

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF THE TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION (TPC)

Thursday, March 9, 2006, 11:00 A.M.
111 South Greenwood, 2nd Floor - Conference Rooms A&B
Tulsa, OK 74120-1820

Chairman Turner called the regular meeting to order at 11:05 a.m., and Mrs. Warrior announced the Roll Call.

1. ROLL CALL

Members Present:

Chairman, James Turner, Comm. Group Res.;
Vice-Chairman, David Breed, Comm. Group Res.;
Sec., & Prof., Landscape Designer, Breniss O'Neal;
Herb Fritz, Professional Architect;
Rex Ball, Community Group Resident;
Barbara Imel Smallwood, Community Group Resident;
Charles Gilmore, Professional Developer;
Owen "Chip" Ard – Planning Commissioner;
John Hamill, Professional TPS Representative; & Chuck Chastain, Professional Banker.

Members Absent:

Mary Lee Townsend, Professional Historian; Jack Hodgson, Professional Realtor; Michael B. Birkes, Arts Commissioner; Dusty Peck, Community Group Resident;

Others Present:

Amanda DeCort, Patrick Fox, Fannie Warrior, Kurt Ackermann, Patrick Keith & Bob LaBass

2. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES, Regular Meeting Minutes from February 9, 2006

Chairman Turner asked if there was a motion on the floor to approve the meeting minutes from last month.

Mr. Chastain made a motion to approve the Regular Meeting Minutes from February 9, 2006. Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Meeting Minutes from February 9, 2006:

Chairman Turner – Aye; Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye; Secretary O'Neal – Aye;

Chuck Chastain – Aye;

Herb Fritz – Was not present during this time;

Charles Gilmore - Aye;

Rex Ball – Was not present during this time;

Barbara Smallwood – Aye;

John Hamill - Aye; &

Chip Ard - Aye. The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

3. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

A. Historic Preservation Committee Report

i. Announcement of Conflict of Interest

Chairman Turner asked the commission if anyone had a Conflict of Interest with any of the Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) Requests that would be brought before the board for review. Members were instructed that the commissioner's name(s) would not be called when voting on the particular Certificate or Certificates of Appropriateness that he/she had a conflict of interest with.

Tulsa Public School Representative, John Hamill announced that he had a conflict of interest with proposal #1 at 1920 S. Cincinnati Avenue regarding Lee Elementary School.

ii. Applications for Certificate of Appropriateness

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #1-I, Bob LaBass' proposal at 1920 S. Cincinnati.

Mr. Hamill left the meeting room due to having a conflict of interest with COA agenda item #1-I, II, & III, Bob LaBass' proposal at 1920 S. Cincinnati.

1-I) <u>1920 S. Cincinnati</u>, Tulsa, OK 74119 (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Bob LaBass – Approved

Request: <u>Part I of III</u>: Propose to install a new covered entry element at the existing entry to the school office area with a handicapped ramp in the front;

Subcommittee Complete Application Date: March 7, 2006

Mr. Fox presented Part I of Mr. LaBass' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the c. 1920 historic building/school in North Maple Ridge.

Mr. Fox stated that Mr. LaBass is representing Lee Elementary School on this proposal. He plans to install a new covered entry element at the existing entry way to the school office area with a handicapped ramp in the front. Mr. Fox stated that according to the design guidelines under Additions that it states that the new addition should maintain and not detract from the appearance and character defining elements of the existing structure, their scale and proportions. He stated that the new covered entryway will be the primary area where kids will be dropped off and picked up everyday at school off of Cincinnati Avenue. Mr. Fox stated that most of the elements for the entry way are historic materials; and that they will be replacing the front school doors with metal doors.

Mr. Hamill stated that speaking on behalf of Tulsa Public Schools that he is very proud of the work that Mr. LaBass and his group have done; and that the League Foundation was very supportive of this project.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. LaBass if he had anything to add. Mr. LaBass stated that he has been working very closely with the Lee Foundation, the school faculty and PTA members of Lee Elementary; and that their main desires were to have an entrance to the school where parents will know where to drop off and pick up their children before and after school. Mr. LaBass stated that all of the elements from the entryway are historic materials that were preserved from Eugene Fields Elementary School.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed if he would announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation on Part I of this proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed announced that the COA Subcommittee found Part I of Mr. LaBass' application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended a unanimous vote at the March 7, 2006 meeting to approve Part I of Mr. LaBass' application.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval on Part I of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Additions in the North Maple Ridge District.

Vice-Chairman Breed made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendation to approve; and Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner asked the commission if there were further discussion on Part I of this application. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Part I of Mr. LaBass' application:

Chairman Turner – Aye; Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye; Secretary O'Neal – Aye; Chuck Chastain – Aye; Herb Fritz – Aye; Charles Gilmore - Aye; Rex Ball – Aye; Barbara Smallwood – Aye; John Hamill – Was not present during this vote; & Chip Ard – Aye. The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Part I of Mr. LaBass' proposal</u> based on Section VIIIB, General Requirements, B1.0.1 through B1.0.5; Building Site, B1.1.1, Building Materials and Elements, B1.2.1 & B1.2.2; and from Porches, B1.4.1 & B1.4.2 for Guidelines for Additions to Existing Structures in the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #1-II, Bob LaBass' proposal at 1920 S. Cincinnati.

1-II) <u>1920 S. Cincinnati</u>, Tulsa, OK 74119 (N. Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Bob LaBass - Approved

Part II of III: Propose to install four (4) new classrooms and a

handicapped ramp to adjacent exterior door;

Subcommittee Complete Application Date: March 7, 2006

Mr. Fox presented Part II of Mr. LaBass' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic school in North Maple Ridge.

Mr. Fox stated that Mr. LaBass plans to install four (4) new classrooms and a handicapped ramp to adjacent exterior door of the school. He stated that Lee Elementary has two (2) outside buildings in the rear of the structure made of metal and brick that will be removed in place of the new classrooms. Mr. Fox stated that the four (4) new classrooms will match the existing; and that the brick and the band across the center portion of the new addition will match the existing also. Mr. Fox stated that he believes since the ramp isn't visible from the street that the ramp shouldn't be discussed.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. LaBass if he had anything to add. Mr. LaBass stated that they believed having to design to build the (4) four new rooms for the new addition is better than having the two outside buildings for classrooms. He stated that the students will no longer have to go outside anymore to get to their classrooms. Mr. LaBass added that the windows will match the other windows in height with the same mullion patterns.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed if he would announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation on Part II of this proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed announced that the COA Subcommittee found Part II of Mr. LaBass' application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended a unanimous vote at the March 7, 2006 meeting to approve Part II of Mr. LaBass' application.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval on Part II of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Additions in the North Maple Ridge District.

Vice-Chairman Breed made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendation to approve; and Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner asked the commission if there were further discussion on Part II of this application. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Part II of Mr. LaBass' application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Secretary O'Neal – Aye;

Chuck Chastain – Aye;

Herb Fritz – Aye;

Charles Gilmore - Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Barbara Smallwood – Aye;

John Hamill – Was not present during this vote; &

Chip Ard - Aye. The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Part II of Mr. LaBass' proposal</u> based on Section VIIIB, Building Materials and Elements, B1.2.1 & B1.2.2; and from Porches, B1.4.2 for Guidelines for Additions to Existing Structures in the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #1-III, Bob LaBass' proposal at 1920 S. Cincinnati.

1-III) 1920 S. Cincinnati, Tulsa, OK 74119 (N. Maple Ridge)
Applicant: Bob LaBass - Approved
Part III of III: Propose to expand existing parking area.
Subcommittee Complete Application Date: March 7,
2006

Mr. Fox presented Part III of Mr. LaBass' Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic school in North Maple Ridge.

Mr. Fox stated that Mr. LaBass plans to expand the school's parking lot area by doubling the number of parking spaces to a total of 48. He stated that school visitors will have access to and from off of 19th Street. Mr. Fox stated that in order for them to expand the parking area that they will have to remove the playground area and have it relocated elsewhere on the property.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. LaBass if he had anything to add. Mr. LaBass stated that they plan to tear up the existing parking lot area and build a new expanded parking area that will accommodate 48 parking spaces.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed if he would announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation on Part II of this proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed announced that the COA Subcommittee found Part II of Mr. LaBass' application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended a unanimous vote at the March 7, 2006 meeting to approve Part II of Mr. LaBass' application.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval on Part III of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Additions in the North Maple Ridge District.

Vice-Chairman Breed made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendation to approve; and Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner asked the commission if there were further discussion on Part III of this application. Hearing none, he asked Mrs. Warrior to please call roll.

Roll Call Vote to Approve Part III of Mr. LaBass' application:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Secretary O'Neal – Aye;

Chuck Chastain – Aye;

Herb Fritz – Aye;

Charles Gilmore - Aye;

Rex Ball - Aye;

Barbara Smallwood – Aye;

John Hamill – Was not present during this vote; &

Chip Ard - Aye. The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Part III of Mr. LaBass' proposal</u> based on Section VIIIB, Building Site, B1.1.2 for Guidelines for Additions to Existing Structures in the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

Chairman Turner asked Mr. Fox to please give his presentation on COA agenda item #2, Sabrina & Paul Kane's proposal at 1214 E. 17th Place.

2. <u>1214 E. 17th Place</u>, Tulsa, OK 74120 (N. Maple Ridge) Applicants: <u>Sabrina & Paul Kane – Approved with</u> Conditions

Request: Propose to add windows to the East & West gables of the structure.

Subcommittee Complete Application Date: Mar. 7, 2006

Mr. Fox presented Sabrina & Paul Kane's Certificate of Appropriateness application to the commission. Photographs and drawings were available for review and a slide presentation was shown of the historic structure in North Maple Ridge.

Mr. Fox stated that the Kanes plan to add windows to the East and West Gables of the structure; and that neither Mr. or Mrs. Kane were able to attend the meeting. He stated that they're planning to turn their attic into a living space area; and that there has to be egress up there.

Mr. Fox stated that the Kanes are proposing to install one (1) code compliant and two (2) small fixed windows on the attic wall area. He stated that they are going to remove the garage window from the garage; and have it installed on the west wall of the gable and will maintain all the trims and proportions.

Mr. Fox stated that on the front elevation of the house that there are two (2) more windows that the Kanes are proposing. He stated that where the attic vent/chimney is located now that they plan to install two (2) 18"X24" custom made wood windows on both sides of the chimney. Mr. Fox stated that these custom made wood windows will match the windows that the Kanes have on their house now with raised mullions.

Chairman Turner asked Vice-Chairman Breed if he would announce the COA Subcommittee's recommendation on the Kanes' proposal.

Vice-Chairman Breed announced that the COA Subcommittee found that the Kanes' application to be complete. He stated that the subcommittee recommended a unanimous vote at the March 7, 2006 meeting to approve this application under the following conditions:

♦ That the single window be placed at the middle of the gable.

Vice-Chairman Breed stated that the Subcommittee's decision to recommend approval of this proposal was based on the appropriate design guidelines for Additions in the North Maple Ridge District.

Vice-Chairman Breed made a motion to support the COA Subcommittee's recommendation to approve the Kane's application; and Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Chairman Turner asked the commission if there were further discussion on this application. Some of the commission members believed that they should discuss this matter further. They believe that the condition should be more detailed.

After discussing this matter further, Mr. Breed made a motion to approve the Kane's application under the following conditions:

♦ That the single west gable window be placed at the middle of the gable; and that they can use the existing window that they have; or a new replacement window that meets the size requirement of the building code.

Secretary O'Neal seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve the Kane's application with conditions:

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Secretary O'Neal – Aye;

Chuck Chastain – Aye;

Herb Fritz – Aye;

Charles Gilmore - Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Barbara Smallwood – Aye;

John Hamill – Was not present during this vote; &

Chip Ard - Aye. The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

The Tulsa Preservation Commission <u>Approved Sabrina & Paul Kane's proposal</u> based on Section VIIIB, General Requirements, B1.0.1 & B1.0.2; and Building Materials and Elements, B1.2.1 and B1.2.2 for Guidelines for Additions to Existing Structures in the North Maple Ridge Historic District.

4. New Business

B. Rules and Regulations Committee: Distribution and second reading of amended Rules and Regulations

Chairman Turner stated that the commission briefly reviewed the first reading of the amended Rules and Regulations at our last meeting; and that he would like the Rules and Regulations Committee, Chairman Gilmore to update us on the second reading that had been distributed.

Mr. Gilmore stated that after the TPC Rules & Regulations Committee reviewed and considered the comments made by some of the neighborhood residents from the first reading of the amended Rules & Regulations Procedures that the committee agreed to modify Article VI, Section 3B.

Mr. Gilmore stated that the neighborhood residents believed that after they had read the first reading of Article VI, Section 3B that the commission had the authority to vote and make the final approval on who the neighborhood association had nominated to serve on the subcommittee. Mr. Gilmore stated that that was not the commission's intent to approve or disapprove of a person that had been nominated already by the neighborhood association.

Mr. Gilmore verbally read the modified section of Article VI, Section 3B that states: Neighborhood associations located within Historic Preservation Overlay Zoning may

designate a neighborhood resident to serve as a member of the COA Subcommittee. Nominations shall be made in writing, signed by the association president and submitted to the Preservation Commission for confirmation on or before December 1st of each year. Nominations will be placed on the Preservation Commission agenda for the next available meeting. A neighborhood representative shall serve, or have served, on the COA Subcommittee no more than three annual terms which may be extended by a vote of the Preservation Commission. Partial year service by a neighborhood representative prior to the December 1st nominating date shall not be counted towards the three year overall term limitation.

Mr. Gilmore stated that there were no other comments made by the neighborhood residents (that he was aware of) about any of the other sections on the first reading of the Rules and Regulations Procedures.

Chairman Turner asked if the neighborhood residents were aware that the second reading of the amended Rules and Regulations Procedure were going to be voted on today. One of the members responded by stating that the neighborhood residents were aware that the second reading would be voted on today. Chairman Turner asked if there were any further discussion on this subject; and no one responded.

Mr. Gilmore made a motion to approve the amended Rules and Regulations Governing Procedure of the Tulsa Preservation Commission (Sec. 1052.H) dated March 9, 2006. Mr. Ball seconded.

Roll Call Vote to Approve the amended Rules and Regulations Governing Procedure of the Tulsa Preservation Commission (Sec. 1052.H):

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Secretary O'Neal – Aye;

Chuck Chastain – Aye;

Herb Fritz – Aye;

Charles Gilmore - Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Barbara Smallwood – Aye;

John Hamill – Was not present during this vote; &

Chip Ard - Aye. The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

Mr. Gilmore thanked Kurt Ackermann for an outstanding job for working with the committee on modifying the amended Rules and Regulations Procedure of the Tulsa Preservation Commission. The Commission applauded Mr. Ackermann for his great efforts.

Mr. Hamill returned to the meeting room.

C. Program Planning & Neighborhood Conservation Committee: Meeting reminder and update of activities

Mr. Ball stated that he had an opportunity to talk to Brenda Miller, Pat Treadway, the Mayor and Karen Keith about broadcasting our TPC meetings. He stated that they all concurred that they would be in support of having the meetings broadcasted. He stated that the broadcasting request is on the Committee's agenda this afternoon for them to consider.

Mr. Ball stated that the committee also talked about the historic publications; and how they can get the literature republished. He stated that he met with Ms. Suzanne Stewart at the Chamber of Commerce; and she is interest in a full line of publications that are from the Foundation for Agricultural of National Trust, the Centennial Committee and from the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Mr. Ball stated that Ms. Stewart informed him that she has some budget/funds for republishing the literature. Mr. Ball stated that this was a very positive step; and that Ms. Stewart was interested in attending some of our meetings.

Mr. Ball stated that he talked to Marilyn Inhofe-Tucker who put out the original Walking Tour for the City of Tulsa. He stated that she's getting ready to republish and update the National Trust Meeting to the American Institute of Architects (AIA) Regional Conference which is next year. Mr. Ball stated that Ms. Inhofe-Tucker would like to get some input from the TPC regarding the matter.

5. Chair Report

Chairman Turner announced that the Executive Committee met on Tuesday, March 7, 2006 to review the CORE Committee Recommendations. He stated that the Executive Committee has decided that they want to take the CORE Committee Recommendations and word them in such a way to polish them up; and by adding some things to them to go to the right people. Chairman Turner stated that they're going to bring the recommendations back to the Commission for approval; and then send them out possibly in different ways to different people. He stated that he and Ms. DeCort were going to work on getting a revised list based on the recommendations that they are going to take some action on.

6. Staff Report

Ms. DeCort reported that she has a couple of responses to the application for a consultant for the Riverview nomination. She stated that she has received two (2) responses; and that staff would like to recommend to the TPC to consider Consultant, Cynthia Savage to prepare the Riverview Survey project. Ms. DeCort stated that Ms. Savage provided them with a very nice proposal and a detailed expense sheet. She stated that Ms. Savage's proposal that includes all the expenses is \$15, 982. Ms. DeCort stated that the other consultant's response that they had received was a much higher amount; and that Ms. Savage's amount was within the budget.

Mr. Ball made a motion to consider Consultant, Cynthia Savage for the Riverview Survey project. Vice-Chairman Breed seconded.

Roll Call Vote to consider Consultant, Cynthia Savage for the Riverview Survey project.

Chairman Turner – Aye;

Vice-Chairman Breed – Aye;

Secretary O'Neal – Aye;

Chuck Chastain – Aye;

Herb Fritz – Aye;

Charles Gilmore - Aye;

Rex Ball – Aye;

Barbara Smallwood – Aye;

John Hamill – Aye; &

Chip Ard - Aye. The motion was **Approved Unanimously** by members present and voting.

7. Absence Report

There were no Absences reported.

8. New Business

No New Business.

9. Communications

No Communications.

10. ADJOURNMENT

There being no other business, Chairman Turner adjourned the meeting at 1:56 p.m. The Tulsa Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Minutes of March 9, 2006 were transcribed by Fannie Warrior.

K:/Planning/Fannie Warrior/MINS 03 09 2006R TPC Minutes Approved by TPC on 04 13 2006