



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, July 12, 2018, 11:00 A.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - South Conference Room

- A. Opening Matters
1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Acting as Chairman, Commissioner Schoell called the Regular Meeting to order at 11:03 A.M.

Members Present

David Schoell, Vice-Chair*
Peter Grant, Secretary
Chris Bumgarner
Joy Jones
Susan McKee
Robert Shears
Jim Turner

Members Absent

Ted Reeds, Chair
Holly Becker
David Pounds
Mary Lee Townsend

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Audrey Blank

Others Present

Pam and Don Crandall, Donna Danner, Stefanie Sinclair, David Baugus, Aaron Sprik

*Departed at 12:21 P.M.

2. Approval of Minutes – June 14, 2018
Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Shears and approved unanimously.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, June 14, 2018

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Becker
2. Grant			Pounds
3. Bumgarner			Reeds
4. Jones			Townsend
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Turner			

3. Approval of Minutes – June 26, 2018
Commissioner McKee made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Shears and approved unanimously.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, June 26, 2018

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Becker
2. Grant			Pounds
3. Bumgarner			Reeds
4. Jones			Townsend
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Turner			

4. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. **HP-0018-2018 / 2140 E. 18th St.** (Yorktown)
Applicant: Pamela H. Crandall
Proposal:
 1. Construction of screened-in porch

Staff presented its report, noting that the project involved enclosure of the porch and installation of two doors for access. The applicant was present and added that the cedar frame would be painted or stained. Commissioner Schoell commented that the construction was reversible, and the applicant agreed that the screen could be removed. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the design of the enclosure, and Commissioner Turner inquired about the location of the doors. The applicant responded that the doors would be installed to the east of the front door and on the side of the porch and would have frames thirty-six inches (36")

wide. Commissioner Turner directed attention to Guideline B.5.2 and added that the guidelines did not inform the applicant *how* to design the enclosure. Commissioner Bumgarner requested an illustration of the appearance of the porch after the enclosure and installation of the doors. The applicant commented that a panel eighteen inches (18") in height would be placed at the bottom of the screen and the bottom of the doors to provide security. Commissioner Schoell noted the importance of a visual representation of the project and added that the Contractor could supply the necessary documentation. Commissioner Grant emphasized the necessity of dimensions and encouraged the presentation of a sketch showing the frames of the doors with notes to indicate dimensions.

As there was no further discussion and as the applicant agreed to continue the review on August 9, Commissioner Schoell made a motion to continue the review. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

Vote: HP-0018-2018 / 2140 E. 18th St. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Becker
2. Grant			Pounds
3. Bumgarner			Reeds
4. Jones			Townsend
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Turner			

2. **HP-0019-2018 / 1156 N. Denver Ave.** (Brady Heights)

Applicant: Stefanie S. Sinclair

Proposal:

1. Replacement of fence in street yard

Work started without an Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant had responded promptly upon notification of the requirement for an Historic Preservation Permit. The applicant offered an apology for the lack of compliance, assured the members of the Tulsa Preservation Commission of readiness to comply with the Unified Design Guidelines, and commented that concern about the security of the premises was a motive for the proposal for the replacement of the fence. The fence would be constructed with metal poles and cedar planks arranged horizontally and would be six feet and eight inches (6'-8") in height on the east side of the site and between seven feet (7'-0") and eight feet (8'-0") in height elsewhere on the site. After Commissioner Turner inquired about the placement of the fence, the applicant and several commissioners viewed images from Google Maps to confirm that the fence would extend southward from the column located at the southeastern corner of the porte cochère to the southern boundary and then westward to the western boundary. Ms. Danner, a neighbor of the applicant, endorsed the proposal for the construction of the fence, commenting that the fence would improve the value of the property.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Grant made a motion to approve the application. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Turner and approved unanimously.

Vote: HP-0019-2018 / 1156 N. Denver Ave. (**Brady Heights**)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Becker
2. Grant			Pounds
3. Bumgarner			Reeds
4. Jones			Townsend
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Turner			

3. **HP-0011-2018 / 2203 E. 17th Pl.** (Yorktown)

Applicant: Biltmore Homes

Proposal:

1. Construction of new residence

Staff presented its report, noting that the applicant had responded to the recommendations offered during the previous Regular Meeting of the Tulsa Preservation Commission. Commissioner Turner commented on the position of the sills, noting that lower sills were acceptable on the windows on the porch but not on the windows in the bedroom, whose double-hung windows should have higher sills to address the character of the neighborhood. Commissioner Turner then inquired about the dimensions of the eaves and was informed that the eaves were twenty-four inches (24"). In response to an inquiry about the representation of the beam above the porch, the applicant indicated that the beam was recessed to accommodate the extension of the rafters. Commissioner Turner expressed his preference for the visible presentation of the beam and recommended a shift in the plane of the roof to which the applicant agreed. Commissioner Turner next inquired about the treatment of the brackets, and the applicant responded that his clients had not decided whether to paint the brackets. Commissioner Turner recommended treatment of the corner of the bracket with a chamfer.

Discussion then focused on the treatment of other materials. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the dimensions of the masonry and was informed that the King Size Brick had been selected as it had been approved for construction elsewhere in Barnard Trace. No decision about the application of paint on the masonry has been reached by the clients. Commissioner Shears inquired whether the soffit could be eliminated, and the applicant responded that the clients would be consulted. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the indication of rough sawn fir on the columns, and the applicant indicated his readiness to substitute wood with a smooth surface on the columns. Commissioner Schoell then inquired about the inspiration for the design and was informed that, although no particular reference had been selected, the clients' preference for the Craftsman Style Bungalow had provided direction for the

development of the design. Commissioner McKee inquired about the depth of the muntins on the windows and was informed that the simulated-divided-light windows would have muntins with a 7/8" profile. Commissioner Schoell commented that the vinyl windows lacked the visual character of wooden windows. Commissioner Grant inquired about the selection of the grilles and was informed that bars would not be installed on the interior of the windows. Commissioner Schoell encouraged the placement of muntins on the interior and exterior of the windows. Commissioner McKee inquired whether the sills of the windows on the bedroom could be higher, and the applicant commented that the clients would probably not object to the adjustment of the height.

As discussion concluded, Commissioner McKee made a motion to continue the review of the application with the applicant's permission. As the applicant agreed to continuation of the review, the motion was seconded by Commissioner Bumgarner and approved unanimously. Commissioner Turner recommended these revisions— (1) a smooth surface on the columns, (2) the visible representation of the beam above the porch, (3) the adjustment of the sills of the windows in the bedroom to be higher than those on the windows on the porch, (4) the placement of exterior muntins on the windows, (5) a four-inch (4") space between the spindles on the rail, (6) the presentation of the rafter tails, rather than creation of a soffit, and (7) a chamfer on the corner of the bracket.

Vote: HP-0011-2018 / 2203 E. 17th Pl. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Becker
2. Grant			Pounds
3. Bumgarner			Reeds
4. Jones			Townsend
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Turner			

4. Selection of Awards

On behalf of the Outreach Committee, Commissioner Turner presented the projects approved in 2016 and 2017, which had been selected for awards. The categories and recipients included

2016

- New Construction – 1st Place – 2336 E. 17th St.
- New Construction – Honorable Mention – 1804 S. Quaker Ave.
- Porch – 1st Place – 1401 E. 17th St.
- Porch – Honorable Mention – 1705 S. Cincinnati Pl.
- Porch – Honorable Mention – 716 N. Cheyenne Ave.
- Landscape Feature – 1st Place – 1414 S. Galveston Ave.
- Windows and Doors – 1st Place – 1716 S. Quaker Ave.
- Windows and Doors – Honorable Mention – 1109 N. Cheyenne Ave.
- Paving – 1st Place – 1316 E. 19th St.

2017

- New Construction – 1st Place – 2128 E. 19th St.
- Porch – 1st Place – 1716 S. Quaker Ave.
- Porch – Honorable Mention – 1524 E. 20th St.
- Porch – Honorable Mention – 1623 S. Quincy Ave.
- Landscape Feature – 1st Place – 901 N. Denver Ave.
- Landscape Feature – Honorable Mention – 1827 E. 17th Pl.
- Landscape Feature – Honorable Mention – 1527 S. St. Louis Ave.
- Windows and Doors – 1st Place – 1531 S. Madison Ave.
- Windows and Doors – Honorable Mention – 205 W. King St.
- Special Recognition – Window Restoration and Weatherization Boot Camp – 1536 E. 20th St.

Commissioner Schoell made a motion to approve the selections. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

Vote: Selection of Awards

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Schoell			Becker
2. Grant			Pounds
3. Bumgarner			Reeds
4. Jones			Townsend
5. McKee			
6. Shears			
7. Turner			

C. Reports

- 1. Chair Report
None
- 2. Staff Report
None

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Public Comment

None

G. Adjournment

Acting as Chairman, Commissioner Shears adjourned the Regular Meeting at 12:22 P.M.