



REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
OF THE

TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Thursday, December 13, 2007, 10:00 a.m.

**111 South Greenwood, 2nd Floor - Conference Rooms A&B
Tulsa, OK 74120-1820**

1. **Roll Call** – Chairman Turner called the regular meeting to order at 10:00 a.m., and Mrs. Warrior announced the Roll Call.

Members Present:

Chairman, Jim Turner;
Vice-Chairperson, Breniss O’Neal, Professional Landscape Designer;
Dusty Peck, Community Group Resident;
Charles Gilmore, Professional Developer;
Bob Winchester, Professional Banker;
Bill Andoe, Arts Commissioner;
Mary Lee Townsend, Professional Historian; &
Alice Rodgers, Owner, Non-residential Representative.

Member(s) Absent:

Secretary, Barbara Smallwood;
Paula Wood, Professional Tulsa Public Schools Representative;
Jack Hodgson, Professional Real Estate Broker;
Michelle Cantrell, Planning Commissioner;
Kristen Bergman, Community Group Resident;

Others Present:

Amanda DeCort, Ed Sharrer, Fannie Warrior, Kurt Ackermann, Jim Kincaid, Jud Radford, Sally Davis, Jim Lane, Miriam Young, Steve Olsen & Paul Munoz.

**2. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting
for Regular Meeting Minutes for November 8, 2007**

Chairman Turner asked if there was a motion on the floor to approve the Regular meeting minutes for November 8, 2007.

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes for November 8, 2007. Commissioner Peck seconded.

**Roll Call Vote to Approve Regular Meeting Minutes for
November 8, 2007:**

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairperson O’Neal – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Dusty Peck – Aye;

Bob Winchester – Aye; &

Alice Rodgers – Was not present during this vote.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

3. Committee Reports

Vice-Chairperson O’Neal announced that the Tulsa Preservation Commission Legal Advisor/Attorney, Kurt Ackermann has prepared a statement for her to read regarding suspension of Certificates of Appropriateness from the Tulsa Preservation Commission Rules & Regulations Governing Procedure.

Vice-Chairperson O’Neal announced to Chairman Turner that in consideration of the fact that the COA Subcommittee was unable to meet this week due to the recent ice storm that she would like to make a motion that the Tulsa Preservation Commission suspend Article VI, Section 3D; and the first sentence of Article VI, Section 3E of the Rules & Regulations in order to allow the TPC to review the COA applications appearing on today’s agenda without a recommendation from the COA Subcommittee; and also to allow the TPC to determine whether the COA applications are deemed complete. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

**Roll Call Vote to suspend Article VI, Section 3D; and the first
sentence in Article VI, Section 3E of the TPC Rules &
Regulations:**

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairperson O’Neal – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Bill Andoe – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye;
Bob Winchester – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers – Was not present during this vote.
The motion was **Approved Unanimously by members present and voting.**

a. Historic Preservation Committee

i. Announcement of Conflicts of Interest

Chairman Turner asked the Commission if anyone had a conflict of interest with any of the eight (8) Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) Requests that would be brought before the board for review. No one responded to having a conflict of interest with any of the proposals.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

Chairman Turner briefly informed the COA applicants of the COA processing procedures of how their proposals would be reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission for a final determination.

Mr. Sharrer informed Chairman Turner that applicant #2, Novus Homes have withdrawn his application from the agenda; and that the Commission would only review seven (7) COA applications instead of eight (8).

- 1. 2132 E. 19th Street (Yorktown)
Applicant: White Sands Development
Request: Construct a new single-family house on the lot according to plans submitted.
Application Completion Date: 12-13-2007
APPROVED W/O CONDITIONS**

Mr. Sharrer presented Jud Radford's Certificate of Appropriateness application representing White Sands Development to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the vacant property in the Yorktown Neighborhood District where the new construction project is planned to be built.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Radford plans to construct a new single-family house on the lot according to the plans that he has submitted for the Commission to review.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal for *New Construction in Yorktown*.

After the Commission reviewed this project and asked questions to Mr. Radford regarding to the windows, doors, roof, siding and other materials pertaining to this new construction project; the Commission complimented Mr. Radford on the proposal.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on Mr. Radford's proposal; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission discussed Mr. Radford's proposal, Commissioner Winchester made a motion to approve Mr. Radford's application as submitted; and deem the application complete. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

Chairman Turner asked the Commission if it had any other comments or questions on this proposal. Hearing no response from the Commission, the Commission then voted.

Roll Call Vote to Approve White Sands Development application as submitted w/o conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye;
Bob Winchester – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved White Sands Development's proposal based on guidelines for General Requirements, C.1.01, C.1.0.2 & C.1.0.3; Building Site, C.1.1.1, C.1.1.2, C.1.1.3, C.1.1.4 & C.1.1.5; Building Materials, C.1.2.1; & Engineering Systems, Mechanical, Electrical & Plumbing, C.1.3.1 & C.1.3.2 for New Residential Construction for Yorktown Historic District.

Mr. Sharrer presented all 4 Parts of Jim Kincaid's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic home in the North Maple Ridge Neighborhood District.

3. 1003 E. 20th Street (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Jim Kincaid

Request:

1. Remove quarter-round windows on the third floor of the east and west elevations, enlarge openings, install six light wood casement windows.

Application Completion Date: 12-13-2007

APPROVED W/O CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 1 of 4 parts of Mr. Kincaid's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. He stated that Mr. Kincaid plans to remove the 24" (in height) round windows on the third floor of the structure on the east and west elevations; enlarge their openings to an estimated 68" per casement window; and install six (6) light wood casement windows in its place.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines for Part 1 of this proposal on *Rehabilitation in North Maple Ridge*.

Mr. Kincaid stated that the windows are deteriorating; and that they paint the windows every six months due to the rust. He stated that he thought that it wouldn't be wise to replace the windows with what was there; and knowing that it will add mass to the house.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission discussed Part 1 of Mr. Kincaid's proposal, Commissioner Gilmore made a motion to approve Part 1 of this application and to deem it complete. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

Chairman Turner asked the Commission if it had any other comments or questions on Part 1 of this proposal. Hearing no response from the Commission; the Commission then voted on Part 1 of the application.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Part 1 of 4 parts of Jim Kincaid's application w/o conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye;
Bob Winchester – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part 1 of Jim Kincaid's proposal based on guidelines for Windows & Doors, A.1.2.1, A.1.2.3, A.1.2.4 & A.1.2.5 for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

3. 1003 E. 20th Street (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Jim Kincaid

2. Replace deteriorated French doors and sidelights on southeast corner of first floor with three sets of divided light wood casement windows.

Application Completion Date: 12-13-2007

APPROVED W/O CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Part 2 of 4 parts of Mr. Kincaid's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. He stated that Mr. Kincaid plans to replace the deteriorated French doors and sidelights on the Southeast corner of the first floor with three sets of 26" x 68" divided light wood casement windows.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines for Part 2 of this proposal on *Rehabilitation in North Maple Ridge*.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission discussed Part 2 of Mr. Kincaid's proposal, Commissioner Gilmore made a motion to approve Part 2 of this application and to deem it complete. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

Chairman Turner asked the Commission if it had any other comments or questions on Part 2 of this proposal. Hearing no

response from the Commission, the Commission then voted on Part 2 of the application.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Part 2 of 4 parts of Jim Kincaid's application w/o conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye;
Bob Winchester – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part 2 of Jim Kincaid's proposal based on guidelines for Windows & Doors, A.1.2.1, A.1.2.3, A.1.2.4 & A.1.2.5 for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

3. **1003 E. 20th Street (North Maple Ridge)**
Applicant: Jim Kincaid
3. Replace fluted columns flanking front door with smooth, tapered, manufactured stone columns.
Application Completion Date: 12-13-2007
DENIED
- &
3. **1003 E. 20th Street (North Maple Ridge)**
Applicant: Jim Kincaid
4. Replace wrought iron railing on front porch and second floor balcony with new wrought iron railing.
Application Completion Date: 12-13-2007
DENIED

Mr. Sharrer presented Parts 3 & 4 of 4 parts of Mr. Kincaid's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. He stated that Mr. Kincaid plans to (Part 1) replace the fluted columns flanking the front door with smooth, tapered, manufactured stone columns; and replace the wrought iron railing on the front porch and 2nd floor balcony with a new wrought iron railing.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines for Parts 3 & 4 of this proposal on *Rehabilitation in North Maple Ridge*.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission discussed Parts 3 & 4 of Mr. Kincaid's proposal, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deny Parts 3 & 4 of this application and to deem both parts complete. Commissioner Townsend believes that the replacement of the columns; and the replacement of the wrought iron railing that Mr. Kincaid plans to replace don't meet the design guideline requirements; and that they are inappropriate to the neighborhood district. Commissioner Rodgers seconded.

Chairman Turner asked the Commission if it had any other comments or questions on Parts 3 & 4 of the proposal. Hearing no response from the Commission, the Commission then voted on Parts 3 & 4 of the application.

Roll Call Vote to Deny Parts 3 & 4 of 4 parts of Jim Kincaid's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye to Deny;

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye to Deny;

Charles Gilmore – Aye to Deny;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye to Deny;

Bill Andoe – Aye to Deny;

Dusty Peck – Aye to Deny;

Bob Winchester – Aye to Deny; &

Alice Rodgers – Aye to Deny.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously to Deny** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Denied Parts 3 & 4 of Jim Kincaid's proposal based on guidelines for Windows & Doors, A.1.2.1, A.1.2.2, A.1.2.3, A.1.2.4 & A.1.2.5; and from General Requirements, A.1.0.1, & Porches, A.1.4.1 & A.1.4.2 for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

- 4. 1618 S. Rockford Avenue (Swan Lake)
Applicant: Thomas Vinson & Miriam Young
Request: Construct one-story addition on rear (west) elevation of house according to plans submitted.
Application Completion Date: 12-13-2007
APPROVED W/CONDITIONS**

Mr. Sharrer presented Thomas Vinson & Miriam Young's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the Swan Lake historic home.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Vinson and Ms. Young plan to construct a one-story addition on the rear (west) elevation of the structure according to the plans submitted to the Commission for review.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal for *Additions in Swan Lake*.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on this application; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission discussed Mr. Vinson and Ms. Young's proposal, Commissioner Andoe made a motion to approve this application as submitted; and deem the application complete with the condition that:

- ◇ The applicants reuse the existing window hidden by previous construction if possible.

Commissioner Peck seconded.

Chairman Turner asked the Commission if it had any other comments or questions on this proposal. The Commission complimented the applicants on the addition and how well it will look upon completion. The Commission then voted on the proposal.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Thomas Vinson & Miriam Young's application w/conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye;
Bob Winchester – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Thomas Vinson & Miriam Young's proposal based on guidelines for General Requirements, B.1.01, B.1.0.2 & B.1.0.3; Building Materials & Elements, B.1.2.1, & B.1.2.2 for Additions to Existing Structures for Swan Lake Historic District.

5. 1552 S. Lewis Avenue (Yorktown)

Applicant: Jim Lane

Request:

**1. Replace existing faux garage doors with French doors;
APPROVED**

&

2. Add shutters to front doors and second floor windows.

Application Completion Date: 12-13-2007

APPROVED W/CONDITIONS

Mr. Sharrer presented Jim Lane's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the Yorktown historic home.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Lane plans to replace the existing faux garage doors with French doors; and add shutters to the front doors and second floor windows.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal for *Rehabilitation in Yorktown*.

Mr. Lane stated that he wasn't aware of our COA processing procedures; and that he didn't learn about the COA processing procedures until after the work had already been done.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on this application; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission discussed Mr. Lane's proposal, Commissioner

Andoe made a motion to approve Parts 1 & 2 of Mr. Lane's application and deem the application to be complete with a condition for Part 2 that:

- ◇ The upstairs shutters be constructed of 3 vertical boards of the same width and spacing as the ground floor shutters.

Commissioner Townsend seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Jim Lane's application w/conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye;
Bob Winchester – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Jim Lane's proposal based on guidelines for Windows and Doors, A.1.2.5 & A.1.2.7 for Rehabilitation of Existing Residential Buildings for the Yorktown Historical District.

6. 319 E. 18th Street (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Steve Olsen

Request: Construct two-story addition on east elevation of house according to plans submitted.

Application Completion Date: 12-13-2007

Mr. Sharrer presented Steve Olsen's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the North Maple Ridge historic home.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Olsen plans to construct a two-story addition on the east elevation of the structure according to the plans that he has submitted to the Commission for review. He

stated that the addition will have stucco materials, divided light wood windows and a copper roof.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal for *Additions in North Maple Ridge*.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on this application; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission discussed Mr. Olsen's proposal, Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve Mr. Olsen's application and deem the application to be complete with the following conditions that:

- ◇ The applicant's proposal is accepted to over build the existing flat roof with a hipped roof element; &
- ◇ The existing window on the 2nd floor, NE corner should be infilled and the wall made to match the adjacent construction.

Commissioner Peck seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Steve Olsen's application w/conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Dusty Peck – Aye;
Bob Winchester – Aye; &
Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Steve Olsen's proposal based on guidelines for General Requirements, 1.0.1, 1.0.2 & 1.0.3 & Building Materials and Elements 1.2.1 & 1.2.2 for Additions to Existing Structures for the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

7. 1211 E. 21st Street (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Angel Tucker

Request: Replace existing wood shake roof with tile roof.

Application Completion Date: 12-13-2007

Mr. Sharrer presented Angel Tucker's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the North Maple Ridge historic home.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Ms. Tucker plans to replace the existing wood shake roof on the structure with a concrete tile roof.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal for *Rehabilitation in North Maple Ridge*.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on this application; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission discussed Ms. Tucker's proposal, Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to approve Ms. Tucker's application and deem the application to be complete. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Angel Tucker's application w/o conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Bill Andoe – Aye;

Dusty Peck – Aye;

Bob Winchester – Aye; &

Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Angel Tucker's proposal based on guidelines for General Requirements, 1.0.1 & for Roofs, 1.3.1 & 1.3.2 for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

8. 1347 E. 20th Street (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Don Wood

Request: Replace concrete tile roof on southwest wing of house with composition asphalt shingles to match main and southeast wings of house.

Application Completion Date: 12-13-2007

DENIED

Mr. Sharrer presented Don Wood's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the Commission for a final review. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the Swan Lake historic home.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Wood plans to replace the existing concrete tile roof on the southwest wing of the structure with composition asphalt shingles to match the main wing and the southwest wing of the house.

Mr. Sharrer read the appropriate design guidelines on this proposal for *Rehabilitation in Swan Lake*.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the Commission for discussion on this application; and for a motion to be made. After the Commission discussed Mr. Wood's proposal, the members believe that composition asphalt shingles would be inappropriate for the style of this home; and that his request to install the composition asphalt shingles don't meet the required guidelines. Commissioner Townsend made a motion to deny Mr. Wood's application and deem the application to be complete. Vice-Chairperson O'Neal seconded.

It was suggested that staff write a letter to Mr. Wood suggesting that he replace the asphalt shingled roof on the SE wing with a concrete tile.

Roll Call Vote to Deny Don Wood's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye to Deny;

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye to Deny;

Charles Gilmore – Aye to Deny;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye to Deny;

Bill Andoe – Aye to Deny;

Dusty Peck – Aye to Deny;

Bob Winchester – Aye to Deny; &

Alice Rodgers – Aye to Deny.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously to Deny** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Don Wood's proposal based on guidelines for General Requirements, A.1.0.1 & for Roofs, A.1.3.2 for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the Swan Lake Historic District.

4. Nominations of New Officers for 2008

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal nominated:

- ◇ Barbara Smallwood for Vice-Chairperson; &
- ◇ Alice Rodgers for Secretary by acclamation as Tulsa Preservation Commission's new officers for 2008.

5. Nominations of Neighborhood Representatives for 2008

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal nominated:

- ◇ Mark Mobbs for Swan Lake Representative;
- ◇ Sally Davies for North Maple Ridge Representative; &
- ◇ John Hill for Yorktown Representative by acclamation as neighborhood representatives for 2008.

At this time, representatives for Brady Heights Neighborhood and Gillette Neighborhood are pending.

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to extend North Maple Ridge Representative, Sally Davies' term by acclamation.

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to accept Tim Williams as Brady Heights Liaison until pending clarification is resolved from the Mayor's Office.

6. Chair Report

Chairman Turner reported that the Commission may have a lot of applications to review due to the ice storm. He stated that some houses in the hp districts had some severe damage done to them; and that he wanted the Commission to be aware of the increase in COA applications that we may have in 2008.

Chairman Turner reported that Herb Fritz and Rex Ball will be honored with beautiful plaques at the Tulsa Preservation Commission Holiday Party for their dedicated years of service on the TPC Board. Chairman Turner brought the plaques to the meeting to show to the members before the January 3rd TPC Holiday Party. Everyone complimented Chairman Turner for having these plaques special made for Herb Fritz and Rex Ball in their honor.

7. Absence Report

No absences were reported.

7. New Business

Staff announced that the TPC Holiday Party was scheduled for today after the TPC Regular Meeting; but due to the ice storm that the Holiday Party has been rescheduled to be held on the evening of Thursday, January 3, 2008. The Holiday Party will be sponsored by Vice-Chairperson O'Neal; and it will be held at Vice-Chairperson O'Neal's house next year. If you would like to know more about the Holiday Party, please contact staff or Vice-Chairperson O'Neal.

Staff announced that the TPC Annual Retreat will be held on Saturday, January 12, 2008, at 9:00 a.m., at Cyntergy AEC, 320 S. Boston Avenue, 12th Floor. Again, Chairman Turner has volunteered to have the TPC Annual Retreat at his place of business.

8. Other Business

None.

9. Adjournment

There being no other business, Chairman Turner adjourned the meeting at 1:50 p.m. The Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Minutes of December 13, 2007 were transcribed by Fannie Warrior.

Note: Please notify Mrs. Warrior by e-mail at Fwarrior@ci.tulsa.ok.us that you have received the information forwarded to you. Project plans will be available at the Planning Department office for review.

*K:/Planning/FW/MINS 12 13 2007R TPC
Minutes Approved by TPC on 02-14-2008*