

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF THE TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Thursday, July 13, 2006, 11:00 A.M. 111 South Greenwood, 2nd Floor - Conference Rooms A&B Tulsa, OK 74120-1820

Chairman Turner called the regular meeting to order at 11:12 a.m., and Mrs. Warrior announced the Roll Call.

1. Roll Call

Members Present:

Chairman, James Turner Vice-Chairman, David Breed Secretary, Breniss O'Neal; Jack Hodgson; Chip Ard; Mary Lee Townsend; Herb Fritz; Bill Andoe.

Members Absent:

Barbara Imel Smallwood; Rex Ball; Charles Gilmore; Dusty Peck;

Others Present:

Amanda DeCort, Fannie Warrior, Kurt Ackermann, Will Wilkins, Whit Smith, Michelle Barnett, Sara Hensley & Stacey Bayles

2. Approval of Meeting Minutes: Regular Meeting Minutes from June 8, 2006

Chairman Turner asked if there was a motion on the floor to approve the meeting minutes from last month.

Ms. Townsend made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes from June 8, 2006. Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Meeting Minutes from June 8, 2006:

Chairman Turner – Aye; Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye; Secretary O'Neal – Aye; Herb Fritz – Aye; Jack Hodgson – Aye; Mary Lee Townsend – Aye; Bill Andoe – Aye; & Chip Ard - Aye. The motion was <u>Approved Unanimously</u> by members present and voting.

3. Unfinished Business

A. Historic Preservation Committee Report

i. Announcement of Conflict of Interest

Chairman Turner asked the commission if anyone had a conflict of interest with the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Request that would be brought before the board for review. Members were instructed that the commissioner's name(s) would not be called when voting on the particular Certificate or Certificates of Appropriateness that he/she had a conflict of interest with. No one responded.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

Chairman Turner briefly informed the COA applicant of the COA processing procedures of how her proposal would be reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission for a final determination.

Chairman Turner asked Ms. DeCort to please give her presentation on COA agenda item #1, Kevin & Karlyn Doyle at 1583 Swan Lake in Swan Lake.

1583 Swan Drive, Tulsa, OK 74120 (Swan Lake) 1) **Applicants:** Kevin & Karlyn Doyle APPROVAL RECOMMENDED FOR W/OCONDITIONS Propose to paint stucco surfaces on **Request:** exterior of the structure. Subcommittee Complete Application Date: June 27, 2006

Ms. DeCort presented Kevin & Karlyn Doyle's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and

drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the c. 1920 Italian Renaissance home in Swan Lake.

Ms. DeCort stated that the Doyles plan to paint their stucco surfaces on the exterior of the structure. She stated that the Doyles were unable to attend the meeting; but they did submit a paint chip for the commission to review and make a final determination.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation(s) on the Doyle's proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee considered the Doyle's application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended a unanimous vote at the June 27, 2006 meeting to approve the Doyles' application.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Rehabilitation in the Swan Lake district; and that he would like to move for an approval. Ms. O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for discussion. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to approve the Doyle's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye; Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye; Secretary O'Neal – Aye; Herb Fritz – Aye; Jack Hodgson – Aye; Mary Lee Townsend – Aye; Bill Andoe – Aye; & Chip Ard - Aye. The motion was <u>Approved Unanimously</u> by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Kevin &</u> <u>Karlyn Doyle's proposal</u> based on Section VIIIA, Building Wall Materials, A.1.1.1, A1.1.2 & A.1.1.3 for Guidelines for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings for the Swan Lake Historic District. Chairman Turner asked Ms. DeCort to please give her presentation on COA agenda item #2, Novus Homes, LLC/William Wilkins at 605 N. Cheyenne Avenue in Brady Heights.

2) <u>605 N. Cheyenne Avenue,</u> Tulsa, OK 74106 (Brady Heights) Applicant: <u>Novus Homes, LLC/William Wilkins</u> Request: Propose New Construction of a 2-story (2,300 square foot) single family dwelling with a detached garage at 605 N. Cheyenne Avenue. Subcommittee Complete Application Date: June 27, 2006

Ms. DeCort presented Novus Homes, LLC/William Wilkins' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the new proposed construction dwelling in Brady Heights.

Ms. DeCort stated that Mr. Wilkins has proposed to build new construction of a 2-story (2,300 square foot) single family dwelling with a detached garage at 605 N. Cheyenne Avenue. Ms. DeCort distributed revised drawings that Mr. Wilkins had provided for the front, left and right elevations; and a front and rear lot line property survey of the 600 block on Cheyenne Avenue.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation(s) on Mr. Wilkins' proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Wilkins' application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended a unanimous vote at the June 27, 2006 meeting to approve Mr. Wilkins' application.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for New Construction in the Brady Heights district; and that he would like to move for an approval. Ms. O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for discussion. Mr. Fritz believes that it seemed odd and interesting to have bricks sitting on top of the stem wall where it's concrete at the bottom then brick, then siding on the side elevation. He believes that it's extremely complicated to build it that way; but he stated that if the applicant wants to build it that way, then he was okay with it. Chairman Turner was concerned about the

windows on the façade of the structure, as to why some were casement windows and some were single hung windows. He believes that the windows should be more uniformed; but that they were within the general guidelines as far as historic appearance was concerned. Most of the members believe the new constructed home looked a little odd; but nice. The commission complimented Mr. Wilkins on his new construction.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Wilkins if he had any comments to make or if he had anything to add to the proposal; and Mr. Wilkins responded by stating that he didn't.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for further discussion. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to approve Mr. Wilkins' application:

Chairman Turner – Aye; Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye; Secretary O'Neal – Aye; Herb Fritz – Aye; Jack Hodgson – Aye; Mary Lee Townsend – Aye; Bill Andoe – Aye; & Chip Ard - Aye. The motion was <u>Approved Unanimously</u> by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Novus</u> <u>Homes, LLC/William Wilkins' proposal</u> based on Guidelines for New Construction or Moving Structures into the Brady Heights Historic District.

Ms. DeCort asked Chairman Turner to please accept her request to skip applicant proposal #3 and go to applicant proposal #4 because applicant #3 was unable to attend the meeting. Chairman Turner granted Ms. DeCort's request.

<u>1115 N. Denver Avenue</u>, Tulsa, OK 74106 (Brady Heights)
Applicants: <u>Whit Smith & Dusty Saul</u>
Request: Propose to install a 4-foot black steel fence and drive gate, in traditional wrought-iron picket design around perimeter of property.

Subcommittee Complete Application Date: July 11, 2006

Ms. DeCort presented Whit Smith and Dusty Saul's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the c. 1917 Airplane Bungalow home in Brady Heights.

Ms. DeCort stated that Mr. Smith and Ms. Saul originally applied to install a 4-foot black steel fence and drive gate, in a traditional wrought-iron picket design, around the perimeter of the property. Ms. DeCort stated that Mr. Smith and Ms. Saul have provided the TPC with a revised drawing of the fence from its registered land surveyor's inspection plat. Ms. DeCort stated that, based upon their conversation with the COA Subcommittee,

the applicants have decided not to install the fence in front of the house. They request instead to have it installed adjacent to the façade of the home. The fence will run from the side of the front porch to the edge of the side yard. The drive gate will be installed at the rear of the port-cochere. She stated that the fence will be a welded steel ornamental classic fence in the 2 rail styles; and that the gate will open outward.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation(s) on Mr. Smith and Ms. Saul's proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Mr. Smith and Ms. Saul's application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended an approval by majority vote at the July 11, 2006 meeting to approve this application.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Additions in the Brady Heights district. Mr. Fritz made a motion to approve Mr. Smith and Ms. Saul's application. Ms. O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Smith if he had any comments to make; and Mr. Smith responded by stating that he didn't.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for discussion. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

<u>Roll Call Vote to approve Mr. Smith & Ms. Saul's application:</u>

Chairman Turner – Aye; Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye; Secretary O'Neal – Aye; Herb Fritz – Aye; Jack Hodgson – Aye; Mary Lee Townsend – Aye; Bill Andoe – Aye; & Chip Ard - Aye. The motion was <u>Approved Unanimously</u> by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Whit</u> <u>Smith and Dusty Saul's proposal</u> based on Building Site, paragraph #3 for Guidelines for Additions to Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

Chairman Turner moved to agenda item 3A., Unfinished Business, iii., Review of the Tulsa Spirit Monument in Brady Heights.

iii. Review of the Tulsa Spirit Monument in Brady Heights

Ms. DeCort introduced Ms. Michelle Barnett to the commission. Ms. Barnett is the President of the Brady Heights Neighborhood Association. She presented revised plans of the Tulsa Spirit Entry Monument in Brady Heights to the commission. Ms. Barnett distributed colorful plans of the Tulsa Spirit Entry Monument showing some changes that they plan to make; and sited where the monument will be installed on Denver Avenue. Ms. Barnett stated that the monument will be 5' X 15' in width and height and that the lights will be of a different material. She asked the commission to please grant her permission to have the changes made to the monument.

After members of the commission discussed this issue, they believe that this request should have been brought to them as a Certificate of Appropriateness. The commission advised staff that this proposal should be submitted to the COA Subcommittee for recommendation then reviewed by the Tulsa Preservation Commission for a final determination. Chairman Turner stated that the applicant will need a list of the materials, the dimensions and other required details of information pertaining to the proposal; and that he will have Mrs. Warrior place the Tulsa Spirit Monument on the next TPC agenda for review.

The commission thanked Ms. Barnett for showing them her presentation of the Tulsa Spirit Entry Monument.

Chairman Turner asked Ms. DeCort to please give her presentation on COA agenda item #3-I & II, Branic Johnson at 920 N. Denver Avenue in Brady Heights.

3-I) <u>920 N. Denver Avenue,</u> Tulsa, OK 74106 (Brady Heights) Applicant: <u>Branic Johnson</u> <u>Part I of II</u>: Propose to add 1" X 4" corner molding to structure; Subcommittee Complete Application Date: July 11, 2006

Ms. DeCort presented Part I of Branic Johnson's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the c. 1930 Colonial Revival/Craftsman home in Brady Heights.

Ms. DeCort stated that Mr. Johnson plans to add a 1" X 4" corner molding to the structure over top of the asbestos siding. Ms. DeCort added that such trim was probably originally on the house and was removed when the asbestos was installed; however, there is no photographic evidence. Ms. DeCort showed slides of similar homes that have such trim.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation(s) on Part I of Mr. Johnson's proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part I of Mr. Johnson's application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended an approval by a unanimous vote at the July 11, 2006 meeting to approve this application.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of Part I of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Restore in the Brady Heights district; and that he would like to move for an approval. Ms. O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for discussion. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

<u>Roll Call Vote to approve Part I of Mr. Johnson's application:</u>

Chairman Turner – Aye; Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye; Secretary O'Neal – Aye; Herb Fritz – Aye; Jack Hodgson – Aye; Mary Lee Townsend – Aye; Bill Andoe – Aye; & Chip Ard - Aye. The motion was <u>Approved Unanimously</u> by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Part I of</u> <u>Branic Johnson's proposal</u> based on Building Wall Materials, Preferred Option, paragraphs 1 & 2; and Second Preference, paragraphs 1 & 2 for Guidelines for Restoring Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

3-II) <u>920 N. Denver Avenue,</u> Tulsa, OK 74106 (Brady Heights) Applicant: <u>Branic Johnson - RECOMMENDED FOR</u> <u>APPROVAL W/O CONDITIONS</u> <u>Part II of II</u>: Propose to add 1" X 8" band along base of siding (on sides of the structure). Subcommittee Complete Application Date: July 11, 2006

Ms. DeCort presented Part II of Branic Johnson's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic home in Brady Heights.

Ms. DeCort stated that Mr. Johnson plans to add a 1" X 8" band along the base of the siding on the sides of the structure.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation(s) on Part II of Mr. Johnson's proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee considered Part II of Mr. Johnson's application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended an approval by a majority vote at the July 11, 2006 meeting to approve this application.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of Part II of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Restore in the Brady Heights district; and that he would like to move for an approval. Ms. O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for discussion. Chairman Turner believes that the 1" X 8" band is too wide to be installed at the base of the siding. It was noted that it will be difficult to install such trim over top of asbestos siding. He asked if there were any further discussion. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to approve Part II of Mr. Johnson's application:

Chairman Turner – Nay; Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye; Secretary O'Neal – Aye; Herb Fritz – Aye; Jack Hodgson – Aye; Mary Lee Townsend – Aye; Bill Andoe – Aye; & Chip Ard - Aye. The motion was <u>Approved by Majority</u> by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Part II of</u> <u>Branic Johnson's proposal</u> based on Building Wall Materials, Preferred Option, paragraphs 1 & 2; and Second Preference, paragraphs 1 & 2 for Guidelines for Restoring Existing Structures for the Brady Heights Historic District.

Chairman Turner moved to agenda item 5., Staff Report, A., Proposed Preservation Easement – The Ward House, 7007 S. Delaware Place – Marty Newman

5. Staff Report

A. Proposed Preservation Easement – The Ward House 7007 S. Delaware Place – Marty Newman

Chairman Turner introduced Mr. Marty Newman to the commission. Mr. Newman presented his proposed presentation easement of the Ward House at 7007 S. Delaware Place to the commission.

Mr. Newman presented a slide show of photographs of the Ward House to the commission for review; and distributed a draft Schedule B of the Deed of Architectural Façade Easement of the Ward House for review. He stated that the land was purchased in 1953 and that the one-story Ward House was built in 1963. He stated that the Ward House is in terrific condition that consists of 2,485 square feet with a detached garage, carport and storage. Mr. Newman stated that the exterior of the house is stucco that has four (4) bedrooms and three (3) baths located in the Braniff Hills subdivision over 1.5 acres of beautiful woods. Mr. Newman stated that the lot size is 71,210 square feet and that it's a marvelous house. Mr. Newman asked the commission to please accept his proposal having the Tulsa Preservation Commission to become the Grantee of the deed of architectural façade easement to the Ward House located at 7007 S. Delaware Place.

The commission thanked Mr. Newman for presenting his proposal. The City of Tulsa Legal Department will continue to review the draft Schedule B that Mr. Newman has presented regarding the deed of architectural façade easement; and the commission will make a determination at the next meeting. Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please place this item on next months' agenda for review.

B. Presentation of Tulsa Neighborhoods Photography Project – Sara Hensley

Stacey Bayles, a former member of the Tulsa Preservation Commission, introduced Ms. Sara Hensley to the commission. Ms. Hensley is a summer intern at AIA working with Ms. Bayles. Ms. Hensley presented a 10-12 minute slide show of historic photographs of homes in several historic districts within the Tulsa area. Ms. Hensley showed two hundred photographs of historic homes in Brady Heights, Owen Park, Swan Lake, Tulsa Country Club, and other neighborhoods. Each photograph that Ms. Hensley presented indicated the owner's name of each property listed. Ms. Hensley stated that she had received all the photographs from Mr. John Walton.

Ms. Hensley gave a copy of the video of the historic home photographs to the commission. Chairman Turner thanked Ms. Hensley for sharing the photographs with them; and for giving them a copy of the video. Chairman Turner told Ms. Hensley and Ms. Bayles that the commission will use the historic photograph video to its best advantage; and that the photographs will be a great resource.

Chairman Turner moved to 4., Chair Report, A., Review of CORE Recommendations

4. Chair Report

A. Review of CORE Recommendations

Chairman Turner stated that a draft copy of the CORE Recommendations had been distributed for their review; and that he would like for the commission to review the CORE Recommendations over the next month. Chairman Turner asked the commission to send their suggestions, ideas and/or comments to him or to Ms. DeCort before the next meeting take place. He asked Mrs. Warrior to place this item on next months' agenda for review. Chairman Turner moved to agenda item 3B., Unfinished Business, Rules and Regulations.

B. Rules and Regulations None.

C. Program Planning & Neighborhood Conservation None.

Chairman Turner moved to agenda item 6., Absence Report.

6. Absence Report

None.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission lost its regular and professional quorum of this meeting at 1:05 p.m.

7. New Business

8. Communications

9. Adjournment

There being no other business, Chairman Turner adjourned the meeting at 1:05 p.m. The Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Minutes of July 13, 2006 were transcribed by Fannie Warrior.

K:/Planning/Fannie Warrior/MINS 07 13 2006R TPC Minutes Approved by TPC on 08 10 2006