



REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
OF THE

TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Thursday, January 10, 2008, 11:00 a.m.

111 South Greenwood, 2nd Floor - Conference Rooms A&B
Tulsa, OK 74120-1820

1. **Roll Call** – Vice-Chairperson O’Neal called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:04 a.m., and Mrs. Warrior announced the Roll Call.

Members Present:

Vice-Chairperson, Breniss O’Neal, Professional Landscape Designer;
Secretary, Barbara Smallwood;
Dusty Peck, Community Group Resident;
Bob Winchester, Professional Banker;
Bob Sober, Arts Commissioner;
Mary Lee Townsend, Professional Historian; &
Alice Rodgers, Owner, Non-residential Representative.
Paula Wood, Professional Tulsa Public Schools Representative;
Jack Hodgson, Professional Real Estate Broker;
Michelle Cantrell, Planning Commissioner;
Kristen Bergman, Community Group Resident;

Member(s) Absent:

Chairman, Jim Turner;
Charles Gilmore, Professional Developer;

Others Present:

Amanda DeCort, Ed Sharrer, Fannie Warrior, Kurt Ackermann, Susan McKee, Will Wilkins, Lauren Wagner, Jeremy Brennan, & David Breed.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal announced that she would like to take a few moments to welcome Professional Tulsa Public Schools Representative, Paula Wood to the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the Commission is very happy to have her; and she thanked her for being here. The Commission welcomed Ms. Wood to the Board and they also applauded.

2. Committee Reports

a. Historic Preservation Committee

i. Announcement of Conflicts of Interest

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal asked the Commission if anyone had a conflict of interest with any of the Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) Requests that would be brought before the board for review. No one responded to having a conflict of interest with any of the proposals.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal briefly informed the COA applicants of the COA processing procedures of how their proposals would be reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission for a final determination.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the Commission was going to move to COA Agenda Item #2, and review Jeremy Brennan's proposal first due to an emergency that Mr. Brennan has to attend shortly.

2. 1160 N. Cheyenne Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Jeremy Brennan, homeowner

Request: Install custom painted storm windows from Tabko to protect the original historic windows and increase energy efficiency.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:
01-08-2008

APPROVED W/O CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Jeremy Brennan's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide

presentation was shown of the structure in Brady Heights Neighborhood District.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Brennan plan to install custom painted storm windows by Tabko Aluminum Products to protect the original historic windows and increase energy efficiency. He stated that the proposed storm windows will be sized to each opening.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal for *Restoring Existing Structures in Brady Heights*.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal asked Secretary Smallwood to please give her report of the recommendation that was made on this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Secretary Smallwood stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Brennan's application to be complete after being reviewed at the January 8, 2008 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended unanimously to approve Mr. Brennan's proposal to *Restore* in the Brady Heights Historic District.

The Commission complimented Mr. Brennan on the custom made windows that he plans to install; and it also applauded him for a job well done.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on Mr. Brennan's proposal; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission further discussed Mr. Brennan's proposal, Secretary Smallwood made a motion to approve Mr. Brennan's application. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Jeremy Brennan's application w/o conditions:

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;

Secretary Smallwood – Aye;

Jack Hodgson – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Bob Sober – Aye;

Kristen Bergman – Aye;

Michelle Cantrell – Aye;

Dusty Peck – Aye;

Bob Winchester – Aye;

Alice Rodgers – Aye; &

Paula Wood - Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Jeremy Brennan's proposal based on guidelines for Windows & Doors – Accessories, Paragraph #1 for Restoring Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal moved back to COA Agenda Item #1, Will Wilkins for Novus Homes in Brady Heights for the Commission to review.

1. 656 N. Cheyenne Avenue (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Will Wilkins for Novus Homes

Request: Construct a new single-family house on the lot according to revised plans submitted. Preliminary review was held 11/20/07. **Final Review**

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

01-08-2008

APPROVED W/O CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented his presentation to the Commission on Mr. Will Wilkins proposal by Novus Homes L.L.C., for New Construction in Brady Heights. Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Wilkins plans to construct a new single-family home on the lot at 656 N. Cheyenne Avenue according to the revised plans that he has submitted to the Commission for review. Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Wilkins plans to build a single story home with an attached 2-car garage on the 82.30' X 76.50' vacant property.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Wilkins plans to install lap siding (point five 316); 30 year OC Arch. Roof shingles; Great Random Shake Siding on the North and South elevations of the structure; with a gable dormer; four (4) pre-cast columns; with light fixtures that are 14" tall and 9" square. Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Wilkins' home has a 6' front set back. He stated that the neighboring properties to the North and South of Mr. Wilkins' new construction have a 38' front set back to the North; a 21' front set back to the South; and directly across the street from his new project that the properties have a 6' front set back.

Mr. Sharrer verbally read the appropriate design guidelines for this proposal for *New Construction* in the Brady Heights Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer stated that the COA Subcommittee had denied Mr. Wilkin's application for new construction based largely on the 6' front set back. He stated that Mr. Wilkins has new information from Duane Cuthbertson, staff to the Board of Adjustment (BOA)/Indian Nations Council of Governments (INCOG) that he would like to share with the Commission regarding the front set back.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that the Commission will allow Mr. Wilkins to share his new information with the Commission after Secretary Smallwood gives her report on Mr. Wilkins' proposal from the COA Subcommittee meeting, which she then requested.

Secretary Smallwood stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Wilkin's application to be complete after being reviewed at the January 8, 2008 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended by a majority vote to deny (due to the front set back) Mr. Wilkin's proposal for *New Construction* in the Brady Heights Historic District.

Secretary Smallwood stated that the Subcommittee was very pleased with the design of the house; and that the Subcommittee felt that it is appropriate for the neighborhood with the exception of the 6' front set back. She stated that all of their discussion related to the set back issue. Secretary Smallwood read aloud the guidelines pertaining to setbacks in the Brady Heights Neighborhood stating that: Under Building Site (Paragraph #1) for New Residential Construction, "New Construction and relocated structures should maintain the setbacks for the front and side yards as established by the other buildings along the same street." Secretary Smallwood stated that you have the issue of this property being on a corner lot with only four (4) properties on the entire block; and that you have the issue of having a much smaller lot compared to the other lots on that street. She stated that directly across the street are the 6' setbacks that Brady Heights Representative, Tim Williams explained to the COA Subcommittee that used to have a deeper setback; but that the City of Tulsa widened the street of Cheyenne Avenue. Secretary Smallwood stated that after the City of Tulsa widened Cheyenne Avenue that it reduced the setback on the other side of the street the Mr. Wilkins plans to build this new project on. She stated that to the North of the property it has a 38' front set back; and a 21' front set back to the South of the property; and Mr. Wilkins' setback is 6'. Secretary Smallwood stated that with having all these multiple setbacks along the same street that Mr. Wilkin's

request to have a 6' setback does not meet the appropriate guidelines for Brady Heights.

Secretary Smallwood stated that the majority vote (with one member voting against the motion) was to deny the proposal; but only due to the 6' setback.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal stated that Mr. Wilkins has some new information from INCOG that he would like to share with us. Mr. Wilkins stated that he met with Duane Cuthbertson; and that Mr. Cuthbertson explained to him that since an RS-4 zoning requirement has a 20' front set back; with an overall of 45' (25'+20') from the curb of the street; and with Cheyenne Avenue being 80' wide (40' + 5') that the 6' setback was appropriate. Mr. Wilkins added that Mr. Cuthbertson told him that he was within the RS-4 zoning guidelines; and that there won't be any need for a variance on the front setback.

Susan McKee asked the Commission, if the Commission approved this new construction project with a 6' front setback, will the new houses next to it have to have a 6' front setback also. The Commission responded by stating that the new houses would likely have the same 6' front setback.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal opened the floor for discussion and asked the Commission to please take into consideration of the new information that Mr. Wilkins has brought before it from INCOG about the front setback. After the Commission discussed this matter; Vice-Chairperson O'Neal asked if someone would like to make a motion. Secretary Smallwood stated that she would like to first make a motion that was recommended by the COA Subcommittee to deny the proposal (only based on the setback). After Secretary Smallwood's motion was made, it died due to the lack of a second.

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve Mr. Wilkins' New Construction project/plans at 656 N. Cheyenne Avenue with no conditions. Commissioner Bergman seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Will Wilkins for Novus Homes' application w/o conditions:

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Secretary Smallwood – Aye;
Jack Hodgson – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Bob Sober – Aye;
Kristen Bergman – Aye;
Michelle Cantrell – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye;
Bob Winchester – Aye;
Alice Rodgers – **Nay**; &
Paula Wood - Aye.

The motion was **Approved by Majority by members present and voting.**

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Will Wilkins for Novus Homes' proposal based on guidelines for New Residential Construction in the Brady Heights Historic District.

3. 1623 S. Rockford Avenue (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Shelby Navarro for Tulsa Loft Project

Request: Demolish existing 1925 Craftsman bungalow to clear building site for new construction.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

01-08-2008

DENIED

Mr. Sharrer presented his presentation to the Commission on Shelby Navarro's proposal to demolish the structure at 1623 S. Rockford Avenue in Swan Lake. Mr. Sharrer stated that Shelby Navarro plans to demolish the existing 1925 Craftsman bungalow to clear this building site for new construction.

Mr. Sharrer distributed a 9-page structural inspection of the residence to the Commission for review of an inspection that was prepared by Ford Engineering on October 14, 2004. Mr. Sharrer stated that Ford Engineering's report recommended eleven (11) repairs to be made to the structure starting from the basement to the roof. Mr. Sharrer stated that some specifics noted from the Ford Engineering inspection report stated that there was some floor damage; rot in the siding; and some mold. The structure had been vacant since 2005. Mr. Sharrer added that the structure is considered to be a contributing structure to the district and has been since the 1994 Intensive Level Survey of Swan Lake.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal for *Demolitions in Swan Lake*.

Chairperson O'Neal stated that she visited the property; and that there was some damage, but that the structure had potential for rehabilitation. The Commission believes that the 1925 Craftsman bungalow home can be rehabilitated; and that Mr. Navarro's request for demolition does not meet guidelines section F.1.0.1 under Demolition of Structures for the Swan Lake District. It reads: Structures should first be rehabilitated, modified, or altered to achieve a continued, useful state, when reasonably possible. Demolition should be utilized only upon determining that the use of the property cannot be achieved through the above methods.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal asked Secretary Smallwood to please give her report of the recommendation that was made on this proposal at the COA Subcommittee meeting.

Secretary Smallwood stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Navarro's application to be complete after being reviewed at the January 8, 2008 meeting. She stated that the COA Subcommittee recommended unanimously to deny Mr. Navarro's proposal for *Demolition* in the Swan Lake Historic District.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on Mr. Navarro's application; and for a motion to be made. Secretary Smallwood made a motion to deny Mr. Navarro's application based on guidelines from section F.1.0.1 as indicated above. Commissioner Peck seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Deny Shelby Navarro's application:

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye to Deny;

Secretary Smallwood – Aye to Deny;

Jack Hodgson – Aye to Deny;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye to Deny;

Bob Sober – Aye to Deny;

Kristen Bergman – Aye to Deny;

Michelle Cantrell – Aye to Deny;

Dusty Peck – Aye to Deny;

Bob Winchester – Aye to Deny;

Alice Rodgers – Aye to Deny; &

Paula Wood – Aye to Deny.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously to Deny** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Denied Shelby Navarro's proposal based on guidelines for Demolition of Structures for the Swan Lake Historic District.

b. Rules & Regulations Committee

No information was reported.

c. Outreach Committee

Outreach Committee Chair, Kristen Bergman shared with the Commission a few of the Outreach Committee Communications Plans for 2008, such as:

- ◇ The Committee's goals for 2008,
- ◇ Key messages for all outbound communications activities,
- ◇ Guest Editorial opportunities in the Tulsa World; &
- ◇ To create a media contact list.

Committee Chair Bergman stated that they are in the process of scheduling a committee meeting within the next month.

4. Election of New Officers for 2008

- ◇ **Vice-Chairperson - Barbara Smallwood &**
- ◇ **Secretary - Alice Rodgers**

By acclamation, the TPC elected:

- ◇ Barbara Smallwood for Vice-Chairperson for 2008; &
- ◇ Alice Rodgers for Secretary for 2008.

The Rules and Regulations Governing Procedure of the Tulsa Preservation Commission under Article III, Membership, Section 1, Term of Office states that:

“Officers of the Preservation Commission shall consist of the Chair, Vice-Chair, and Secretary. The Preservation Commission shall annually elect from its appointed members a Vice-Chair and Secretary. *The Vice-Chair shall succeed the Chair during the forthcoming year.* Officers shall not succeed themselves in the same office. Officers shall serve until a successor has been elected and qualified.” (Sec. 1052.G)

5. Chair Report

New TPC Chairperson Breniss O'Neal reported that an article was in the Tulsa World about the City of Tulsa honoring architect Herb Fritz and architect Rex Ball. She distributed a copy of the article to the Commission for review. The Commission was very pleased with the

article that Chairperson O'Neal was responsible for having published in the Tulsa World on January 4, 2008.

Chairperson O'Neal reported that last month a motion was made to accept Tim Williams as Brady Heights Liaison until pending clarification was resolved from the Mayor's Office. It was not clear to the Commission if Mr. Williams would be able to serve on the TPC Board as a Community Group Resident; and also as a Liaison/Representative for the Brady Heights Neighborhood. Chairperson O'Neal would like for staff to place on next months' agenda about whether or not a TPC member can serve on both boards of the TPC and the COA Subcommittee.

6. Staff Report

Staff reported that the TPC Annual Retreat will be held on Saturday, January 26, 2008, at 9:00 a.m., at Cyntergy AEC, 320 S. Boston Avenue, 12th Floor.

Staff distributed a publication on the 2008 National Preservation Conference on Education Session Proposals for the Commission to review. The National Trust for Historic Preservation would like the Commission to submit a proposal for an education session for the National Preservation Conference in Tulsa, OK, October 21 – 25, 2008. The National Trust seeks proposals that explore critical issues that challenge communities across the country and present cutting-edge historic preservation strategies and models that address these. The National Trust uses an internet-based session proposal submission system, which is accessible through the conference website, www.nthpconference.org. Staff reported that the National Trust for Historic Preservation has moved their field session proposal deadline back due to the ice storm. For more information, please contact Amanda DeCort.

Staff reported that Tulsa, Oklahoma has been officially designated by the White House as a "Preserve America" Community and that the Mayor's Office is finalizing a press release about this news.

7. Absence Report

There were no absences to report.

8. New Business

Chairperson O'Neal announced that the TPC Holiday Party at her home last week went very well. She stated that fabulous plaques were given to acknowledge Herb Fritz and Rex Ball by the Mayor's Office. Architect,

Herb Fritz was honored with plaques for his 15 years service to the City of Tulsa; and Architect, Rex Ball was also honored for serving 10 years on the Tulsa Preservation Commission Board.

Board member of Southwest Chamber and prior TPC Commissioner, David Breed reported that the Centennial Commemorative Sign was erected on the "Route 66 Station – Gateway to the Magic Empire" site on the eve of Statehood Day 2007. Mr. Breed is very proud of the Chamber's accomplishment from their planning efforts of more than 20 years. He distributed a photograph to the Commission of the beautiful sign for their review. The Commission applauded Mr. Breed for a job well done.

9. Other Business

None.

This agenda item is reserved for public comment or preservations to the TPC.

10. Adjournment

There being no other business, Chairperson O'Neal adjourned the meeting at 12:34 p.m. The Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Minutes of January 10, 2008 were transcribed by Fannie Warrior.

Note: Please notify Mrs. Warrior by e-mail at Fwarrior@ci.tulsa.ok.us that you have received the information forwarded to you. Project plans will be available at the Planning Department office for review.

*K:/Planning/FW/MINS 01 10 2008R TPC
Minutes Approved by TPC on 02-14-2008*