

∫pecial MEETING MINUTE∫ OF THE

TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Thursday, May 24, 2007, 10:00 a.m.
111 South Greenwood, 2nd Floor - Conference Rooms A&B
Tulsa, OK 74120-1820

Roll Call – Chairman Turner called the special meeting to order at 10:03 a.m., and Ms. DeCort announced the Roll Call.

Members Present:

Chairman, Jim Turner; Vice-Chairperson, Breniss O'Neal; Charles Gilmore; Mary Lee Townsend; Rex Ball; Bill Andoe; Michelle Cantrell; Bob Winchester; Alice Rodgers; & Kristen Bergman.

Member(s) Absent:

Barbara Smallwood; Herb Fritz; Jack Hodgson; & Dusty Peck.

Others Present:

Amanda DeCort, Kurt Ackermann, Ed Sharrer, John Duvall, Mel Bean, Brian Sachse, Beth Sachse, Sallie Hughes, Chip Atkins, Brenda Laizure, Blake Loveless, Caleb Krautter, Richard Bauker, Michael Thompson & Tony Laizure.

2. Unfinished Business

- a. Historic Preservation Committee
 - i. Announcement of Conflicts of Interest

Chairman Turner asked the Commission if anyone had a conflict of interest with the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Request that would be brought before the board for review. No one responded to having a conflict of interest.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

1. 2007 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

Applicant: Brian Sachse **New Construction**

Request: Construction of new single-family house

according to plans submitted.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date:

05-08-07

Mr. Sharrer presented his presentation to the Commission on Brian Sachse's Certificate of Appropriateness proposal for new construction. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the new construction proposal in Yorktown.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Sachse plans to construct a new single-family house according to plans submitted.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to approve Mr. Sachse's proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines under New Construction with the following conditions:

♦ With brick "shoulders" expressed on the chimney Commissioner Townsend seconded.

Roll Call Vote to approve Brian Sachse's application w/conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Ave:

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Bill Andoe – Aye;

Kristen Bergman – Aye;

Michelle Cantrell – Aye;

Bob Winchester – Aye; &

Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was <u>Approved Unanimously</u> by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Brian Sachse's</u> <u>proposal</u> based on guidelines for New Construction in Yorktown Historic District.

2. **920 N. Cheyenne Ave.** (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Johnece Thompson

Request: Replace original wood double-hung windows with vinyl replacement windows, muntin patterns to match existing.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 05-08-07

Mr. Sharrer presented his presentation to the Commission on Johnece Thompson's Certificate of Appropriateness proposal to restore her home. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in Brady Heights.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Ms. Thompson plans to replace the original wood double-hung windows with vinyl replacement windows with muntin patterns to match the existing.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to deny Ms. Thompson's proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines for Restoring Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District. Commissioner Ball seconded.

Roll Call Vote to deny Johnece Thompson's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye to deny; V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye to deny; Charles Gilmore – Aye to deny; Mary Lee Townsend – Aye to deny; Rex Ball – Aye to deny; Bill Andoe – Aye to deny; Kristen Bergman – Aye to deny; Michelle Cantrell – Aye to deny; Bob Winchester – Aye to deny; & Alice Rodgers – Aye to deny.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously to Deny** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Denied Johnece</u> <u>Thompson's proposal</u> based on guidelines for Windows & Doors, Preferred Option from Paragraphs #1 & #2; and Second Preference from Paragraphs #1 & #2 for Restoring Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District.

3. 1121 N. Chevenne Ave (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Richard Barnett

Request: Rehabilitation of house, including:

1) Construct addition on rear elevation of house to replace fire-damaged portion of existing house. Addition will utilize existing foundation and three new piers.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 05-08-07

Mr. Sharrer presented his presentation to the Commission on Part 1 of 7 Parts of Richard Barnett's Certificate of Appropriateness proposal for additions. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in Brady Heights.

Mr. Sharrer stated that on Part 1 of Mr. Barnett's proposal that he plans to construct an addition on the rear elevation of the house to replace the fire-damaged portion of the house. He added that the addition will utilize the existing foundation and three (3) new piers.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to approve Part 1 of Mr. Barnett's proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines for Additions to Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District. Commissioner Ball seconded.

Roll Call Vote to approve Part 1 of Richard Barnett's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Rex Ball – Ave;

Bill Andoe – Aye;

Kristen Bergman – Ave:

Michelle Cantrell – Aye;

Bob Winchester – Ave: &

Alice Rodgers – Ave.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and **voting.**

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Part 1 of</u> <u>Richard Barnett's proposal</u> based on Preferred Option, Paragraphs #1, #2, & #3; Building Materials & Elements, Paragraph #1; Roofs, Paragraph #2; and Engineering Systems – Mechanical, Electrical and Plumbing, Paragraph #1 for Additions to Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District.

3. 1121 N. Cheyenne Ave (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Richard Barnett

Request: Rehabilitation of house, including:

- 2) Install wood 6/6 double-hung windows with aluminum clad exterior muntins, trimmed out with capitals in keeping with period style of house. Exceptions/special window conditions:
 - On north elevation where picture window previously existed, install new picture window.
 - On west end of north elevation, increase the size of the two existing window openings flanking the chimney to install 6/6 windows matching rest of house.
 - On east end of north elevation, reduce the size of the two existing window openings and install wood 1/1 double hung windows to accommodate kitchen cabinetry.
 - On east end of south elevation, cover one window opening to accommodate master bathroom configuration. Siding will be patched to match existing.

Mr. Sharrer presented his presentation to the Commission on Part 2 of 7 Parts of Richard Barnett's Certificate of Appropriateness proposal to restore. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in Brady Heights.

Mr. Sharrer stated that on Part 2 of Mr. Barnett's proposal that he plans to install wood 6-over-6 double-hung windows with aluminum clad exterior muntins, trimmed out with capitals in keeping with the period style of the structure.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to approve Part 2 of Mr. Barnett's proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines for Restoring Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District. Commissioner Ball seconded.

Roll Call Vote to approve Part 2 of Richard Barnett's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye; V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye; Charles Gilmore – Aye; Mary Lee Townsend – Aye; Rex Ball – Aye; Bill Andoe – Aye; Kristen Bergman – Aye; Michelle Cantrell – Aye; Bob Winchester – Aye; & Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously by member**

The motion was <u>Approved Unanimously</u> by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Part 2 of</u> <u>Richard Barnett's proposal</u> based on Preferred Option, Paragraphs #1, & #2; and Second Preference, Paragraphs #1 & #2 for Restoring Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District.

3. 1121 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Richard Barnett

Request: Rehabilitation of house, including:

3) Remove deteriorated portion of chimney above roofline on north elevation, cover opening, and install roofing material. Chimney will remain from eaves to grade level.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 05-08-07

Mr. Sharrer presented his presentation to the Commission on Part 3 of 7 Parts of Richard Barnett's Certificate of Appropriateness proposal to restore. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in Brady Heights.

Mr. Sharrer stated that on Part 3 of Mr. Barnett's proposal that he plans to remove the deteriorated portion of the chimney above the roofline on the north elevation, cover the opening, and install roofing material. He added that the chimney will remain from eaves to grade level.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to deny Part 3 of Mr. Barnett's proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines for Restoring Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District. Commissioner Townsend seconded.

Roll Call Vote to deny Part 3 of Richard Barnett's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye to deny;

V-Chairperson O'Neal – Ave to deny:

Charles Gilmore – Nay;

Mary Lee Townsend - Nay:

Rex Ball - Nay;

Bill Andoe – Nay;

Kristen Bergman – Nay;

Michelle Cantrell – Nay:

Bob Winchester – Was not present during this vote; &

Alice Rodgers - Nay.

The motion was <u>FAILED by Majority</u> by members present and voting.

A second motion was made by Commissioner Townsend to approve Part 3 of Mr. Barnett's proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines for Restoring Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District. Commissioner Bergman seconded.

Roll Call Vote to approve Part 3 of Richard Barnett's application:

Chairman Turner – Nay to approve;
V-Chairperson O'Neal – Nay to approve;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Kristen Bergman – Aye;
Michelle Cantrell – Aye;
Bob Winchester – Was not present during this vote; & Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Part 3 of</u> <u>Richard Barnett's proposal</u> based on Roofs, Preferred Option, Paragraph #1 for Restoring Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District.

3. 1121 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Richard Barnett Request: Rehabilitation of house, including:

4) Install new front door, wood with beveled glass. COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 05-08-07

Mr. Sharrer presented his presentation to the Commission on Part 4 of 7 Parts of Richard Barnett's Certificate of Appropriateness proposal to restore. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in Brady Heights.

Mr. Sharrer stated that on Part 4 of Mr. Barnett's proposal that he plans to install a new wood front door with beveled glass.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to approve Part 4 of Mr. Barnett's proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines for Restoring Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District. Commissioner Ball seconded.

Roll Call Vote to approve Part 4 of Richard Barnett's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Bill Andoe – Aye;

Kristen Bergman – Aye;

Michelle Cantrell – Aye;

Bob Winchester – Was not present during this vote; &

Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was <u>Approved Unanimously</u> by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Part 4 of Richard Barnett's proposal</u> based on Second Preference, Paragraph #1 for Restoring Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District.

3. 1121 N. Cheyenne Ave (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Richard Barnett

Request: Rehabilitation of house, including:

- 5) Remove center section of porch wall, which is not original to house, to add poured concrete front steps centered on front elevation per the original design of the house. Porch steps will lead down to small concrete landing with concrete steps down to front sidewalk.
- 6) Remove existing 4" x 4" posts currently serving as porch bracing, not original to house. In those locations, replicate the two original pairs of wood porch columns using the existing columns as design templates.
- 7) Install lattice between porch piers on hinges to allow access to storage under front porch. COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 05-08-07

Mr. Sharrer presented his presentation to the Commission on Parts 5 thru 7 of 7 Parts of Richard Barnett's Certificate of Appropriateness proposal to restore. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in Brady Heights.

Mr. Sharrer stated that on Parts 5 thru 7 of Mr. Barnett's proposal that he plans to remove the center section of the front steps; remove the existing 4"X4" posts that are not original to the house; and install lattice between the porch piers that are on hinges to allow access to storage under the front porch.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to approve Parts 5 thru 7 of Mr. Barnett's proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines for Restoring Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District with the following conditions:

- ♦ To remove the wood steps on the south end of the front porch;
- ♦ To enclose the south end of the front porch with siding to match the rest of the porch; &
- ♦ To add a third porch column on the south end to match the three columns on the north end of the front porch. New column will match the existing in materials, dimensions and details.

Commissioner Ball seconded.

Roll Call Vote to approve Parts 5 thru 7 of Richard Barnett's application w/conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;
Charles Gilmore – Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Kristen Bergman – Aye;
Michelle Cantrell – Aye;
Bob Winchester – Was not present during this vote; & Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Parts 5 thru 7 of Richard Barnett's proposal</u> based on General Guidelines, Brady Heights property owners are strongly encouraged, in order of preference, to: Paragraphs #2 & #3; Porches, Preferred Option, Paragraph #1; & Second Preference, Paragraph #1 for Restoring Existing Structures in the Brady Heights Historic District.

4. **<u>1543 Swan Drive</u>** (Swan Lake)

Applicant: Tony & Brenda Laizure

Request: Replace and expand driveway toward west side of lot to allow homeowners to park vehicles off-street. Driveway will be tinted concrete. Addition will be screened by landscaping at curb.

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 05-08-07

Mr. Sharrer presented his presentation to the Commission on Tony & Brenda Laizure's Certificate of Appropriateness proposal for additions. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in Swan Lake.

Mr. Sharrer stated that the Laizures plan to replace and expand their driveway toward the west side of their lot to allow homeowners to park their vehicles off-street. He added that the driveway will be tinted concrete; and that the new addition will be screened by landscaping at the curb.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to approve the Laizure's proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines for Additions in Swan Lake. Commissioner Gilmore seconded.

Roll Call Vote to approve Tony & Brenda Laizure's application:

Chairman Turner – Abstain;

V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Abstain;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Rex Ball – Nay;

Bill Andoe – Aye;

Kristen Bergman – Aye;

Michelle Cantrell – Aye;

Bob Winchester – Nay; &

Alice Rodgers – Ave.

The motion FAILED by members present and voting.

5. <u>Maple Ridge Entry Marker</u> (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Michael Thompson

Request: Construct entry marker for Maple Ridge neighborhood – 18" x 18" brick column with cut stone details, topped with planter, total height of 7'. COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 05-08-07

Mr. Sharrer presented his presentation to the Commission on Michael Thompson's Certificate of Appropriateness proposal for New Construction. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the new construction proposal in North Maple Ridge.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Thompson plans to construct an entry marker for the Maple Ridge neighborhood. He stated that the 7' marker in height will be an 18" x 18" brick column with cut stone details, topped with planter.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to approve Mr. Thompson's proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines for New Construction in North Maple Ridge. Commissioner Andoe seconded.

Roll Call Vote to approve Michael Thompson's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Bill Andoe – Aye;

Kristen Bergman – Aye;

Michelle Cantrell – Aye;

Bob Winchester – Was not present during this vote; &

Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was <u>Approved Unanimously</u> by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Michael</u> <u>Thompson's proposal</u> based on guidelines for New Construction in North Maple Ridge Historic District.

6. 1140 N. Cheyenne Ave. (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Nathan Pickard

Request: Rehabilitation of existing, non-original front porch walls. Remove top course of concrete block to install cast concrete cap. Apply stucco to exterior face of concrete block walls; paint stucco to complement house

COA Subcommittee Complete Application Date: 05-08-07

Mr. Sharrer presented his presentation to the Commission on Nathan Pickard's Certificate of Appropriateness proposal to restore. Photographs and drawings were available for review; and a slide presentation was shown of the historic home in Brady Heights.

Mr. Sharrer stated that Mr. Pickard plans to rehabilitate the existing, non-original front porch walls; and remove the top course of the concrete block to install a cast concrete cap. He added that he would like to apply stucco

to the exterior face of the concrete block walls; and paint it stucco to complement the house.

Vice-Chairperson O'Neal made a motion to approve Mr. Pickard's proposal based on the appropriate design guidelines for Restoring Existing Structures in Brady Heights. Commissioner Cantrell seconded.

Roll Call Vote to approve Nathan Pickard's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

V-Chairperson O'Neal – Aye;

Charles Gilmore – Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Bill Andoe – Ave:

Kristen Bergman – Aye;

Michelle Cantrell – Aye;

Bob Winchester – Was not present during this vote; &

Alice Rodgers – Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Nathan Pickard's proposal</u> based on guidelines for Brady Heights property owners that are strongly encouraged, in order of preference, to Paragraphs #1 & #2 of Restoring Existing Structures in Brady Heights Historic District.

3. Adjournment

There being no other business, Chairman Turner adjourned the meeting at 12:43 p.m. The Tulsa Preservation Commission Special Meeting Minutes of May 24, 2007 were transcribed by Amanda DeCort.

K:/Planning/AJD/MINS 05 24 2007S TPC Minutes Approved by TPC on