



SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES
OF THE

TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Tuesday, March 18, 2008, 11:00 a.m.

**111 South Greenwood, 2nd Floor - Conference Rooms A&B
Tulsa, OK 74120-1820**

1. **Roll Call** – Chairperson O’Neal called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:02 a.m., and Mrs. Warrior announced the Roll Call.

Members Present:

Chairperson, Breniss O’Neal, Professional Landscape Designer;
Dusty Peck, Community Group Resident;
Bob Sober, Arts Commissioner;
Mary Lee Townsend, Professional Historian;
Paula Wood, Professional Tulsa Public Schools Representative;
Jim Turner, Community Group Resident;
Charles Gilmore, Professional Developer;
Jack Hodgson, Professional Real Estate Broker;

Member(s) Absent:

Vice-Chair, Barbara Smallwood;
Michelle Cantrell, Planning Commissioner;
Kristen Bergman, Community Group Resident;
Bob Winchester, Professional Banker;
Alice Rodgers, Owner, Non-residential Representative;

Others Present:

Ed Sharrer, Fannie Warrior, Kurt Ackermann, Jeri Tucker, Meridith Harrison, Ronald Miles & Joseph Crosier.

**2. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting
Regular Meeting Minutes for February 14, 2008;**

Chairperson O'Neal asked if anyone would like to make a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes for February 14, 2008.

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the February 14, 2008 Regular Meeting Minutes as presented. Commissioner Gilmore seconded.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve the February 14, 2008 Regular Meeting Minutes:

- (1) Chairperson O'Neal;
- (2) Charles Gilmore;
- (3) Jack Hodgson;
- (4) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (5) Dusty Peck;
- (6) Paula Wood;
- (7) Bob Sober;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

- (8) Jim Turner;

All not present during this vote:

None.

The motion was **Approved by Majority by members present and voting.**

3. Committee Reports

a. Historic Preservation Committee

i. Announcement of Conflicts of Interest

Chairperson O'Neal asked the Commission if anyone had a conflict of interest with any of the Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) Requests that would be brought before the board for review. No one responded to having a conflict of interest with any of the proposals.

Chairperson O'Neal announced that the Vice-Chair or the Secretary of the Commission are to present the COA Subcommittee Report to the Commission; although Vice-Chair Barbara Smallwood had a conflict with another meeting; and that she wasn't going to be able to attend the meeting today; and also Secretary Alice Rodgers to give the COA Report. Chairperson O'Neal stated that she had asked Architect, Commissioner Sober (who had attended the COA Subcommittee meeting) to please present the COA Subcommittee Report to the Commission from the March 11th meeting; and Commissioner Sober stated that he would be happy to give the report.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

Chairperson O'Neal briefly informed the COA applicants of the COA processing procedures of how their proposals would be reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission for a final determination.

Chairperson O'Neal stated that the Commission was going to move to COA Agenda Item #2, and review Jeri Tucker and Meridith Harrison's proposal first because COA Agenda Item #1 was unable to attend the meeting.

2. 614 N. Cheyenne Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Jeri Tucker/Meridith Harrison

Request: Enclose 16' x 10' porch on south side of house with siding and four windows. Siding and trim will match existing in materials, dimensions and directional orientation. Windows will be vinyl to match existing.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

03-11-2008

APPROVAL W/O CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Jeri Tucker and Meridith Harrison's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in Brady Heights Neighborhood District.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Ms. Tucker and Ms. Harrison plan to enclose their 16' x 10' porch on the south side of the house with siding and four (4) windows. Mr. Sharrer stated that they want to enclose the porch for living space for a sun room. He stated that the siding and trim will match the existing in materials,

dimensions and directional orientation. Mr. Sharrer added that the windows will be vinyl to match the existing.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal for *Additions in Brady Heights*.

Chairperson O'Neal asked Commissioner Sober to please give his report of the recommendation that was made on this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Commissioner Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Ms. Tucker and Ms. Harrison's application to be complete after being reviewed at the March 11, 2008 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a majority vote to approve their proposal for *Additions to the Brady Heights Historic District*.

Chairperson O'Neal opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on Ms. Tucker and Ms. Harrison's proposal; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission further discussed their proposal, Commissioner Sober made a motion to approve Ms. Tucker and Ms. Harrison's application. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Jeri Tucker and Meridith Harrison's application:

- (1) Chairperson O'Neal;
- (2) Charles Gilmore;
- (3) Jack Hodgson;
- (4) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (5) Dusty Peck;
- (6) Paula Wood;
- (7) Bob Sober;
- (8) Jim Turner;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None;

All not present during this vote:

None.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Jeri Tucker & Meridith Harrison's proposal based on guidelines for Additions, Preferred Option, Paragraphs #1, #2 & #3; Building Materials and Elements, Paragraph #1; and Porches, Paragraph #1 for Additions to Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

3. 715 N. Denver Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Joseph Crosier

Request:

1. Remove aluminum siding from soffits and replace deteriorated original beaded boards with new 5.5" tongue-in-groove wood beaded boards. Replicate original corbels and install in original locations along soffit;

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 03-11-2008

APPROVAL W/O CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Joseph Crosier's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in Brady Heights Neighborhood District.

Mr. Sharrer stated that on Part 1 of 5 Parts of Mr. Crosier's application that he plans to remove the aluminum siding from the soffits and replace the deteriorated original beaded boards with new 5.5" tongue-in-groove wood beaded boards. He added that Mr. Crosier would also like to replicate the original corbels and install them in their original locations along the soffit.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal to *Restore in Brady Heights*.

Chairperson O'Neal asked Commissioner Sober to please give his report of the recommendation that was made on Part 1 of this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Commissioner Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part 1 of Mr. Crosier's application to be complete after being reviewed at the March 11, 2008 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to approve Part 1 of the proposal to *Restore* in the Brady Heights Historic District.

Chairperson O'Neal opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on Part 1 of Mr. Crosier's proposal; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission further discussed Part 1 of Mr. Crosier's proposal, Commissioner Sober made a motion to approve Part 1 of Mr. Crosier's application. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Part 1 of 5 Parts of Joseph Crosier's application:

- (1) Chairperson O'Neal;
- (2) Charles Gilmore;
- (3) Jack Hodgson;
- (4) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (5) Dusty Peck;
- (6) Paula Wood;
- (7) Bob Sober;
- (8) Jim Turner;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None;

All not present during this vote:

None.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part 1 of 5 Parts of Joseph Crosier's proposal based on guidelines for Brady Heights property owners from Paragraphs #1, #2 & #3; and from Building Wall Materials, Preferred Option, Paragraph #1 for Restoring Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

3. 715 N. Denver Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Joseph Crosier

Request:

2. Re-hang original lantern fixture on front elevation;

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

03-11-2008

DENIED

Mr. Sharrer presented Joseph Crosier's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in Brady Heights Neighborhood District.

Mr. Sharrer stated that on Part 2 of 5 Parts of Mr. Crosier's application that he plans to re-hang an original lantern fixture on front elevation of the structure. Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Crosier stated that the lantern will hang about 8' from the soffit.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal to *Restore in Brady Heights*.

Chairperson O'Neal asked Commissioner Sober to please give his report of the recommendation that was made on Part 2 of this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Commissioner Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part 2 of Mr. Crosier's application to be complete after being reviewed at the March 11, 2008 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to deny Part 2 of the proposal. Commissioner Sober stated that the Subcommittee wasn't sure if the lantern was original; and that Mr. Crosier had no evidence of proving that the lantern was original. He stated that the Subcommittee was given the opportunity to review the lantern; but not how the lantern will hang from the soffit after it's connected to the chain and attached to the structure.

Commissioner Sober stated that the Subcommittee also believes that after the lantern is hung that there should be some stability and no movement from the lantern when it becomes windy.

Chairperson O'Neal opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on Part 2 of Mr. Crosier's proposal; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission further discussed Part 2 of Mr.

Crosier's proposal, Commissioner Sober made a motion to deny Part 2 of Mr. Crosier's application. Commissioner Turner seconded.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Deny Part 2 of 5 Parts of Joseph Crosier's application:

- (1) Chairperson O'Neal – In Favor to Deny;
- (2) Charles Gilmore – In Favor to Deny;
- (3) Jack Hodgson – In Favor to Deny;
- (4) Mary Lee Townsend – In Favor to Deny;
- (5) Dusty Peck – In Favor to Deny;
- (6) Paula Wood – In Favor to Deny;
- (7) Bob Sober – In Favor to Deny;
- (8) Jim Turner – In Favor to Deny;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None;

All not present during this vote:

None.

The motion to deny was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Denied Part 2 of 5 Parts of Joseph Crosier's proposal based on guidelines for Brady Heights property owners from Paragraphs #1, #2 & #3; and from Building Wall Materials, Preferred Option, Paragraph #1 for Restoring Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

3. 715 N. Denver Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Joseph Crosier

Request:

3. Replace deteriorated aluminum storm windows with new custom-built wood storm windows;

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

03-11-2008

APPROVAL W/O CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Joseph Crosier's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in Brady Heights Neighborhood District.

Mr. Sharrer stated that on Part 3 of 5 Parts of Mr. Crosier's application that he plans to replace the deteriorated aluminum storm windows with new custom-built wood storm windows.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal to *Restore in Brady Heights*.

Chairperson O'Neal asked Commissioner Sober to please give his report of the recommendation that was made on Part 3 of this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Commissioner Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part 3 of Mr. Crosier's application to be complete after being reviewed at the March 11, 2008 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to approve Part 3 of the proposal.

Chairperson O'Neal opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on Part 3 of Mr. Crosier's proposal; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission further discussed Part 3 of Mr. Crosier's proposal, Commissioner Sober made a motion to approve Part 3 of Mr. Crosier's application. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Part 3 of 5 Parts of Joseph Crosier's application:

- (1) Chairperson O'Neal;
- (2) Charles Gilmore;
- (3) Jack Hodgson;
- (4) Mary Lee Townsend;

- (5) Dusty Peck;
- (6) Paula Wood;
- (7) Bob Sober;
- (8) Jim Turner;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None;

All not present during this vote:

None.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part 3 of 5 Parts of Joseph Crosier's proposal based on guidelines for Windows and Doors – Accessories, Paragraph #1, for Restoring Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

3. 715 N. Denver Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Joseph Crosier

Request:

- 4. Remove aluminum window trim. Repair and/or replace existing original wood trim, matching dimensions and detailing;

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

03-11-2008

APPROVAL W/O CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Joseph Crosier's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in Brady Heights Neighborhood District.

Mr. Sharrer stated that on Part 4 of 5 Parts of Mr. Crosier's application that he plans to remove the aluminum window trim from the windows; and repair and/or replace the existing original wood trim on the windows with matching dimensions and detailing.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal to *Restore in Brady Heights*.

Chairperson O'Neal asked Commissioner Sober to please give his report of the recommendation that was made on Part 4 of this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Commissioner Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part 4 of Mr. Crosier's application to be complete after being reviewed at the March 11, 2008 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to approve Part 4 of the proposal.

Chairperson O'Neal opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on Part 4 of Mr. Crosier's proposal; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission further discussed Part 4 of Mr. Crosier's proposal, Commissioner Sober made a motion to approve Part 4 of Mr. Crosier's application. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Part 4 of 5 Parts of Joseph Crosier's application:

- (1) Chairperson O'Neal;
- (2) Charles Gilmore;
- (3) Jack Hodgson;
- (4) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (5) Dusty Peck;
- (6) Paula Wood;
- (7) Bob Sober;
- (8) Jim Turner;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None;

All not present during this vote:

None.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part 4 of 5 Parts of Joseph Crosier's proposal based on guidelines for Windows and Doors, Preferred Option, Paragraph #1; and Second Preference, Paragraph #3 for Restoring Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

3. 715 N. Denver Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Joseph Crosier

Request:

5. Remove non-original aluminum window on southeast corner of house. Replace with original leaded glass window, cut down to fit smaller window opening from previous rehabilitation. Window will be trimmed out to match original window trim detailing. Patched window opening will be covered with stucco to match house.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

03-11-2008

DENIED

Mr. Sharrer presented Joseph Crosier's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the structure in Brady Heights Neighborhood District.

Mr. Sharrer stated that on Part 5 of 5 Parts of Mr. Crosier's application that he plans to remove the non-original aluminum window on the southeast corner of the structure; and replace it with the original leaded glass window that had been cut down to fit a smaller window opening from previous rehabilitation. He stated that the window will be trimmed out to match the original window trim detailing. Mr. Sharrer added that the patched window opening will be covered with stucco to match the house.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal to *Restore in Brady Heights*.

Chairperson O'Neal asked Commissioner Sober to please give his report of the recommendation that was made on Part 5 of this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Commissioner Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part 5 of Mr. Crosier's application to be complete after being reviewed at the March 11, 2008 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to deny Part 5 of the proposal. Commissioner Sober stated that the Subcommittee believes that Mr. Crosier's request is inappropriate for the structure.

Chairperson O'Neal opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on Part 5 of Mr. Crosier's proposal; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission further discussed Part 5 of Mr. Crosier's proposal, Commissioner Sober made a motion to deny Part 5 of Mr. Crosier's application. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Deny Part 5 of 5 Parts of Joseph Crosier's application:

- (1) Chairperson O'Neal – In Favor to Deny;
- (2) Charles Gilmore – In Favor to Deny;
- (3) Jack Hodgson – In Favor to Deny;
- (4) Mary Lee Townsend – In Favor to Deny;
- (5) Dusty Peck – In Favor to Deny;
- (6) Paula Wood – In Favor to Deny;
- (7) Bob Sober – In Favor to Deny;
- (8) Jim Turner – In Favor to Deny;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None;

All not present during this vote:

None.

The motion to Deny was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Denied Part 5 of 5 Parts of Joseph Crosier's proposal based on guidelines for Windows and Doors, Paragraphs #1, & #2; and from Building Wall Materials, Preferred Option, Paragraph

#2 for Restoring Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

1. 1807 E. 16th Street (Yorktown)

Applicant: Michael Sherwin

Request: Construct a new single family house on the lot according to revised plans submitted (Final Review).

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

03-11-2008

APPROVAL W/ CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Michael Sherwin's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review of the new construction project; and a slide presentation was shown of the vacant lot and of the new structure in the Yorktown Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Sherwin was unable to attend the meeting today; and that he was also unable to have a representative come on his behalf for him today. He stated that Mr. Sherwin's architect did come to one of the COA Subcommittee meetings to answer some of the questions that were asked by the Subcommittee.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Sherwin plans to construct a new single family home on a 45' wide lot at 1807 E. 16th Street according to the revised plans that he has submitted to the Commission for a final review.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal for *New Construction in Yorktown*.

Chairperson O'Neal asked Commissioner Sober to please give his report of the recommendation that was made on this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Commissioner Sober stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Sherwin's application to be complete after being reviewed at the March 11, 2008 meeting. He stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote to approve Mr. Sherwin's new construction project proposal with no conditions for *New Construction* in the Yorktown District.

Chairperson O'Neal opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on Mr. Sherwin's proposal; and for a motion to be made.

Architect/Commissioner Turner stated after reviewing Mr. Sherwin's revised plans that he had concerns with the front window eave brackets; the dormer and with the concrete block on the foundation wall.

Legal Advisor, Kurt Ackermann stated that he was assuming from staff's presentation that the property owner was not present at any of the previous COA Subcommittee meetings to share his needs and desires for his property. Chairperson O'Neal stated that this is the 3rd meeting that we have had regarding this proposal; and that the architect has attended one meeting; and that the property owner hasn't attended any of the meetings. Mr. Ackermann stated that he brings this point up because the ordinance gives the Commission the opportunity to balance the design guidelines with the needs and desires of the property owner, but when the property owner doesn't appear at the meetings it's hard for the COA Subcommittee and Commission to achieve that balance.

After the Commission further discussed their proposal, Commissioner Sober made a motion to approve Mr. Sherwin's application with the following conditions:

- ◇ To install four (4) brackets on the front gable, center two (2) above each window on the front; and center two (2) above each innermost column;
- ◇ Extend the width of the studio dormer by 12", 6" on each side; &
- ◇ Two (2) courses of concrete block on the foundation wall should be split face block, painted.

Commissioner Peck seconded.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve Michael Sherwin's application with conditions:

- (1) Chairperson O'Neal;
- (2) Charles Gilmore;
- (3) Jack Hodgson;
- (4) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (5) Dusty Peck;
- (6) Paula Wood;
- (7) Bob Sober;
- (8) Jim Turner;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None;

All not present during this vote:

None.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Michael Sherwin's proposal based on guidelines for New Residential Construction for the Yorktown Historic District.

b. Rules & Regulations Committee

i. Review of Proposed Changes to Rules of Procedure

Rules & Regulations Committee Chairman Charles Gilmore reported that a copy of the proposed amended Rules & Regulations Governing Procedure had been distributed to the Commission earlier today. He made a motion to ask the Commission to accept the proposed changes that have been made and brought before it to adopt into the Rules of Procedure. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

By a show of hands, all "In Favor" of the motion to Approve and Adopt the changes into the Rules of Procedure:

- (1) Chairperson O'Neal;
- (2) Charles Gilmore;
- (3) Jack Hodgson;
- (4) Mary Lee Townsend;
- (5) Dusty Peck;
- (6) Paula Wood;
- (7) Bob Sober;
- (8) Jim Turner;

All Opposed:

None;

All Abstaining:

None;

All not present during this vote:

None.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

- c. **Outreach Committee**
No information was reported.

4. Chair Report

Chairperson O'Neal reported that she received a phone call about a luncheon on Monday, April 28th; and that the Commission has been invited to attend. She stated that the luncheon will be at the Mayo Hotel from noon to 1:00 p.m.; and that it will cost \$25 a person. Chairperson O'Neal stated that Commercial Developer, Tony Goldman will be speaking at the luncheon. She stated that Mr. Goldman has been involved developing districts in New York, Boston and Philadelphia. Chairperson O'Neal stated that Mr. Goldman will be here to speak about designating and using tax credits for downtown revitalization. Chairperson O'Neal added that she will mention to the Commission about the luncheon again at our April 10th Regular meeting.

Chairperson O'Neal reported that after reviewing March Staff Report that she was happy about the National Trust selecting several of our field session proposals that includes the Historic Gardens of Tulsa and the Perryman's Cemetery.

5. Staff Report

The March Staff Report was emailed to the Commission prior to this meeting.

6. Absence Report

There were no absences to report.

7. Other Business

- a. Michelle Cantrell – Conservation Districts
Commissioner Cantrell was unable to attend this meeting. Conservation Districts will be placed on the April 10th agenda for review.

10. Adjournment

There being no other business, Chairperson O'Neal adjourned the meeting at 12:55 p.m. The Tulsa Preservation Commission Special Meeting Minutes of March 18, 2008 were transcribed by Fannie Warrior.

Note: Please notify Mrs. Warrior by e-mail at Fwarrior@ci.tulsa.ok.us that you have received the information forwarded to you. Project plans will be available at the Planning Department office for review.

*K:/Planning/FW/MINS 03 18 2008S TPC
Minutes Approved by TPC on 04 10 2008*