



REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF THE TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION (TPC)

Thursday, May 11, 2006, 11:00 A.M.
111 South Greenwood, 2nd Floor - Conference Rooms A&B
Tulsa, OK 74120-1820

Chairman Turner called the regular meeting to order at 11:02 a.m., and Mrs. Warrior announced the Roll Call.

1. ROLL CALL

Members Present:

Chairman, James Turner, Comm. Group Res.;
Vice-Chairman, David Breed, Comm. Group Res.;
Sec., & Prof., Landscape Designer, Breniss O'Neal;
Owen "Chip" Ard – Planning Commissioner;
Mary Lee Townsend, Professional Historian;
Herb Fritz, Professional Architect;
Rex Ball, Community Group Resident;
Barbara Imel Smallwood, Community Group Resident;
Charles Gilmore, Professional Developer;
Bill Andoe, Arts Commissioner;

Members Absent:

Jack Hodgson, Professional Realtor;
Dusty Peck, Community Group Resident;
Chuck Chastain, Professional Banker;

Others Present:

Amanda DeCort, Patrick Fox, Fannie Warrior, Kurt Ackermann, Jason Mills, Kevin Doyle, Marlene Rodriguez, Martha Hullord & Ken Ackley

Chairman Turner introduced and welcomed TPC's newest member to the Commission, Mr. Bill Andoe. Chairman Turner announced that he would like the commission to kindly welcome Mr. Andoe to the board; and that he is replacing Michael Birkes' position as our Arts Commissioner. All members of the commission welcomed Mr. Andoe to the board.

2. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES, Regular Meeting Minutes from April 13, 2006

Chairman Turner asked if there was a motion on the floor to approve the meeting minutes from last month.

Ms. Townsend made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes from April 13, 2006 as presented. Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Meeting Minutes from April 13, 2006:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Secretary O'Neal – Aye;

Herb Fritz – Aye;

Charles Gilmore - Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Bill Andoe – **Abstain**;

Barbara Smallwood – Aye; &

Chip Ard - Aye.

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.

3. Unfinished Business

A. Historic Preservation Committee Report

i. Announcement of Conflict of Interest

Chairman Turner asked the commission if anyone had a Conflict of Interest with any of the Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) Requests that would be brought before the board for review. Members were instructed that the commissioner's name(s) would not be called when voting on the particular Certificate or Certificates of Appropriateness that he/she had a conflict of interest with.

Chairman Turner announced that he has a conflict of interest with COA Agenda item #3, Ann Parker/Espo Const. Co., Inc.; and that he will leave the room and ask the Vice-Chairman to continue with the meeting. Chairman Turner stated that he will return to the meeting after the commission has made a final determination on the proposal.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #1, Kevin & Karlyn Doyle at 1583 Swan Drive.

- 1) **1583 Swan Drive, Tulsa, OK 74120 (Swan Lake)**
Applicants: Kevin & Karlyn Doyle - Approved
Propose to replace (13 & 2 half) existing wood columns with (13 & 2 half) fiberglass columns and capitals.
Subcommittee Complete Application Date: April 25, 2006

Mr. Fox presented the Doyle's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the c. 1920 Italian Renaissance home in Swan Lake.

Mr. Fox stated that the Doyles plan to replace (13 & 2 half) existing wood columns with (13 & 2 half) fiberglass columns and capitals. Mr. Fox stated that the columns are deteriorating and the Doyles plan to replace all the columns and capitals. Mr. Fox stated that they are replacing the existing wood columns that are not fluted with smooth 12" tapered round columns that are fluted. Mr. Fox stated that these fiberglass columns are increasingly common because they are load bearing in nature and carry 18,000 pounds a piece; and that it is very difficult to tell that they are not wood.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation(s) on the Doyle's proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee found the Doyle's application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended an approval vote by majority at the April 25, 2006 meeting to approve the Doyle's application. Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Rehabilitation in the Swan Lake district; and that he would like to move for an approval. Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Doyle if he had any comments to make or add to the proposal. Mr. Doyle stated that they spent a lot of time trying to find the materials to match the existing; and that they were just trying to get the columns back into uniform to be consistent.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for discussion. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to approve the Doyle's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;
Secretary O'Neal – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore - Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Barbara Smallwood – Aye; &
Chip Ard - Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved the Doyle's proposal based on Section VIIIA, Porches, Decks & Patios, A.1.4.1 and A.1.4.2 for Guidelines for Rehabilitation in the Swan Lake Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #2, Marlen Rodriguez in North Maple Ridge.

- 2) **210 E. 18th Street, Tulsa, OK 74119 (N. Maple Ridge)**
Applicant: Marlen Rodriguez – Approved
Proposal for addition to master bedroom, new bathroom, new closet, & remodel existing space to the South (rear) side of the main structure.
Subcommittee Complete Application Date: April 25, 2006

Mr. Fox presented Ms. Rodriguez' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the c. 1910 Craftsman Bungalow home in North Maple Ridge.

Mr. Fox stated that Ms. Rodriguez plans to add an addition to her master bedroom, new bathroom, new closet, & remodel the existing space to the South (rear) side of the main structure. Mr. Fox stated that Ms. Rodriguez will be using the same materials for the siding, windows, rafter tails and roofing as the existing.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation(s) on Ms. Rodriguez' proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee found Ms. Rodriguez' application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote at the April 25, 2006 meeting to approve Ms. Rodriguez' application. Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Additions in the North Maple Ridge district; and that he would like to move for an approval. Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner asked Ms. Rodriguez if she had any comments to make or add to the proposal. Ms. Rodriguez stated that the roof pitch will be the same without any changes made to the elevation. She stated that the bedroom window will have a new window; but the other windows will be salvaged.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for discussion. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to approve Marlen Rodriguez' application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;
Secretary O'Neal – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore - Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;

Barbara Smallwood – Aye; &
Chip Ard - Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Marlene Rodriguez' proposal based on Section VIII B, General Requirements, B1.0.1, B1.0.2 & B1.0.3, Building Materials & Elements, B.1.2.1 & B.1.2.2 & Roofs, B.1.3.2 for Guidelines for Additions to Existing Structures in the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

Chairman Turner announced that he will turn the meeting over to Vice-Chairman Breed due to his having a conflict of interest with the next COA; and that he will return after the commission has voted on COA agenda item #3, Ann Parker/Espo Construction Co., Inc. Chairman Turner then excused himself from the meeting at 11:28 a.m.

Vice-Chairman Breed asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #3, Ann Parker/Espo Const. Co., Inc., in Yorktown.

- 3) **1541 S. Yorktown Ave., Tulsa, OK 74104 (Yorktown)**
Applicants: Ann Parker/Espo Const. Co., Inc. – Approved with conditions
Request: Propose to replace windows on North and South sides of the structure with vinyl windows.
Subcommittee Complete Application Date: May 9, 2006

Mr. Fox presented Ms. Parker's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the Craftsman home in Yorktown.

Mr. Fox stated that Ms. Parker plans to replace the windows on the North and South sides of the structure with vinyl windows. He stated that Ms. Parker was unable to attend the meeting; but has requested Jason Mills from Cynergy AEC for representation. Mr. Fox stated that Ms. Parker plans to replace 1/1 wood windows in the rear of the new addition with 1/1 vinyl windows; and replace the 4/1 wood windows on the older portion of the structure with 4/1 vinyl windows on the non-contributing home.

Vice-Chairman Breed asked Mr. Mills if he had anything to add to Mr. Fox's presentation. Mr. Jason Mills stated that there had been some fire damage to Ms. Parker's home; and that he was only trying to get everything back in order by replacing the 1/1 wood windows with 1/1 vinyl windows; and replace the 4/1 wood windows with 4/1 vinyl windows.

Vice-Chairman Breed asked Secretary O'Neal to please announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation on Ms. Parker's proposal.

Secretary O'Neal stated that the COA Subcommittee found Ms. Parker's application to be complete. She stated that the subcommittee recommended a

unanimous vote at the May 9, 2006 meeting to approve Ms. Parker's application under the following conditions:

- ◇ That exterior muntins are added to the 4/1 vinyl windows.

Secretary O'Neal stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of Ms. Parker's proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Non-Contributing Residential Structures in the Yorktown district.

Vice-Chairman Breed opened the floor to the commission for discussion. After the discussion, Secretary O'Neal made a motion to approve Ms. Parker's application and slightly changed the conditions:

- ◇ That exterior raised muntins are added to the 4/1 vinyl window sashes. Ms. Smallwood seconded.

Vice-Chairman Breed asked the commission if there were further discussion on this proposal. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to approve Ms. Parker's application with conditions:

Chairman Turner – Was not present during this vote;

Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Secretary O'Neal – Aye;

Herb Fritz – Aye;

Charles Gilmore - Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – **Nay**;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Bill Andoe – Aye;

Barbara Smallwood – Aye; &

Chip Ard - Aye.

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Ms. Parker's proposal based on Section VIII E, General Requirements, E1.0.1 through E1.0.4 for Guidelines for Non-Contributing Residential Structures in the Yorktown Historic District.

Chairman Turner returned to the meeting room at 11:50 a.m., and he relieved Vice-Chairman Breed as Acting Chairman.

Chairman Turner moved to COA agenda item #5, because COA applicant #4 was unable to attend the meeting. Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on Ken Ackley & Laura Frossard's application at 1544 E. 17th Place in Swan Lake.

- 5) **1544 E. 17th Place, Tulsa, OK 74120 (Swan Lake)**
Applicants: Ken Ackley & Laura Frossard - Approved
Request: Propose to replace windows and French doors on front and sides of the structure with energy efficient windows and doors.
Subcommittee Complete Application Date: May 9, 2006

Mr. Fox presented Ken Ackley and Laura Frossard's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic home in Swan Lake.

Mr. Fox stated that Mr. Ackley (the contractor) and Ms. Frossard plan to replace the windows and French doors on the front and sides of the structure with energy efficient windows and doors. Mr. Fox stated that the existing windows on the structure are metal casement windows that the new owners would like to replace with Winsor casement wood windows. He stated that the French doors on the west side of the structure will also be replaced with energy efficient windows as presented to the commission in the brochure.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation(s) on Ken Ackley and Laura Frossard's proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee found Mr. Ackley and Ms. Frossard's application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote at the May 9, 2006 meeting to approve this application. Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Rehabilitation in the Swan Lake district; and that he would like to move for an approval. Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Ackley if he had any comments to make or add to the proposal; and Mr. Ackley responded by stating that he did not.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for discussion. The commission was concerned about whether the windows and doors were customized or standard. Mr. Ackley responded by stating that all the new windows will fit into the original window frames. The commission members informed Mr. Ackley that they would like to see the windows and doors that he is planning to install on the structure look the same as the existing; and that the only change would be the materials. Mr. Ackley agreed that they would. Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to approve Ken Ackley & Laura Frossard's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;
Secretary O'Neal – Aye;
Herb Fritz – **Nay**;
Charles Gilmore - Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;

Barbara Smallwood – Aye; &
Chip Ard - Aye.

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Ken Ackley & Laura Frossard's proposal based on Section VIIIA, Windows and Doors, A1.2.3 for Guidelines for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings in the Swan Lake Historic District.

Mr. Ball requested that he would like the records to state that:

- ◇ This is not a precedent, that it's a special situation.

Chairman Turner moved back to COA agenda item #4I, St. John Health System at 1775 S. Xanthus Avenue in Yorktown. He asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on #4-I.

- 4-I) 1775 S. Xanthus Ave., Tulsa, OK 74104 (Yorktown)
Applicant: St. John Health System – Approved with conditions
Request: Part I of IV: Replace existing wood siding with vinyl siding;
Subcommittee Complete Application Date: May 9, 2006**

Mr. Fox presented Part I of IV Parts of St. John Health System's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in Yorktown.

Mr. Fox stated that St. John Health System plans to replace the existing wood siding with vinyl siding on the structure. He stated that no one from St. John was available to attend the meeting for representation.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation(s) on Part I of St. John Health System's proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee found Part I of this application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote at the May 9, 2006 meeting to approve Part I of this application under the following conditions:

- ◇ That the siding should be installed all the way around the house; and that the relationship of the trim of the frieze & window surrounds to the siding be maintained; and should be brought forward to maintain the original relationship to the siding.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of Part I of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines

for Rehabilitation in the Yorktown district; and that he would like to move for an approval. Secretary O’Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner asked Ms. Warrior to call roll.

Roll Call Vote to approve Part I of St. John Health System:

Chairman Turner – **Nay**;
Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;
Secretary O’Neal – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore - Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – **Nay**;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – **Nay**;
Barbara Smallwood – Aye; &
Chip Ard - Aye.

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.

After the commission voted on Part I of this application, one of the commissioners stated that Part I of this proposal didn’t state anything about pulling the frames out of the windows pertaining to the condition. After discussing this issue further, Vice-Chairman Breed made a motion to reconsider the motion that was made on Part I of this application. Secretary O’Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner asked Ms. Warrior to call roll.

Roll Call Vote to reconsider the motion of Part I of St. John Health System:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;
Secretary O’Neal – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore - Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Barbara Smallwood – Aye; &
Chip Ard - Aye.

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

Vice-Chairman Breed amended the motion to approve Part I of this application under the following conditions:

- ◇ That the siding should be installed all the way around the house; and that the relationship of the trim of the frieze & window surrounds to the siding be maintained; and should be brought forward to maintain the original relationship to the siding.

Secretary O’Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote of amending the motion to approve Part I of St. John Health System:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;
Secretary O’Neal – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore - Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Barbara Smallwood – **Abstain;** &
Chip Ard - Aye.

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part I of St. John Health System’s proposal based on Section VIIIA, Building Wall Materials, A.1.1.1, A.1.1.2 & A.1.1.4 for Guidelines for Rehabilitation of Existing Residential Buildings in the Yorktown Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #4-II of St. John Health System’s proposal at 1775 S. Xanthus Avenue in Yorktown.

**4-II) 1775 S. Xanthus Ave., Tulsa, OK 74104 (Yorktown)
Applicant: St. John Health System – Approved
Part II of IV: Propose to install new front door;
Subcommittee Complete Application Date: May 9, 2006**

Mr. Fox presented Part II of IV Parts of St. John Health System’s Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in Yorktown.

Mr. Fox stated that St. John Health System has already installed the new front door on the structure; and that the new door is metal with a window that mimics the eye lid dormer.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee’s recommendation(s) on Part II of St. John Health System’s proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee found Part II of this application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote at the May 9, 2006 meeting to approve Part II of this application.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of Part II of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Rehabilitation in the Yorktown district; and that he would like to move for an approval. Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for discussion. Hearing none, he asked Ms. Warrior to call roll.

Roll Call Vote to approve Part II of St. John Health System:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Secretary O'Neal – Aye;

Herb Fritz – Aye;

Charles Gilmore - Aye;

Mary Lee Townsend – **Nay**;

Rex Ball – **Nay**;

Bill Andoe – **Nay**;

Barbara Smallwood – Was not present during this vote; &

Chip Ard – **Nay**.

The motion was **Approved by Majority** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part II of St. John Health System's proposal based on Section VIIIA, Windows and Doors, A.1.2.1, A.1.2.2 & A.1.2.3 and A.2.4 for Guidelines for Rehabilitation of Existing Residential Buildings in the Yorktown Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #4-III of St. John Health System's proposal at 1775 S. Xanthus Avenue in Yorktown.

4-III) 1775 S. Xanthus Ave., Tulsa, OK 74104 (Yorktown)

Applicant: St. John Health System – Approved with conditions

Part III of IV: Propose to replace windows on the sides of the structure with energy efficient windows.

Subcommittee Complete Application Date: May 9, 2006

Mr. Fox presented Part III of IV Parts of St. John Health System's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in Yorktown.

Mr. Fox stated that St. John Health System plans to replace the windows on the sides of the structure with energy efficient windows.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation(s) on Part III of St. John Health System's proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee found Part III of this application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote at the May 9, 2006 meeting to approve Part III of this application under the following conditions:

- ◇ That the two (2) small windows should be replaced with a pair of 4/1 windows to match the bathroom window.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of Part III of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Rehabilitation in the Yorktown district; and that he would like to move for an approval. Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for discussion. Hearing none, he asked Ms. Warrior to call roll.

Roll Call Vote to approve Part III of St. John Health System:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;
Secretary O'Neal – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore - Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Aye;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Barbara Smallwood – Was not present during this vote; &
Chip Ard – Aye;

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part III of St. John Health System's proposal based on Section VIII A, Windows and Doors, A.1.2.1, & A.1.2.2 for Guidelines for Rehabilitation of Existing Residential Buildings in the Yorktown Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #4-IV of St. John Health System's proposal at 1775 S. Xanthus Avenue in Yorktown.

**4-IV) 1775 S. Xanthus Ave., Tulsa, OK 74104 (Yorktown)
Applicant: St. John Health System - Denied
Part IV of IV: Propose to replace windows on the front of the structure with energy efficient windows.
Subcommittee Complete Application Date: May 9, 2006**

Mr. Fox presented Part IV of IV Parts of St. John Health System's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in Yorktown.

Mr. Fox stated that St. John Health System plans to replace the windows on the front of the structure with energy efficient windows.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation(s) on Part IV of St. John Health System's proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee found Part IV of this application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote at the May 9, 2006 meeting to approve Part IV of this application.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of Part IV of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Rehabilitation in the Yorktown district.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for discussion.

After the discussion took place, most of the members believe that the applicant's request for replacing the windows on the front of the structure with energy efficient windows is inappropriate for the style of this structure.

Mr. Fritz made a motion to Deny Part IV of this application. Vice-Chairman Breed seconded.

Chairman Turner asked if there were any further discussion on Part IV of this application. Hearing none, he asked Ms. Warrior to call roll

Roll Call Vote to deny Part IV of St. John Health System:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Secretary O'Neal – Aye;

Herb Fritz – Aye;

Charles Gilmore - **Nay**;

Mary Lee Townsend – Was not present during this vote;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Bill Andoe – Aye;

Barbara Smallwood – Was not present during this vote; &

Chip Ard – Aye;

The motion was **Approved by Majority to Deny** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Denied Part IV of St. John Health System's proposal based on Section VIII A, Windows and Doors, A.1.2.1, & A.1.2.2 for

Guidelines for Rehabilitation of Existing Residential Buildings in the Yorktown Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #6-I of Darla Holland's proposal at 1552 E. 17th Place in Swan Lake.

- 6-I) 1552 E. 17th Place, Tulsa, OK 74120 (Swan Lake)
Applicant: Darla Holland – RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS
Request: Part I of II: Propose to replace existing 1/1 windows (inset only) with new energy efficient 1/1 windows in like material and style; & remove storm windows;
Subcommittee Complete Application Date: May 9, 2006**

Mr. Fox presented Part I of II Parts of Darla Holland's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in Swan Lake.

Mr. Fox stated that Ms. Holland plans to replace the existing 1/1 inset windows only with new energy efficient 1/1 windows in like material and style; & remove the storm windows.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation(s) on Part I of Ms. Holland's proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee found Part I of Ms. Holland's application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote at the May 9, 2006 meeting to approve Part I of this application under the following conditions:

- ◇ That the screens are on the lower sashes of the windows.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of Part I of Ms. Holland's proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Rehabilitation in the Swan Lake district; and that he would like to move for an approval. Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for discussion. Hearing none, he asked Ms. Warrior to call roll.

Roll Call Vote to approve Part I of Ms. Holland's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;
Secretary O'Neal – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore - Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Was not present during this vote;

Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Barbara Smallwood – Was not present during this vote; &
Chip Ard – Aye;
The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

*The Tulsa Preservation Commission **Approved Part I of Ms. Holland’s proposal** based on Section VIII A, Windows and Doors, A.1.2.3, A.1.2.4 & A.1.2.7 for Guidelines for Rehabilitation of Existing Buildings in the Swan Lake District.*

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #6-II of Darla Holland’s proposal at 1552 E. 17th Place in Swan Lake.

6-II) 1552 E. 17th, Tulsa, OK 74120 (Swan Lake)
Applicant: Darla Holland – RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL W/CONDITIONS
Part II of II: Propose to add 5’ X 12’ patio to match existing (front patio).
Subcommittee Complete Application Date: May 9, 2006

Mr. Fox presented Part II of II Parts of Darla Holland’s Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in Swan Lake.

Mr. Fox stated that Ms. Holland plans to add a 5’ X 12’ patio to match the existing front patio.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed to please announce the COA Subcommittee’s recommendation(s) on Part II of Ms. Holland’s proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the COA Subcommittee found Part II of Ms. Holland’s application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended by a unanimous vote at the May 9, 2006 meeting to approve Part II of this application under the following conditions:

- ◇ That the patio is added without the trellis.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee’s decision to recommend approval of Part II of Ms. Holland’s proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Additions in the Swan Lake district; and that he would like to move for an approval. Secretary O’Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner opened the floor to the commission for discussion. Hearing none, he asked Ms. Warrior to call roll.

Roll Call Vote to approve Part II of Ms. Holland's application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;
Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;
Secretary O'Neal – Aye;
Herb Fritz – Aye;
Charles Gilmore - Aye;
Mary Lee Townsend – Was not present during this vote;
Rex Ball – Aye;
Bill Andoe – Aye;
Barbara Smallwood – Was not present during this vote; &
Chip Ard – Aye;

The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission Approved Part II of Ms. Holland's proposal based on Section VIII B, General Requirements, B.1.0.2, and Porches, Decks and Patios, B.1.4.1 for Guidelines for Additions to Existing Structures in the Swan Lake District.

The Commission has lost its regular and professional quorum at this time of having an attendance of only six members present at this Regular TPC meeting.

B. Program Planning & Outreach Committee Report

- 4. New Business**
- 5. Chair Report**
- 6. Staff Report**
- 7. Absence Report**
- 8. Communications**
- 9. Adjournment**

There being no other business, Chairman Turner adjourned this meeting at 1:58 p.m. The Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Minutes of May 11, 2006 were transcribed by Fannie Warrior.

*K:/Planning/Fannie Warrior/MINS 05 11 2006R TPC
Minutes Approved by TPC on 06 08 2006*