



TULSA PRESERVATION COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, April 24, 2018, 4:30 P.M.

City Hall @ One Technology Center, 175 East 2nd Street
10th Floor - North Conference Room

- A. Opening Matters
1. Call to Order and Verification of Quorum

Chairman Reeds called the Regular Meeting to order at 4:33 P.M.

Members Present

Ted Reeds, Chair
David Schoell, Vice-Chair
Peter Grant, Secretary
Susan McKee
David Pounds
Robert Shears
Mary Lee Townsend
Jim Turner

Members Absent

Chris Bumgarner

Staff Present

Jed Porter, Addison Spradlin, Bob Edmiston

Others Present

Bill Powers, John Acton, Brian Sellers

2. Approval of Minutes from April 12, 2018
Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the Minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved by majority.

Vote: Meeting Minutes, April 12, 2018

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds		Schoell	Bumgarner
2. Grant		Pounds	
3. McKee		Shears	
4. Townsend			
5. Turner			

3. Disclosure of Conflicts of Interest
No Conflicts of Interest were disclosed.

B. Actionable Items

1. HP-18-024 / 1565 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

Applicant: Alfredo Madrid

Proposal:

1. Replacement of columns

Work completed without an Historic Preservation Permit

Staff presented its report, noting that the panel on the base of the column had been removed since the review by the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee. Commissioner Townsend presented the report on behalf of the subcommittee, noting that the application had been forwarded with a recommendation for approval. Several commissioners commented on elements of the column and observed that the capital often displayed two pieces of trim.

As there was no further discussion, Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the application with the condition that 1x1 trim or 1x2 trim be added to the capitals. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

Vote: HP-18-024 / 1565 S. Yorktown Ave. (Yorktown)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Bumgarner
2. Schoell			
3. Grant			
4. McKee			
5. Pounds			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

2. **HP-18-027 / 1539 S. Detroit Ave.** (North Maple Ridge)

Applicant: Powers Design and Build

Proposals:

1. Replacement of metal and vinyl windows with wooden windows
2. Alteration of width of window in kitchen
3. Replacement of columns on side porch
4. Replacement of door on side porch
5. Installation of beadboard ceiling on side porch

Staff presented its report, and afterwards the applicant commented that the objective was the restoration of the residence to its original appearance. According to the applicant, the metal and vinyl windows were installed nearly forty years ago and the side porch is not an original element. Because the side porch provides shelter for the entry from the driveway, it will be retained, but its columns will be replaced with columns to match those on the front porch, and a beadboard ceiling will be installed to cover the joists in the ceiling.

Discussion focused primarily on the treatment of the porch and the windows. Commissioner Turner inquired whether the gutters on the side porch posed a challenge, and the applicant responded that improvement of the porch posed a challenge, but, as the roof was recently installed, the roof would not be modified. Commissioner Grant inquired about the edge of the porch and was informed that the open edge of the beam would be covered to match the beam on the front porch. Commissioner Turner inquired about the height of the new columns and was informed that they would match the height of the existing columns. Commissioner Reeds inquired whether brackets had been present and was informed that some styles lacked brackets. Commissioner Turner inquired whether these columns would have a taper and was informed that the shafts would be straight. Commissioner Shears inquired about the dimension of the beadboard and was informed that the beadboard would have a dimension of 5/8". The storm door on the side porch will be removed prior to the installation of the new door.

Discussion continued with consideration of the proposal for replacement of the windows. Commissioner Schoell inquired about the selection for replacement and was informed that this window had been approved for installation elsewhere in the district. Commissioner Schoell then inquired about the configuration of the panes and the necessity for additional trim and was informed that the windows would be have one-over-one (1/1) configuration and that some additional trim would be added. Commissioner Turner inquired about the finish on the sash and was informed that the surface would be primed. Commissioner Schoell observed that the depth of shadow and the profile were better than those features on most windows.

As the discussion concluded, Commissioner Townsend inquired about removal of the siding and was informed that only Masonite Siding would be removed. Several commissioners encouraged duplication of elements on the front porch and expressed a preference to review and approve the proposals separately.

HP-18-027 / 1539 S. Detroit Ave. (North Maple Ridge)

Replacement of metal and vinyl windows with wooden windows

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the proposal. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Reeds and approved unanimously.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Bumgarner
2. Schoell			
3. Grant			
4. McKee			
5. Pounds			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

Alteration of width of window in kitchen

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the proposal. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Townsend and approved unanimously.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Bumgarner
2. Schoell			
3. Grant			
4. McKee			
5. Pounds			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

Replacement of columns on side porch

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the proposal. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Bumgarner
2. Schoell			
3. Grant			
4. McKee			
5. Pounds			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

Replacement of door on side porch

Commissioner Townsend made a motion to approve the proposal. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Bumgarner
2. Schoell			
3. Grant			
4. McKee			
5. Pounds			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

Installation of beadboard ceiling on side porch

Commissioner Turner made a motion to approve the proposal. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Bumgarner
2. Schoell			
3. Grant			
4. McKee			
5. Pounds			
6. Shears			
7. Townsend			
8. Turner			

3. **HP-18-028 / 225 E. 18th St. (North Maple Ridge)**

Applicant: John Acton

Proposal: Replacement of windows with aluminum windows

Staff presented its report, and afterwards the applicant commented that the objective was the improvement of thermal efficiency. The residence displays a variety of windows, including aluminum windows with simulated divided lights. Commissioner Schoell noted that restoration of the original appearance should be an objective as well and inquired whether the applicant's objective was the installation of windows with a six-over-six (6/6) configuration. The applicant responded that existing trim and frames would be repaired and retained. Commissioner Schoell expressed concern about the alteration of the character of the residence, especially with the installation of windows which lack the features of historic windows, such as the profiles and the depth of shadow. Commissioner Reeds inquired whether other sources for windows had been considered. Commissioner Townsend noted the importance of simulated-divided-lights, and Commissioner Reeds noted the measurements of 3/8" for a putty profile and 5/8" for the width of the muntin. Commissioner Grant commented that a one-over-one (1/1) configuration would be an appropriate, as well as a less expensive, solution. Several commissioners concurred, and the applicant indicated his readiness to install windows with that configuration.

After additional comments about the differences between historic windows and replacement windows, the referral of the application to the Historic Preservation Permit Subcommittee for its assistance was proposed. The applicant requested the extension of the period of review, and Commissioner Townsend made the motion to grant the extension. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McKee and approved unanimously.

Vote: HP-18-028 / 225 E. 18th St. (North Maple Ridge)

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Bumgarner
2. Schoell			Pounds
3. Grant			
4. McKee			
5. Shears			
6. Townsend			
7. Turner			

4. Installation of Video Doorbells in North Maple Ridge Historic Preservation Overlay District

Staff presented its report, noting that, in the previous Regular Meeting, this item had been presented for discussion only. Commissioner Turner commented that installation of a video doorbell was like the installation of a mailbox—a reversible procedure. Staff indicated that the installation would not constitute a violation of the Unified Design Guidelines and was directed to inform the president of the Maple Ridge Neighborhood Association about approval of the installation with the conditions that the size of the video doorbell should be restricted, the surface of the historic fabric should be as undisturbed as possible by the installation, and the previously installed doorbell should be retained.

Vote: Installation of Video Doorbells in North Maple Ridge Historic Preservation Overlay District

<u>In Favor</u>	<u>Opposed</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
1. Reeds			Bumgarner
2. Schoell			Pounds
3. Grant			
4. McKee			
5. Shears			
6. Townsend			
7. Turner			

C. Reports

1. Chair Report
None
2. Staff Report
None

D. New Business

None

E. Announcements and Future Agenda Items

None

F. Public Comment

None

G. Adjournment

Chairman Reeds adjourned the Regular Meeting at 6:10 P.M.