used for survey, nominations, travel, training and for other things; but that Certified Local Government (CLG) Director, Glen Vaughn-Roberson at

SHPO and Nore' Winter of Winter & Co., have suggested that the Commission use the FY 2009 funds to follow up on the downtown survey with the National Register Nomination Program that we develop with them based on the results of the downtown survey. Ms. DeCort stated that the downtown survey will be completed at the end of September 2009. She added that Mr. Vaughn-Roberson has also informed her that the Commission may receive additional funds. Ms. DeCort stated that she notified Mr. Vaughn-Roberson that the Tulsa Preservation Commission would be very appreciative to receive any additional funds.

Commissioner Bergman made a motion for the Tulsa Preservation Commission to accept FY 2009 Certified Local Government Funds of \$13,000 from SHPO. Commissioner Pollard seconded.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve receipt of FY 2009 Certified Local Government Funds of \$13,000 from SHPO:

- (1) Chair Smallwood:
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober:
- (3) Breniss O'Neal:
- (4) Charles Gilmore:
- (5) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (6) Matt King;
- (7) Kristen Bergman;
- (8) Pamela Curtis;
- (9) Anne Pollard:
- (10) Jim Turner:

All Opposed:

None.

All Abstaining:

(11) Robert Shears;

All not present during this vote:

None:

The motion was *Approved by Majority* by members present and voting.

4. A. Historic Preservation Committee

i. Announcement of Conflict of Interest ACTION NEEDED

Chair Smallwood asked the Commission if anyone had a conflict of interest with any of the four (4) Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) requests that have been brought before the Commission today. No one responded to having a conflict of interest with any of the proposals.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness ACTION: VOTE NEEDED

Chair Smallwood briefly informed the COA applicants of how their proposals would be reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission for a final determination.

1. <u>1609 S. Newport Avenue</u> (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Tony & Suzanne Nelson

Request: Construct new single-family house on lot

according to plans submitted.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

05-12-2009

APPROVAL WITHOUT CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Tony and Suzanne Nelson's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that the Nelsons plan to construct a new single-family dwelling on the property at 1609 S. Newport Avenue according to the plans that they have submitted.

Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for the Nelson's proposal under *New Construction* for this district.

Chair Smallwood asked Mr. Nelson if he had any information to add to Mr. Sharrer's presentation; and Mr. Nelson responded by stating that Mr. Sharrer had covered everything very well. Mr. Nelson answered a few questions that were asked of him by the Commission.

The Commission complimented Mr. Nelson on the new construction project by stating that the project was very nice; and that he had chosen a beautiful design to build the new structure.

Chair Smallwood asked Vice-Chair Sober to please give his report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on the Nelson's application.

Vice-Chair Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered the Nelson's application to be complete at the May 12, 2009 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Approve* the Nelson's proposal for *New Construction* based on the appropriate design guidelines; and that he would like to make a motion to approve the Nelson's application with no conditions.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner O'Neal.

After further review of the application, Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Tony & Suzanne Nelson's Application without conditions:

- (1) Chair Smallwood;
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (3) Breniss O'Neal:
- (4) Charles Gilmore;
- (5) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (6) Matt King;
- (7) Kristen Bergman;
- (8) Pamela Curtis:
- (9) Anne Pollard:
- (10) Jim Turner: &
- (11) Robert Shears:

All Opposed:

None.

All Abstaining:

None.

All not present during this vote:

None;

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved</u> <u>Tony & Suzanne Nelson's proposal</u> based on guidelines under Section VIIIC General Requirements, C.1.01, C.1.0.2 & C.1.0.3; Building Site, C..1.1.1, C.1.1.2, C.1.1.3 & C.1.1.4; and under Building Materials, C.1.2.1 for New Construction in the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

2. 1010 N. Denver Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Jessica Brent

Request: Rebuild south porch, preserving original columns

and restoring original railing details.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

05-12-2009

APPROVAL WITHOUT CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Jessica Brent's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that Ms. Brent plans to rebuild the south porch, preserve the original columns on the porch and restore its original railing details on this house in Brady Heights. Mr. Sharrer added that the house has been underutilized for several years.

Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Brady Heights Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for the Ms. Brent's proposal under *Rehabilitation* for this district.

Chair Smallwood asked Ms. Brent if she had any information to add to Mr. Sharrer's presentation; and Ms. Brent responded by stating that Mr. Sharrer had covered everything. Ms. Brent answered a few questions that were asked of her by the Commission.

The Commission thanked Ms. Brent for planning to rebuild the house that will surely complement the neighborhood.

Chair Smallwood asked Vice-Chair Sober to please give his report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on Ms. Brent's application.

Vice-Chair Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Ms. Brent's application to be complete at the May 12, 2009 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Approve* Ms. Brent's proposal to *Restore* based on the appropriate design guidelines; and that he would like to make a motion to approve Ms. Brent's application with no conditions.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner O'Neal.

After further review of the application, Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Jessica Brent's Application without conditions:

- (1) Chair Smallwood:
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (3) Breniss O'Neal;
- (4) Charles Gilmore;
- (5) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (6) Matt King;
- (7) Kristen Bergman;
- (8) Pamela Curtis:
- (9) Anne Pollard:
- (10) Jim Turner: &
- (11) Robert Shears:

All Opposed:

None.

All Abstaining:

None.

All not present during this vote:

None:

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved</u> <u>Jessica Brent's proposal</u> based on guidelines under Property owners are strongly encouraged, in order of preference to: Paragraphs 1 through 3; Porches with Preferred Option, Paragraph 1; and under the Second Preference, Paragraph 1 for

Restoring Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

3. 715 N. Denver Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Joe Crosier Request:

05-12-2009

I. Remove existing chain link fence in front yard and replace with 30" tall metal picket fence.COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 1 of 2 Parts of Joe Crosier's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Crosier plans to remove the existing chain link fence in the front yard; and replace it with a 30" tall metal picket fence.

Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Brady Heights Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for Part 1 of Mr. Crosier's proposal under *Additions* for this district.

Mr. Crosier was unable to attend the meeting to represent his proposal before the Commission.

Chair Smallwood asked Vice-Chair Sober to please give his report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on Part 1 of Mr. Crosier's application.

Vice-Chair Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part 1 of Mr. Crosier's application to be complete at the May 12, 2009 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Approve Part 1* of Mr. Crosier's proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines on Additions with conditions:

♦ That the gates match the new fence (use same materials)

Vice-Chair Sober stated that he would like to make a motion to Approve Part 1 of Mr. Crosier's application with the option:

♦ To install the new metal picket fence up to 36" high

The motion was seconded by Commissioner O'Neal.

After further review of the application, Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Part 1 of Joe Crosier's Application without conditions:

- (1) Chair Smallwood:
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (3) Breniss O'Neal:
- (4) Charles Gilmore;
- (5) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (6) Matt King;
- (7) Kristen Bergman;
- (8) Pamela Curtis;
- (9) Anne Pollard:
- (10) Jim Turner; &
- (11) Robert Shears;

<u>All Opposed:</u>

None.

All Abstaining:

None.

All not present during this vote:

None:

The motion was *Approved Unanimously* by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved</u> <u>Part 1 of 2 Parts of Joe Crosier's proposal</u> based on guidelines under Building Site, Paragraph 3 for Additions to Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

3. 715 N. Denver Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Joe Crosier

Request:

II. Remove two light fixtures flanking front doors which are not original to house. Install new light fixture centered above entry.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

05-12-2009

DENIED

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 2 of 2 Parts of Joe Crosier's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Crosier plans to remove two (2) front light fixtures flanking the front doors. He stated that the two light fixtures are not original to that house; but that Mr. Crosier would like to install one (1) new light fixture centered above the entry.

Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the Brady Heights Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for Part 2 of Mr. Crosier's proposal under *Restore* for this district.

Most of the Commissioners believe that the location of the proposed new light fixture centered above the entry between the two front doors is inappropriate.

Chair Smallwood asked Vice-Chair Sober to please give his report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on Part 2 of Mr. Crosier's application.

Vice-Chair Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part 2 of Mr. Crosier's application to be complete at the May 12, 2009 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to *Deny Part 2* of Mr. Crosier's proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines to *Restore*.

Vice-Chair Sober stated that he would like to make a motion to Deny Part 2 of Mr. Crosier's application.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner O'Neal.

After further review of the application, Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Deny Part 2 of Joe Crosier's Application:

- (1) Chair Smallwood:
- (2) Vice-Chair Sober;
- (3) Breniss O'Neal;
- (4) Charles Gilmore:
- (5) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (6) Matt King;
- (7) Kristen Bergman;
- (8) Pamela Curtis;
- (9) Anne Pollard: &
- (10) Robert Shears;

All Opposed:

None.

All Abstaining:

(11) Jim Turner;

All not present during this vote:

None:

The motion was *Approved by Majority* by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Denied Part 2</u>
of 2 Parts of Joe Crosier's <u>proposal</u> based on guidelines under Property owners are strongly encouraged, in order of preference to: Paragraphs 1 & 2 for Restoring Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

4. 1912 S. Detroit Avenue (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: John and Sandy Connelly

Request: Remove windows from mud room on southwest corner of house. Enclose opening with brick that matches existing materials.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

05-12-2009

APPROVAL WITHOUT CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented John and Sandy Connelly's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Mr. Sharrer stated that the Connellys plan to remove the windows from the mud room on the southwest corner of house; and enclose the opening with brick that will match the existing materials. Mr. Sharrer added that the header and batten board will remain.

Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer read the guidelines for the Connelly's proposal under *Additions* for this district.

Neither Mr. or Mrs. Connelly was able to attend the meeting to represent their proposal before the Commission; and they were unable to have someone attend the meeting to represent their request.

North Maple Ridge Representative, Sally Davies believes that the house will look like a big box sitting on the corner of the street. She stated that the structure needs some kind of detailing. Ms. Davies believes if the Connellys use solid brick that they're going to lose the rhythm and style of the structure.

Chair Smallwood asked Vice-Chair Sober to please give his report of the recommendation from the COA Subcommittee on the Connelly's application.

Vice-Chair Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered the Connelly's application to be complete at the May 12, 2009 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a majority vote to *Approve* the Connelly's proposal for *Additions* based on the appropriate design guidelines with conditions:

♦ That the header and batten board remain

Vice-Chair Sober stated that he would like to make a motion to approve the Connelly's application with no conditions.

The motion was seconded by Commissioner O'Neal.

After further review of the application, Chair Smallwood asked for roll call to be announced.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve John & Sandy Connelly's Application without conditions:

- (1) Vice-Chair Sober:
- (2) Breniss O'Neal:
- (3) Charles Gilmore:
- (4) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (5) Matt King;
- (6) Kristen Bergman;
- (7) Pamela Curtis;
- (8) Anne Pollard:
- (9) Jim Turner; &
- (10) Robert Shears;

All Opposed:

(11) Chair Smallwood;

All Abstaining:

None.

All not present during this vote:

None:

The motion was *Approved by Majority* by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved</u> <u>John & Sandy Connelly's proposal</u> based on guidelines under Section VIIIB General Requirements, B.1.0.3; for Additions to Existing Structures for the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

B. Rules & Regulations Committee

Rules & Regulations Committee Chairman Charles Gilmore had no report.

C. Outreach Committee

Outreach Committee Chairperson Kristen Bergman reported that the next Outreach Committee meeting will be at Elote, 5th & Boston at 11:30 a.m., on Friday, May 15, 2009.

Chairperson Bergman stated that the committee is planning to have an upcoming open house in Swan Lake; and will be inviting all of the historic neighborhoods. She stated that they plan to have an open house twice a year.

Chairperson Bergman announced a potential new initiative called *Friends of Preservation* she is exploring. She stated that *Friends of Preservation* could be established to raise funds for preservation matters, including the purchase of threatened historic properties.

5. Chair Report

Chair Smallwood reported that the dedication of the Meadow Gold sign will be held on Friday, May 22, 2009 at 11:00 a.m.; and that everyone is welcome to attend the special event.

6. Staff Report

The May Staff Report was distributed to the Commission prior to this meeting by email for review.

6. Absence Report

No report.

7. New Business

Under the Open Meeting Act, this agenda item is authorized only for matters not known about or which could not have been reasonably foreseen prior to the time of posting the agenda or any revised agenda.

Vice-Chair Sober announced that about 500 people attended the PLANiTulsa event at the Cain's Ballroom. He stated that the session was very interesting and generated a lot of excitement. The PLANiTulsa team is hoping to have great response to the surveys they are circulating in the community. He stated that if you would like to fill out a PLANiTulsa Survey that you have until

June $18^{th.}$ The survey forms are located on the PLANiTulsa website at <u>www.PLANiTulsa.org</u> . He asked everyone to please help plan Tulsa's future.

8. Other Business

None.

This agenda item is reserved for public comment or presentations to the TPC.

9. Adjournment

There being no other business, Chairperson Smallwood adjourned the meeting at 1:09 p.m. The Regular Tulsa Preservation Commission Meeting of May 14, 2009 was recorded; and the Meeting Minutes for this meeting were transcribed by Fannie Warrior.

Note: Please notify Mrs. Warrior by e-mail at <u>Fwarrior@ci.tulsa.ok.us</u> that you have received the information forwarded to you. Project plans will be available at the Planning Department office for review.

K:/Planning/FW/MINS 05 14 2009R TPC Minutes Approved by TPC on